

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: January 11, 2006	
TITLE: 437-443 West Mifflin Street – PUD(GDP-SIP) for Eight Residential Units in Three Buildings. 4 th Ald. Dist.	REFERRED:	
	REREFERRED:	
	REPORTED BACK:	
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED:	POF:
DATED: January 11, 2006	ID NUMBER:	

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Cathleen Feland, Robert March, Ald. Noel Radomski, and Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett and Michael Barrett.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of January 11, 2006, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 437-443 West Mifflin Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Jim Glueck, Frank Staniszewski, Rosemary Lee, Joe Houseman and Ledell Zellers. Prior to the presentation of the revised plans, staff noted to the Commission that the project currently under consideration was a replacement proposal for a previously proposed 23-unit apartment building involving demolition of both buildings on the adjoining sites, referred twice by the Commission due to issues with the redevelopment proposal's consistency with the character of West Mifflin Street (June 1 and April 20, 2005). Based on these issues the applicant, Madison Development Corporation and new project architect Jim Glueck have revised the project to provide for the maintenance of one of the two existing structures on the site (a single-family home at 437 West Mifflin), the demolition of one of the existing single-family homes to construct a 2-unit two-story building located at 441-443 West Mifflin (due to fire damage), along with the construction of a 2-1/2-story four-unit building at the rear of the combined lots. The site and building plans as presented by Glueck featured the maintenance and renovation of the existing house at 437 West Mifflin as a two-unit, combined with the construction of a new 2-story 2-unit building in a complementary "later Victorian" style with a front facing gable. The rear 4-unit building is also of a similar architectural style. The site plan features the utilization of the existing shared driveway between both of the current front located structures, with a 5-stall surface parking lot to be developed between both existing and proposed structures. The four-unit building features more added space to grade to provide for accessible housing. Glueck noted that the demolition of the building at 441-443 West Mifflin would involve an attempt to reuse and integrate salvaged materials. Following the presentation, the Commission expressed concerns on the following:

- Further consideration of the project should be provided with contextual information as to the location of the redevelopment proposal within the Mifflin neighborhood, as well as surrounding properties.
- The Commission also expressed concerns with the precedent regarding the establishment of the 4-unit rear building at the rear of the two combined lots. In response to this issue, Rosemary Lee and Ledell Zellers informed the Commission that they felt that the size and scale, as well as the architecture, was compatible with other structures in the area, as well as noting that other midblock buildings of this size and scale already existed throughout the area.

Lee and Zellers spoke in favor of the project, emphasizing that its size and mass was in accordance and compatible with the rest of the neighborhood, as well as a vast improvement from the previously proposed project. Zellers also noted that the Commission should push for fiber cement siding not vinyl, as well as the reuse and salvage of materials if the building is to be demolished and can't be saved.

Additional comments by the Commissioners were as follows:

- Like project. The rear carriage house is handsome. Prefer the use of fiber cement siding.
- Like scale and scope of project. Like limited parking, but don't like the tearing down of the fire damaged structure and want to hear more about it in detail.

ACTION:

On a motion by Host-Jablonski, seconded by March, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of the project. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (7-0). The motion required further detailing and consideration of landscaping/drainage plans with consideration of final approval of the project.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6, 6.5, 7, 7, 7 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 437-443 West Mifflin Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	7	6 (2-unit) 7 (4-unit)	-	5	-	8	9	7
	6	6	6	-	-	6	7	6
	7	7	-	-	-	8	9	7
	7	7	-	-	-	5	8	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	6	7	-	-	-	-	7	7
	7	6	-	6.5	-	-	6.5	6.5

General Comments:

- Nice job.
- Very nice! Scale is exactly right while providing more density downtown. The teardown is disappointing.
- An excellent use of the site.
- Appropriate use of site, density and massing. Architecture is somewhat mediocre, but acceptable for low-expectation affordable housing.