

AGENDA # 6

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: 4/18/22

TITLE: Buildings Proposed for Demolition - 2022

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: 4/19/22

ID NUMBER: 68860

Members present were: Katie Kaliszewski, Ald. Arvina Martin, David McLean, and Maurice Taylor. Excused were: Anna Andrzejewski and Richard Arnesen.

SUMMARY:

Nick Orthmann, registering in support and wishing to speak

Alex Saloutos, registering in opposition and wishing to speak

Alison Mills, registering in support and available to answer questions

Kevin Burow, registering in support and available to answer questions

Amy Lucas, registering neither in support nor in opposition and available to answer questions

Alex Saloutos suggested that the building at 802 Regent Street would meet the standards for becoming a local landmark under criterion A, an association with broad patterns of cultural and social history in the community. It is an excellent intact example of vernacular architecture, originally a grocery store. They said they do not support demolition of this building, which was part of the Italian Greenbush neighborhood that was decimated in the 1960s with rehabilitation and is now being redeveloped. They suggested the building be incorporated into the redevelopment.

Nick Orthmann spoke on behalf of the redevelopment company regarding 402 W Wilson Street. They noted that they are not demolishing the building and will incorporate it into the development project, along with completing an addition to the building. This may be a technical demolition based on the façade work they are doing and wanted to make that distinction clear to the commission. Kaliszewski asked if the building would be incorporated into the larger apartment complex or remain its own individual building. Orthmann said it will be incorporated into the larger complex. They are proposing a four-story building that will primarily be constructed in the parking lot on the northwest side of the site and will wrap over the top of the existing building, so one will still be able to see three sides of the existing façade.

Ekberg recommended a finding of no known historic value for the buildings at 3900 Monona Drive, 3916 Monona Drive, 3920 Monona Drive, 109 Cottage Grove Road, 3010 Gregory Street, 3734 Speedway Road, 3706 S Dutch Mill Road, 1801 Northport Drive, 2303 W Beltline Highway, 131 W Wilson Street, and 402 W Wilson Street.

Bailey pointed out that in the 1970s photo of 402 W Wilson Street, the building used to have an International-style front façade with Brutalist-style side façades, then when the building was remodeled, the Brutalism was moved to the front. She said that one does not see a lot of International-style buildings downtown. Kaliszewski said that the original building from the 1970s photo was quite striking, but the remodels have made it less visually striking.

Taylor suggested demolition criterion b for 402 W Wilson Street and 131 W Wilson Street. He said that 131 W Wilson Street is an important part of Madison's modest skyline that one can see from John Nolen Drive. McLean agreed that it fits into the context of Madison's built environment. He pointed out the design of the upper five stories of the building and asked if there were other similarly designed buildings in Madison. He said the building had unique features that helped it stand out in the built environment.

Ekberg outlined information from the staff report related to 802 Regent Street.

Martin said the building was an important part of the history of the Greenbush neighborhood and served the Italian families who were a huge part of this neighborhood and the City's history. There was discussion on whether the building fit within demolition criterion b or c. McLean advocated for c; he pointed out that while it is no longer a grocery store, it is still a food provider in the neighborhood. Taylor agreed with c, as did Martin. McLean compared the building photos from the 1980s and today and pointed out how intact the building is.

Alison Mills, representing the developer, said there have been some major renovations to the interior and an addition to the exterior, causing some serious integrity problems. They introduced their consultant, Amy Lucas.

Amy Lucas, historic preservation consultant working with the developer, evaluated the building for eligibility in the National Register and said there were significant problems. They said that the spaghetti house next door to this building burned down, and a brick and concrete block addition was constructed in its place. The storefronts were removed and the interior was gutted. There are window replacements on the side, and the back has a large brick and concrete emergency egress stair addition. Because of those alterations, they said that too much integrity has been lost for a National Register designation.

McLean suggested the commission stick with a finding of c based on the cultural and historic significance to this part of Madison, which is an area that used to thrive and has significantly eroded over time.

The commission discussed the remaining buildings proposed for demolition on Regent Street. McLean mentioned the former Fraboni's Deli location at 820 Regent Street. He said that the three buildings at 816, 818, and 820 Regent Street are significant given their age and suggested demolition criterion b. They have been somewhat altered over time, but they are part of the vernacular that are we losing in Madison. Just like the grocery store, the buildings are part of this neighborhood and tell the story of the people who used to live there.

ACTION:

A motion was made by Taylor, seconded by McLean, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 3900 Monona Drive, 3916 Monona Drive, 3920 Monona Drive, 109 Cottage Grove Road, 3010 Gregory Street, 3734 Speedway Road, 3706 S Dutch Mill Road, 1801 Northport Drive, and 2303 W Beltline Highway have no known historic value; and the buildings at 131 W Wilson Street and 402 W Wilson Street have historic value related to the context of Madison's built environment and as part of the Madison skyline, but the buildings themselves are not significant. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

A motion was made by Martin, seconded by McLean, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 802 Regent Street has historic value based on its cultural and historic significance as an important business in the Greenbush neighborhood that served other Italian families in the neighborhood. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Taylor, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 816 Regent Street, 818 Regent Street, and 820 Regent Street have historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, but the buildings themselves are not significant. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Taylor, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 826 Regent Street has no known historic value. The motion passed by voice vote/other.