

**From:** [Kim Schmitgen](#)  
**To:** [PLLCApplications](#)  
**Subject:** E. Dayton St Historic District  
**Date:** Friday, March 4, 2022 1:25:10 PM

---

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

My name is Kim Schmitgen and my husband Randy and I want to say we are against the demolition of the buildings in the 100 blk of E Dayton St. These buildings represent black pioneers in Madison and are extremely important to Madison's history.

Sincerely, Kim and Randy Schmitgen

Sent from my iPhone

**From:** [Roger Glass](#)  
**To:** [PLLCApplications](#)  
**Subject:** Demolition of 114 N Blount  
**Date:** Friday, March 4, 2022 4:09:14 PM

---

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

I s. Irongly oppose demolition of this site. I live right around the corner and I show these three houses to my African-American grandchildren and we imagine what life must have been for blacks in early Madison history.

When I saw this house had sold, I had hopes that it would be lovingly restored not demolished. And to be demolished to be replaced by what? I hope that the Landmarks Commission has or will give ample notice throughout the black Madison community of this proposed demolition before making a decision.

Thank you,

Mary Gibson-Glass



**From:** [SANDRA E WARD](#)  
**To:** [PLLCApplications](#)  
**Subject:** 114 N. Blount St -- agenda 68860  
**Date:** Friday, March 4, 2022 4:24:36 PM

---

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

I am dumbfounded that anyone could even consider destroying this small but important part of the Dayton Street historic district. As you know, this small historic district consists of only 3 buildings, and to destroy one of them would be tragedy. I'm sure you are aware that, "Today, the three buildings remaining are only a tiny fragment of the old Black neighborhood that once flourished on East Dayton Street".

Please do not allow this destruction of this building.

Thank you,  
Sandra Ward  
333 W Mifflin St  
Madison, WI

**From:** [mike engel](#)  
**To:** [PLLCApplications](#)  
**Subject:** Agenda Item 9: 114 N Blount  
**Date:** Sunday, March 6, 2022 9:19:32 AM

---

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

I do not support demolition of 114 N Blount St. This is a historic structure in a historic district recognized by the state and federal government for its significance. The fact that there are only 3 structures in the area demolition of the 1/3 of them is not acceptable.

Mike Engel  
826 Jenifer St, Madison, WI 53703

Landmarks Commission  
Meeting of March 7, 2022  
Agenda item #9, Legistar #68860, Demolition of 114 N Blount Street

114 N Blount is part of the East Dayton Street Historic District, listed on the National Register. This is a tiny historic district, consisting of only three buildings, with a unique history. As stated in the National Register application:

“Today, the three buildings remaining are only a tiny fragment of the old black neighborhood that once flourished on East Dayton Street. But despite its reduced size, the East Dayton Street historic district is historically significant because the extant buildings are associated with some of the area’s leading black pioneer families, including the Turners, the Millers, and the Hills.”

<https://npgallery.nps.gov/NRHP/GetAsset/d99d2e3e-3215-48b1-a22e-5f7921a305b7>

Generally, the loss of any one building in a National Register district does not change the character of the district. However, in this particular case one-third of the district would disappear.

The applicant’s comments as reflected in the staff demolition report: “The building has been subjected to decades of neglect, and suffers from extreme structural issues.” According to the 1987 National Register application: “This building was moved to this site in 1923 and is in very good condition, both inside and out.”

It is entirely possible that the building has deteriorated over the last 30 years. But if it is so badly deteriorated, why did the applicant apply for a building permit to replace all plaster in house with 1/2" drywall, a permit that was issued on 12/22/21?

The City Assessor values the property at \$296,800 (\$130,000 for the land, \$166,400 for the building). The purchase price of \$200,000 in December 2021 was about half of what comparably sized neighborhood properties have sold for recently. That leaves a lot of room to do repairs and not outprice the local market.

MGO 28.185(7)(b) provides: “If the Landmarks Commission determines that the property with the proposed demolition or the structure proposed for removal has historic value, then the Plan Commission shall approve the demolition or removal under sub. (9) below, after considering input from the Landmarks Commission.”

I hope the Landmarks Commission finds that this building has historic value and provides a thorough explanation of that historic value. Then it will be up to the Plan Commission to determine whether the demolition of 114 N Blount would be consistent with “the health, prosperity, safety, and welfare of the City of Madison.”

