

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: December 16, 2009
TITLE: 3210 Maple Grove Drive – Mixed-Use Development/PUD-GDP. 7 th Ald. Dist. (11814)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: December 16, 2009	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Mark Smith, Dawn Weber, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, R. Richard Wagner and Jay Ferm.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of December 16, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD-GDP located at 3210 Maple Grove Drive. Appearing on behalf of the project were Paul Raisleger and Cliff Goodhart representing Livesey Company; Dan Walsh, Alex Weis, representing Mad Grove, LLC; and Bill Suick, representing D’Onofrio Kottke. The presentation of plan revisions by the development team emphasized the following:

- The project is a PUD-GDP that will provide for further detailing with individual SIPS of its various components featuring retail commercial at the corner and independent living facility downsized to 80 units in three stories as well as four residential apartment buildings along with a dry stormwater basin and bioretention area.
- The site plan features a single access point on McKee Road as well as Maple Grove Drive along with the extension on Madder Drive off of its westerly juncture with Stone Creek as a 2-way drive aisle.
- The plan features modifications to orient a building to the corner of McKee Road and Maple Grove Drive that an overall reduction in the number of buildings proposed.
- Pedestrian access points are provided at the corner and generally distributed around the site.

Staff noted that the handout details the provisions of the property’s Neighborhood Mixed-Use (NMU) as well as Transit-Oriented Development (TOD) provisions as it relates to the City of Madison Comprehensive Plan and proposed use of this site.

Discussions on the revised development proposal as it relates to the related provisions of the City of Madison in the Comprehensive Plan as noted:

- Issue with the development of single-use buildings versus mixed-use buildings as recommended under the Neighborhood Mixed-Use (NMU) designation in the Comprehensive Plan; where the Plan recommends 2-4 story buildings with the buildings to feature a combination of commercial and residential (mixed-use buildings). The provisions for Transit-Oriented Development (TOD) standards

note that mixed-use buildings with ground floor retail, office and commercial space and upper floor office and/or residential dwellings are strongly encouraged in TOD areas.

- Corner of building needs more street side entries both on Maple Grove Drive and McKee Road. Concern with the lack of main entry to street and emphasis of entries on the parking lot side of the building.
- Question the lack of pedestrian connections from new buildings, residential to existing to the west.

Following a motion by Wagner, seconded by Slayton for **FINAL APPROVAL**, the Commission noted the following:

- Restudy drive aisles accessibility as it relates to the detention by eliminating westerly drive and enhance center drive aisle and swap parking. The applicant noted issues with fire access.
- Want to see stormwater detention area design to more than an engineering feature. Needs more design.
- The surface parking design needs to provide tree islands at a 12-stall interval.
- Provide a loop path around the stormwater and bioretention areas.
- Need to provide secondary connections to street with clear table top crossing and colored pavement utilized including double islands to reinforce parking lot pedestrian pathways and crossings at midcorner.
- The amount of surface parking is too much, need to take a hard look to provide for shared parking opportunities; look at banking stalls and work at a level of providing parking at one stall to every 300 square feet.
- Encourage to look at retail at corner to have a second story for use as office space.
- Consider banking surface parking along main access drive to the west of the three residential apartment buildings abutting Maple Grove Drive due to a level of parking already provided within the buildings as well as the side surface parking lots.
- This site is required to address provisions Transit-Oriented Development. Parking levels may not be consistent with TOD provisions.

ACTION:

On a motion by Wagner, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (5-3) with Barnett, Rummel and Ferm voting no. The motion on **FINAL APPROVAL** on the GDP as proposed with the following:

- The address of pedestrian connectivity between the various development components of the overall GDP must be addressed at the SIP level to provide for provisions for connectivity of lands to the west.
- Look at alternative locations to flip surface parking to be immediately adjacent to the south side of the independent living facility.
- Provide walkways around the stormwater and bioretention areas including an aesthetically appealing design that goes beyond its functional use.
- Provide opportunities for the banking of parking with the various components of the project.
- Provide tree islands at 12 to 15 stall ratio.

The motion was passed on a vote of (5-3) with Rummel, Ferm, and Barnett voting no. Those voting in opposition noted the project's failure to comply with the provisions of the City of Madison Comprehensive Plan relevant to providing for mixed-use development as noted within the provisions for Neighborhood Mixed-Use (NMU) where the project provides for individual segregated uses in separate buildings on the site as well as the

failure to provide for the requirement in support of 2-4 stories development within both the provisions for the Neighborhood Mixed District as well as Transit-Oriented Development.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5.5, 6, 6, 6 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 3210 Maple Grove Drive

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	-	5	-	-	5	6	5
	6	-	-	-	-	6	6	6
	7	7	6	7	-	6	7	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	6	-	-	-	-	5	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5.5
	5	-	5	-	-	5	5	-
	6	-	6	4	-	4	5	6

General Comments:

- Bioretention basins need to have aesthetic appeal. Nice improvements.
- Nice changes, very good start to development.
- Much improved but significant concerns for parking count.
- Soften storm basins. Switch parking/drive aisle at south of Independent Living building.
- Interesting infill project but does not meet standard for TOD. Too much parking. Doesn't meet spirit of neighborhood plan which calls for multi-story mixed-use. Improved but still needs work.
- Good progress, but too many loose ends to warrant approval. Pedestrian pathways, auto traffic and parking banking should be further developed. Current plan fails to meet requirements of Comprehensive Plan to be mixed-use and 2-4 stories.