



Project Name/Address: 118-122 State
Application Type: Alteration adjacent to landmark (Lamb Building)
Legistar File ID # [49062](#)
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: September 27, 2017

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Matthew Prescott
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting an exterior alteration to a building adjacent to a Designated Landmark.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located adjacent to a Designated Landmark at 114 State Street.

Relevant Zoning Code:

28.144 DEVELOPMENT ADJACENT TO A LANDMARK OR LANDMARK SITE.

Any development on a zoning lot adjoining a landmark or landmark site for which Plan Commission or Urban Design Commission review is required shall be reviewed by the Landmark Commission to determine whether the proposed development is so large or visually intrusive as to adversely affect the historic character and integrity of the adjoining landmark or landmark site. Landmark Commission review shall be advisory to the Plan Commission and the Urban Design Commission.

Analysis and Conclusion

The Applicant is proposing to develop the property adjacent to the Lamb Building, a designated landmark facing State Street and North Carroll Street. Because the Lamb Building is a narrow building on an angled through lot, each elevation is viewed against the proposed development differently and will be described separately in this analysis.

The existing building at 118 State is adjacent to the Lamb Building along the Lamb Building's western property line that runs from State Street to North Carroll Street. The property at 118 is being combined with the property at 122 State to create a larger development site. The proposed development will maintain a portion of the building at 118 State while the entirety of the existing 6 story building at 122 State will be demolished. The alterations proposed for the building at 118 and the related development at 122 will be viewed in direct relationship to the Lamb Building.

In addition to maintaining a portion of the existing building at 118 to enhance the streetscape along State Street, the proposed development will also push the tallest part of the building toward the corner at West Dayton and North Carroll Streets, remove the skywalk over West Dayton Street, and remove the bulk of the existing building at 122 above the 4th story from the State Street elevation.

The building at 118 was constructed in 1897 as the original location of the Mautz Brothers Paint Company. Mautz would later become one of Madison's largest industries. The Mautz Building was constructed before the adjacent landmark, Lamb Building. The Lamb Building is architecturally significant because it was designed by master architect, Louis Claude of the local architecture firm of Claude and Starck. The Lamb Building was constructed in 1905 in the Queen Anne style. The Lamb Building is also historically significant because the master architect also had an office in the commercial building.

The Lamb Building was designed with the Mautz Building and the Wisconsin Building at 102 State as its neighbors. The three buildings have held the top of State Street since 1905. The Lamb Building has been flanked by period buildings that provide it an appropriate immediate context and the proposed development will change that context.

State Street

On State Street, the front portion of the building at 118 will remain directly adjacent to the Landmark. The proposed new building has a 4 story portion that will be setback 4'-0" or so from the façade of the existing building along State Street. The remainder of the new building along the State Street façade will continue the adjacent 4 story height at the State Street property line. 30'-0" behind the State Street property line, the new development increases in height to 8 stories, then to 9 stories after an additional step back.

The development team has worked to create a State Street primary elevation that is compatible with the landmark building and maintains its immediate context at the street by retaining the façade and front portions of 118. The retention of the 118 façade allows the Lamb Building to have a buffer building of similar scale and material qualities.

Although much larger than the Lamb Building, the new development may not be considered too large or visually intrusive in a way that adversely affects the historic character and integrity of the landmark. Given the location of this block in the downtown, the density of the context, the scale of other adjacent buildings, and the retention of the urban qualities adjacent to the landmark (party wall, articulation of façade to express street rhythm, etc.), the proposed development may be appropriate adjacent to the Lamb Building. In a different context, a development of this size and with similar visual qualities may be inappropriate adjacent to a landmark.

North Carroll Street

At the sixth story, the proposed development is setback approximately 2'-0" off the property line at North Carroll Street and along a portion of the property line adjacent to the landmark site. The 9 story portion of the development is located toward the West Dayton Street and North Carroll Street and is held approximately 2'-0" off the property line adjacent to the landmark site. At the street facades where the proposed development is visible adjacent to the landmark, the new building is 6 stories tall on the North Carroll Street elevation and 4 stories tall on the State Street elevation with the retained portion of 118 at 2 stories.

The 6 story mass of the new building at the North Carroll / West Dayton corner is directly adjacent to the 3 story secondary elevation of the Lamb Building. On the North Carroll elevation, the landmark building has a smaller scale and a finer grain of architectural details that seem overpowered by the adjacent large development.

The proposed building is large and may be visually intrusive related to the North Carroll Street elevation.

Recommendation

The recommendation relates to the two different street frontages.

Regarding the State Street frontage, staff recommends that the Landmarks Commission find that the new development is large, but not so large or visually intrusive as to adversely affect the historic character and integrity of the primary façade of the adjoining landmark.

Regarding the North Carroll frontage, staff recommends that the Landmarks Commission find that the new development is large and visually intrusive and that this does negatively affect the historic character of the secondary façade of the adjoining landmark building.