Respectfully Submitted,  
Linda Lehnertz

**From:** [Katherine Rankin](#)  
**To:** [PLLCApplications](#)  
**Subject:** 114 N. Blount Street  
**Date:** Sunday, March 6, 2022 7:13:44 PM

---


Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

This building is part of the East Dayton Street historic district. It is of great significance as part of Madison's first Black neighborhood. As you know, recognizing the history of marginalized populations has recently been a major focus of the City of Madison and its historic preservation program. This building is only one of three in the historic district (there is one other home to early Black residents adjacent that was listed before the other three). Other buildings that were associated with this grouping were torn down decades ago. Please do not allow this historically significant property to be destroyed.

Thank you.

Kitty Rankin

--

Katherine Rankin  
Preservation Consultant  
2818 Ridge Road  
Madison WI 53705  


**From:** [Valerie Mellerop](#)  
**To:** [PLLCApplications](#)  
**Subject:** The Carmichael House, 114 North Blount  
**Date:** Sunday, March 6, 2022 8:26:56 PM

---

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

I know the history of this house and the value of that history. However, I understand that there are major structural issues. As the long-time owner of a house that is about 120 years old (at 1052 East Gorham St.), I know the difficulties and costs involved with maintaining a building that has not always been cared for. If the history of the house is adequately documented, the City can convey that history to the public. A building cannot always be saved. I would suggest that a demolition permit be granted, especially if the current owner plans to continue living there.

Thank you,

Valerie Mellerop  
1052 East Gorham Street  
  
[vmellerop@gmail.com](mailto:vmellerop@gmail.com)

March 7<sup>th</sup> 2022

Landmarks Commission

Dear Commissioners,

I hope that this note finds you all well. I deeply appreciate your service to our city. I am writing today, as the alderperson for district 6, to vehemently oppose granting a demolition permit for 114 Blount Street. The Carmichael Residence is one of the few homes that holds historical and cultural relevance for African Americans living in Madison. In this city that prides itself on historic preservation, there is often questioning by BIPOC people, in whose histories are we trying to protect-as BIPOC people are often left out of these considerations. I sincerely hope that the Landmarks Commission can recognize and appreciate the historical significance of this site. Please know that any considerations would be appreciated. If I can answer any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Best wishes and care

Brian Benford

Aldersperson-District 6

City of Madison

[district6@cityofmadison.com](mailto:district6@cityofmadison.com)





**From:** [betty.banks@projectbabies.org](mailto:betty.banks@projectbabies.org)  
**To:** [PLLCApplications](#); [Benford, Brian](#)  
**Subject:** Carmichael House  
**Date:** Monday, March 7, 2022 12:39:08 PM

---

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

This is regarding the request for demolition of the Carmichael House, 114 Blount St. This house is part of the neighborhood where early African American pioneers settled. It was the home of the publisher of "The Blade", the first Black newspaper to be published in Madison. Too much Black Madison history has been lost or never recognized. This home is a piece of that history and is adjacent to The Miller House and The Hill Grocery store and Home. I am asking for it not to be demolished.

Betty Banks, Creator of "Stony The Road: History and Stories from Descendants of Madison's Early African American Pioneers"

Granddaughter of Wm and Anna Mae Miller (first Black Home Owners in Dane County)

**From:** [Dawn O'Kroley](#)  
**To:** [PLLCApplications](#)  
**Cc:** [Benford, Brian](#)  
**Subject:** Agenda Item 9, Oppose the demolition of 609-617 E Dayton, 616 E Mifflin and 114 N Blount  
**Date:** Monday, March 7, 2022 1:16:46 PM

---

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Commissioners, it would be inappropriate to approve the demolition of two separate properties on the same block that are part of the history of underrepresented communities. The Historic Preservation Plan includes specific emphasis on six underrepresented communities, African American, First Nations, Hmong, Latino/a, LGBTQ and Women. I served as chair of the Historic Preservation Plan Advisory Committee.

114 N Blount is a contributing property in the East Dayton Street National Register District, part of Madison's first African American neighborhood. It is critical to retain the District's listing and eligibility for State and Federal preservation tax credits.

The women-owned business, Reynolds Transfer & Storage on E Dayton and E Mifflin was founded in 1888 by Anna Gault Reynolds. Also of note, Anna's grandson, Mayor Henry Reynolds cast the tie breaking vote for the Madison City Council to pass an ordinance prohibiting discrimination in housing and employment in 1963.

