



**Project Name & Address:** 1047 Spaight Street

**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district

**Legistar File ID #** [62301](#)

**Prepared By:** Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

**Date Prepared:** September 29, 2020

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Justin Kane, Frey Construction

**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of a side porch.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

### Relevant State Statute Section:

**Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m.** In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

#### 41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
    - 1. Height.
    - 2. Landscape treatment.
    - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
  - (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
  - (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
  - (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
  - (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

## Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing side porch with materials in-kind, dimensions will be the same as existing. The house is a Claude & Stark-designed building in the American Foursquare form that was constructed in 1905.

The applicant's narrative describes that the work will effectively replace all materials to replicate the appearance of the existing. The existing porch roof is supported by large decorative brackets and the porch posts feature a box newel with a minimally decorative cap that is then topped by a smaller post. Neither of those features appear in the associated drawings. There appears to have been a stair railing previously, per ghosting in the paint on the newel post and the proposed railing matches the simple balusters on the porch railing.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

### **41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
  - (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
    - 1. The height of the replacement porch is in line with heights of other porches and replicates the existing.
    - 2. No proposed changes to landscaping treatments.
    - 3. No proposed changes to the rhythm of mass and spaces.
  - (b) N/A
  - (c) N/A
  - (d) The roof on the replacement porch will replicate the form and appearance of the existing porch.
  - (e) N/A

## Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness could be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Applicant submit updated drawings that show the location of the new gutter and downspout, the decorative roof brackets, and the decorative details on for the porch posts, all for staff approval