

AGENDA # 6

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: September 7, 2011

TITLE: 433 Cantwell Court, 434 South Thornton Avenue, 1526 Jenifer Street – PUD(GDP-SIP) to Rehabilitate Three Existing Four-Unit Buildings. 6th Ald. Dist. (23784)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: September 7, 2011

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett, Dawn O’Kroley, Melissa Huggins, Richard Slayton, Henry Lufler, Mark Smith and John Harrington.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of September 7, 2011, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 433 Cantwell Court, 434 South Thornton Avenue and 1526 Jenifer Street. Appearing and speaking in support was Jim Glueck, representing Common Wealth Development, Inc. Appearing in support and available to answer questions was Paul Jasensic, representing Common Wealth Development, Inc. Glueck stated that they are taking over this site from another developer and this is what they have to work with. The site currently contains three 4-unit existing buildings that are completely gutted and partially reframed. Replacement of windows and siding will maintain the general appearance in the neighborhood. Due to financial constraints they are asking for permission to use vinyl siding, although they are hoping for fiber cement. The proposal now welcomes you to the Jenifer Street side, trash is located in the back near the loading zone. Barnett suggested covering the existing siding but Glueck responded that it is mostly rotted. He also suggested not trying to duplicate the previous siding and to avoid using vinyl. Rummel seconded the opinion that vinyl should not be used on this project in this neighborhood. Smith stated that while he would prefer something other than vinyl, this project has been sitting dilapidated for quite some time and it should move forward. Huggins suggested addressing this from a policy standpoint in the future. Smith suggested using hardboard or fiber cement on the front facing areas of the buildings and vinyl siding on the backside as an option.

ACTION:

On a motion by Huggins, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (5-4) with Huggins, Slayton, Wagner, Lufler and Smith voting in favor; and O’Kroley, Barnett, Rummel and Harrington voting no. The motion provided for the use of vinyl including the option for the use hardboard or fiber cement as much as financially feasible.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 2, 5, 5, 6 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 433 Cantwell Court, 434 South Thornton Avenue, 1526 Jenifer Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	4	-
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	2
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	6	6	6	-	-	-	6	6
	5	5	-	-	-	-	6	6

General Comments:

- No vinyl siding. Hardiboard/cement preferred.
- Vinyl is disappointing.
- No vinyl please! Kudos for taking in this orphan project.