On May 31, 2021, per zoning code ordinance 28.105, a request to create a Neighborhood Conservation Overlay District including and surrounding the East Dayton Street National Historic District and Fourth Lake Ridge National Historic District was submitted to the Director of Planning, Community & Economic Development and the Common Council. The city has not yet made a determination whether the proposed area is consistent with the eligibility standards in Sec. 28.105 (3). I urge this body not to approve of their demolition. Thank you, Dawn O'Kroley 646 E Gorham Street

**From:** [Gary Tipler](#)  
**To:** [PLLCApplications](#); [Benford, Brian](#)  
**Subject:** Landmarks Commission Agenda Item 9, Demolition of 114 N Blount, Carmichael House  
**Date:** Monday, March 7, 2022 2:00:39 PM

---

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dear Members of the Commission and Alder Benford,

I learned of the demolition request for the Carmichael House and wish to provide information not in the Agenda materials.

I urge you to dismiss the application and recommend a restorative approach with the applicant who closed on it in December. Prior to that it was in the family since the house was moved there.

The Carmichael House, one of only a few of the designated historic buildings associated with Madison's Black history.

The Carmichael family arrived in Madison around 1900 as did the Miller family. A member of the Carmichael family, Chestina married J. Anthony Josey, who was one of the first Blacks to attend the University of Wisconsin Law School and who founded The Wisconsin Weekly Blade, the first Black newspaper in Madison and Wisconsin's first successful Black newspaper.

The Hills, who owned the house and grocery next door were related to the Carmichaels, lived in the house until relatively recently. Edwin Hill, Jr., conveyed some of the histories in Muriel Summs' book, "Settlin', Stories of Madison's Early African American Families."

Please help redirect the potential outcome for this historic property. It's future will have broader impacts on downtown than can be imagined.

Respectfully,  
Gary Tipler  
Madison

**From:** [Joe Lusson](#)  
**To:** [PLLCApplications](#)  
**Cc:** [Benford, Brian](#); [Heck, Patrick](#)  
**Subject:** Preserving 114 N. Blount  
**Date:** Monday, March 7, 2022 2:12:17 PM

---

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Landmarks Commission,

I urge you to strongly oppose demolition of the Carmichael House, 114 North Blount. It is an important part of Madison's history. As part of a national register historic district representing an important early Black neighborhood, it needs to be protected. As the owner of a home in the nearby Fourth Lake Ridge Historic District, I believe that historic protections help give property owners confidence that they can invest in restoring their properties and that the neighboring historic properties will likewise be preserved.

Saving this house is good on many levels: important social history of an underrepresented group, important architectural history of the types of homes that early Madisonians built and lived in.

If we can't save our historic districts, what can we save?

There are plenty of other areas nearby where we can build larger buildings to create more housing opportunities. In this particular case it appears someone bought a home in a historic district, thinking they could tear it down. I hope you will agree that this was a mistaken assumption.

Sincerely,

Joe Lusson  
640 E. Gorham Street  


cc: Ald. Benford  
Ald. Heck

**From:** [Tracy Doreen](#)  
**To:** [PLLCApplications](#)  
**Subject:** Comments on item number 9 for tonight's meeting  
**Date:** Monday, March 7, 2022 2:44:56 PM

---

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

I oppose the demolition of 114 N Blount St. It is part of east Dayton street historic district on the national register. Please note:

"Today, the three buildings remaining are only a tiny fragment of the old black neighborhood that once flourished on East Dayton Street. But despite its reduced size, the East Dayton Street historic district is historically significant because the extant buildings are associated with some of the area's leading black pioneer families, including the Turners, the Millers, and the Hills."

If this building needs work, then do the work. Don't just tear it down because you can make more money on the dollar if you build something bigger. That oldneighborhood is almost completely gone. Please let these last unique historic buildings remain.

Sincerely

Tracy Doreen Dietzel  
Paterson St.

**From:** [Michael Carlson](#)  
**To:** [PLLCApplications](#)  
**Subject:** Public Comment for Item on 3/7 Agenda  
**Date:** Monday, March 7, 2022 2:47:08 PM

---

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

March 7, 2022

Re: Petition by Gregory Werth to demo home at 114 N. Blount Street

Dear Sir or Madam:

Please accept this letter in support of Greg Werth's request to demo the home located at 114 N. Blount Street, and to replace it with new, high-quality single-family residential construction.

My own professional background lies in residential construction and development. I've seen the construction issues and concerns that Mr. Werth has identified with the Blount Street home. I agree with his conclusion that while the home may have historical value, that its defectiveness in construction quality yields a building that is more likely to be a hazard to future residents, than a benefit for the community. Mr. Werth can only viably save the existing building through difficult construction compromises that do nothing to address the actual structural, weatherization and environmental deficiencies of the home.

