



Project Name/Address: 11 E Gilman Street

Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in historic district

Legistar File ID # [42249](#)

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: March 30, 2016

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Dan Seeley, Steve Brown Apartments

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations involving the replacement of windows in the Mansion Hill Historic District

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the Mansion Hill Historic District.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

41.22 MANSION HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (4) Standards for Review of Development in the Mansion Hill Historic District.
 - (1) Any new structure located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (a) Height
 - (b) Gross Volume
 - (c) In the street elevation(s) of a structure, the proportion of width to height in the facade(s).
 - (d) The proportions and relationships of width to height of the doors and windows in street facade(s).
 - (e) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the façade.
 - (2) All street facades shall blend with other structures via directional expression. When adjacent structures have a dominant vertical or horizontal expression, this expression should be carried over and reflected.
- (5) Reference to Plan. The requirements in this section derive from a plan entitled "The Mansion Hill Historic Preservation Plan and Development Handbook", City Planning Department, 1975.

Analysis and Conclusion

The Mansion Hill Historic Preservation plan does not have specific standards for the review of window replacement. The plan states, "In all matters regarding the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness the Landmarks Commission shall act to work in the best interests of the existing structures in the Historic District..." The plan also explains, "Further guidelines printed thereafter may be invoked in specific relevant instances at

the discretion of the Commission...” Guideline 8 reads, “The materials used in the final facade(s) should be visually compatible with the buildings and environment with which it is visually related.” Guideline 13 reads, “Architectural details should be incorporated as necessary to relate the new with the old and to preserve and enhance the inherent characteristics of the area.”

The submission materials indicate that the majority of the windows have been replaced previously.

Recommendation

Staff believes the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed exterior alteration related to window replacement are met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions of approval:

1. The original decorative gable windows shall be repaired or shall be replaced to exactly match the existing muntin configuration.
2. The muntins shall have a profile on the exterior plane of the glass that projects past the glass and does not have a “tape-like” appearance.