

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: June 30, 2010
TITLE: 2202 South Stoughton Road – Comprehensive Design Review of Signage to Allow an Oversized Logo Element, Farm & Fleet. 16 th Ald. Dist. (18968)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: June 30, 2010	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Mark Smith, Dawn O’Kroley, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods and Richard Slayton.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of June 30, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a Comprehensive Design Review of signage located at 2202 South Stoughton Road for Farm & Fleet. Appearing on behalf of the project were Neal Van Loo, representing Farm & Fleet of Madison; and David Wynn along with Kathy Dustin, representing the Glendale Neighborhood Association. Van Loo presented details of the oversized logo signage located on the gray precast tower at the front entrance. All other signage meets code requirements. The sign will be brushed aluminum with painted letters, backlit with blue LED lighting. Staff stated that code permits one principal signable area per façade where logo elements are allowed outside of the principal signable area with the automotive service area is considered to be an accessory graphic. Staff also noted that the standards to be addressed under the provisions for “Comprehensive Design Review” could be met with the project based on the extensive level of improvements proposed relative to the addition and updating of the building’s façade, as well as site/landscape improvements. The Commission discussed other projects they have reviewed related to secondary signage. Comments from the Commission were as follows:

- The logo is taller than the “Blaine’s” and I question that.
- I don’t have a problem with the logo but it seems out of scale to the sign. The sign should be the dominant identifier.

There was some discomfort with approving a logo element that substantially exceeded the normal allowable size of 6 square feet as “precedent setting” with more support to approve the signage as a “secondary principal signable area” in association with the extensive updated building façade improvements.

ACTION:

On a motion by Wagner, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-0). The motion provided for the finding that the standards for Comprehensive Design Review were addressed as noted by staff with approval of the oversized logo element as a secondary principal signable area in conjunction with the extensive architectural improvements to the existing building façade and addition, as well as site/landscape improvements.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6, 6, 6 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 2202 South Stoughton Road

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	6	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	6	-	6	6
	-	-	-	-	6	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	6	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	6	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5

General Comments:

- Appropriate for this building.
- Tasteful but too big.