



Project Name/Address: 1124 Spaight Street
Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in an historic district
Legistar File ID # [34086](#)
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: James and Janice Muehlenberg
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in a historic district.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

33.19(11)(i) Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.

1. Alteration of any existing structure shall be evaluated according to all criteria listed in Sec. 33.19(11)(g).
2. Alteration of the surface material, pattern and texture in the facade(s) of any existing structures shall be compatible with the original or existing historical finishes.
3. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain or be compatible with the original or existing historical rhythm of masses and spaces.
4. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain the existing historical landscape plan or shall develop a new plan which is compatible with the plans of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
5. Alteration of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

33.19(11)(g) Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Commercial Use.

1. Alterations of the height of any existing structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
2. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical rhythm of solids and voids.
3. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
4. Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.

Analysis and Conclusion

The Applicant is requesting to repair the existing front porch. The repair work will involve the removal and reconstruction of the brick side walls, the removal and replacement of the concrete stoop and steps, the repair and replacement of porch soffits and fascia, the repair or replacement of the fluted Doric columns, and the reinstallation of the wrought iron handrail.

The scope of the work is discussed in an analysis of Section 33.19(11)(i) below:

1. See analysis of Sec. 33.19(11)(g) below).
2. The repair of the existing porch structure will alter the existing materials. The Applicant is trying to match the existing character of the brick and mortar with the proposed replacement materials. The final product will be compatible with the original or existing historical finishes.
3. The repair of the porch will not affect the existing and original rhythm of masses and spaces.
4. The repair of the porch will not affect the existing historical landscape plan.
5. The repair of the porch will not affect the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

The analysis of 33.19(11)(g) follows:

1. The repair of the porch will not affect the height.
2. The repair of the porch will not affect the historical rhythm of solids and voids.
3. The materials are being replicated in-kind. The existing textured brick on the side walls is largely unsalvageable and there would not be enough material to reuse the existing brick. The proposed brick material has a textured surface that has a similar texture and color to the existing brick. The Applicant indicated in the submission materials that the existing color and profile of the mortar will be replicated. Staff encouraged the Applicant to investigate options for column repair and reinstallation in lieu of installing new columns. If new columns are necessary, the Applicants have indicated in the submission materials that the replacement columns will closely resemble the existing columns.
4. The roof repairs will be made with in-kind materials and will not affect the historical appearance of the roof.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following condition of approval:

1. Provide staff with the cut sheet product information including dimensions for the proposed new columns for staff review and approval.