I met Mr. Werth when he renovated a single-family home two doors down from our family home on Oak Street. His work is excellent, and his homes exceed the quality and durability found in most new construction in the Madison market. I was so impressed with his work here on Oak Street, that I eagerly helped a family friend to buy the Oak Street home when it last came to market.

I do recognize the value of historic properties and the benefits and continuity of place that they provide to neighborhoods and communities. That benefit must be weighed, I think, by the lengths a builder must go to, to yield a safe, secure, code-compliant dwelling for families. I share Mr. Werth's professional assessment, that the best path for the Blount home, lies with demolition and construction of new, quality housing.

Thank you for your time and consideration. I can be reached by the contact information provided below, with any questions.

Sincerely,

Michael Carlson  
226 Oak Street, Madison WI  
  
[michael.j.m.carlson@gmail.com](mailto:michael.j.m.carlson@gmail.com)

**From:** [Edward Kuharski](#)  
**To:** [PLLCApplications](#)  
**Cc:** [bob.klebba@gmail.com](mailto:bob.klebba@gmail.com)  
**Subject:** Proposed Demolitions on tonight's agenda  
**Date:** Monday, March 7, 2022 3:39:08 PM

---

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Commissioners: Regarding the proposed demolition of the historic Carmichael home at 114 North Blount St.

Just a note to let you know of my concern and opposition to the proposed demolition of this historic house, located in an historic district.

- First there is the importance of what little is left of Madison's original African American neighborhood and the significance of this home's several owners and occupants.
- Second there is the importance of discouraging owners from acquiring historic property and then seeking to demolish it, rather than invest in preserving and restoring it. This demolition request would set a terrible precedent.
- Third, there is the importance of discouraging "tear-downs" of any housing, especially at the affordable end of the spectrum. New construction is inherently not "affordable", except by artificial subsidies. Such subsidies would be acceptable if they applied to owner-occupied properties, but they do not.
- Finally, historic, standing properties are inherently greener than new construction. The embodied energy in the structure was low in the first place, and by virtue of being in place for decades, it has a better footprint than even the greenest of new construction. And that matters in the critical next few decades of our climate emergency.

Warm regards, Ed

**Edward Kuharski, Architect, AIA, LEED AP**  
**GREEN DESIGN STUDIO**  
405 Sidney Street  
Madison, WI 53703  
[REDACTED] mobile  
[ekuharski@aol.com](mailto:ekuharski@aol.com)

"The best way to predict the future is to help create it."

**From:** [Juli Wagner](#)  
**To:** [PLLCApplications](#); [Benford, Brian](#)  
**Subject:** 114 N Blount St - demolition - East Dayton Street Historic District  
**Date:** Monday, March 7, 2022 5:40:14 PM

---

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Alder Benford, Commissioners:

I am writing to enter a comment of opposition to the demolition of 114 N Blount Street.

This property represents a small part of central Madison as part of a very unique East Dayton Street Historic District and is registered on the National Register, representing the history and representation of the Black community early in Madison history.

Rather than demolition, please consider significance of the property and what it represents. Perhaps there is a path forward building on the history and significance of the site to share the history and cultural relevance of the period of the local Black Community that surely is less known and underappreciated.

I request denial of the request to demolish 114 N Blount St.

Respectfully,

Juli Wagner

S. Franklin Street, owner, representing myself

District 6 resident



Carmichael House LC comments 7 March 2022

Thank you staff and commissioners for your time tonight.

We have tonight a request for demolition of one of the 3 or 4 contributing properties for an historic district. Losing this building would have literally a monumentally deleterious impact on this district. This is one of the few houses remaining in the nexus of the early 19<sup>th</sup> century African American neighborhood in Madison.

As is the custom, those requesting demolition of buildings like this cite their condition and the expense of bringing them up to date. When reading the nomination application for this historic district, the City's preservation planner wrote that the Carmichael House was in very good condition. I've not seen an independent engineering report stating that this important cultural resource cannot be saved.

As you've seen in others' comments, the people occupying this house were pioneers not only in the Black Madison community, but also in the Black Wisconsin community with significant impact.

Commissioners may remember that I live next door to the former Ward 2 school and later Lincoln School which was the local grammar school for the Carmichaels, the Joseys, the Hills, and Frank Lloyd Wright. When you look at the historic pictures of the classes at these schools, there are always 2 to 5 Black children in the picture.

Because this is such a significant building to an historic district, I ask the Commission to recommend to deny the request for demolition.