

AGENDA # 9

City of Madison, Wisconsin

| | |
|--|---|
| REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION | PRESENTED: August 5, 2009 |
| TITLE: 668 State Street – PUD-SIP to Add Four Stories to an Existing 2-Story Building for 20 New Apartment Units. 8 th Ald. Dist. (15512) | REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK: |
| AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary | ADOPTED: POF: |
| DATED: August 5, 2009 | ID NUMBER: |

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Richard Wagner, John Harrington, Marsha Rummel, Dawn Weber, Richard Slayton, Todd Barnett, Jay Ferm, Ron Luskin and Mark Smith.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of August 5, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** on a PUD-SIP located at 668 State Street. Registered and appearing on behalf of the project was Jim Vincent. The project provides for the addition of four upper stories to a 2-story building that was recently rebuilt at 668 State Street. Vincent noted that the reconstruction of the existing 2-story building on the site provided for the necessary structural improvements that allow for the addition of the four story improvements as proposed. Vincent followed with a detailed review of the proposal, with the Commission noting the following:

- Need to provide context with private alley and all adjoining properties abutting the site on Lake, State and Langdon Streets.
- Resolve issue with 7-story penthouse not consistent with the requirements of Downtown Design Zone 1.
- Need to show entire site and 10-foot setback within the plan.
- Design not inspiring, a throwback to the 80's. Bring back other ideas for ways that the building could become more architectural and look for alternatives to block construction which features blank building corners, as well as resolve the issue with windows that appear pedestrian.
- Bring photos of existing façade and provide inspiration for the building above.
- Relevant to bike parking consider interior for winter storage.
- Work with symmetrical versus asymmetrical play with the State Street façade with alignment of window bays and balconies and resolve existing elevator issue on State Street including the use of faux windows.
- Need site plan that deals with Lake, State and Langdon Streets including adjacent buildings' context.
- The building appears to be a simple grid, a Rubik's Cube that will be resolved by more planning and detailing, need to see more.
- Simple is good, simplistic is not.
- Big block stair corners are unadorned mistakes.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 3, 4, 5 and 5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 668 State Street

| | Site Plan | Architecture | Landscape Plan | Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc. | Signs | Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular) | Urban Context | Overall Rating |
|-----------------------|-----------|--------------|----------------|--------------------------------|-------|-------------------------------------|---------------|----------------|
| Member Ratings | - | 5 | - | - | - | - | 6 | 5 |
| | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | 4 |
| | 6 | 3 | - | - | - | - | 3 | 3 |
| | - | 4 | - | - | - | 5 | 7 | 5 |
| | - | 4.5 | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |

General Comments:

- 4-6 stories seem more appropriate than 8-10 stories. Need site plan with Lake, State and Langdon Streets.
- Design does not rise to the level required for the Downtown Design District.
- Downtown Design Zone guidelines should be provided next time. Penthouse exceeds 6 stories. Architecture is underwhelming (Rubik’s Cube).
- Lacks personality – does it add to State Street – no.
- Building exterior needs to be architecturally current. Design is uninspired.