



Report to the Plan Commission

March 21, 2011

Legistar I.D. #21728
517 South Baldwin Street
Demolition Request

Report Prepared By:
 Heather Stouder, AICP
 Planning Division Staff

Requested Action: Approval of a partial demolition of an existing single-family home with new additions in the R4A (Limited General Residence) District.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: Section 28.12(12) provides the guidelines and regulations for the approval of demolitions.

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission finds that the demolition standards can be met and **approve** the request for the partial demolition and proposed additions.

Background Information

Applicant/Property Owner: Kristofer and Helen Nonn; 517 S Baldwin St.; Madison

Proposal: The applicant is requesting a partial demolition with a subsequent addition to a single-family home in the R4A (Limited General Residence) District.

Parcel Location: 517 South Baldwin is located on the northeast corner of South Baldwin Street and Rutledge Street, Aldermanic District 6 (Rummel); Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions: The 4,350 square foot parcel includes a two-story, 780 square foot single-family home and a detached garage.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning: The home is surrounded by single- and two-family homes in the R4A (Limited General Residence) District. There are a few multi-family buildings with 3-6 dwelling units within a one-block radius of the property.

Adopted Land Use Plan: The Comprehensive Plan (2006) recommends Low Density Residential (LDR) for this property. The Marquette-Schenk-Atwood Neighborhood Plan (1994) does not include more specific recommendations.

Environmental Corridor Status: This property is not located within a mapped environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: The property is served by a range of urban services, and Metro Transit Routes 3, 4, and 38.

Zoning Summary: The property is in the R4A (Limited General Residence) District.

Requirements	Required	Proposed
Lot Area	6,000 sq. ft.	4,356 sq. ft.
Lot width	50'	66'
Usable open space	500 sq. ft.	None shown
Front yard	20	16.7' (variance granted)
Side yards	0	12.2' RS, 11' LS
Rear yard	35'	22.4' (variance granted)

Site Design

No. Parking stalls	1	1 existing
Accessible stalls	N/A	N/A
Loading	N/A	N/A
No. Bike Parking stalls	N/A	N/A
Landscaping	No	No
Lighting	No	No

Other Critical Zoning Items

Urban Design	No
Historic District	Yes- Third Lake Ridge
Landmark Building	No
Floodplain	No
Utility Easements	Yes
Adjacent to Park	No
Barrier free (ILHR 69)	No

Prepared by: Pat Anderson, Asst. Zoning Administrator

Project Description

The applicant proposes a collection of changes and additions to an existing single-family home in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District. Changes to the existing structure involve a partial demolition, which trigger the need for Plan Commission review as a demolition.

As proposed, the northern one-story portion of the 760 square foot home will be demolished and replaced by a new 2-story addition. Despite its need for significant structural reinforcement, the original 2-story portion of the home constructed in the late 1860's will remain on site and shift two feet toward Baldwin Street to sit on a new foundation. The resulting house will be approximately 1,500 square feet, with a 900 square foot footprint.

New first floor porches and decks are proposed on three sides of the house. The eight-foot deep open front porch would bring it more in line with surrounding homes. The applicant indicates that care will be taken throughout the process to restore or replace historic details such as windows, trim, and siding materials, although a new standing seam metal roof will incorporate solar panels.

A tiled silo from a nearby farm, originally constructed in the early 1900's, is proposed to be rebuilt and incorporated into the rear of the new house encompassing circular bathrooms on the first and second floors. Nestled into the elbow of the L-shaped house, the reused silo would be hidden from view from both Baldwin Street and Spaight Street. The existing driveway and detached garage will remain behind the home on the northern portion of the property.

Related Approvals

Landmarks Commission

On December 13, the Landmarks Commission acted on this proposal with four separate votes, with much of the debate focused on whether or not a cylindrical mass (a reused silo) was an appropriate component of the building in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

First, the proposed partial demolition of the existing home was unanimously approved.

Second, the Landmarks Commission unanimously approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior alterations to the c. 1868 portion of the existing house with the following conditions:

- The ridge height of the c. 1868 portion shall be raised to match the ridge height of the new construction.
- The altered bay shall have details that more closely resemble the existing and historic details. The proposed details shall be reviewed and finalized with Staff.
- An appropriate relationship between the foundation and the siding shall be detailed and be reviewed and finalized with Staff.

Third, the Landmarks Commission unanimously approved the Certificate of Appropriateness for the new construction of the kitchen wing *without* the cylindrical mass (silo) with the following conditions:

- The existing foundation stones shall be used on the new foundation as veneer. A sample shall be reviewed by Staff.
- The northeast porch shall be more traditional in form and detailing. Details shall be reviewed and finalized with Staff.
- The final details including, but not limited to porch and railing details, eave and cornice details, chimney materials, window and trim details, door and trim details, siding details, and roof details shall be reviewed and finalized with Staff or by the Landmarks Commission at staff's discretion.

Fourth and finally, the Landmarks Commission approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for the cylindrical mass (reused silo) proposed on the rear of the home on a vote of 4 to 2.

Zoning Board of Appeals

On January 27, 2011, the Zoning Board of Appeals approved a 2 foot 9 inch front yard variance and a 12 foot 7 inch rear yard variance for the proposed home.

Evaluation and Conclusion

From a land use perspective, the proposal is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan recommendation for low density residential uses in this area. The proposed partial demolition, partial restoration, and contemporary additions to a late 19th century home result in a new single-family home that will fit in nicely within the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

The proposal, and especially the reused silo proposed for the rear of the building, was heavily scrutinized by the Landmarks Commission, where it was granted a Certificate of Appropriateness last December. Planning Division staff believes that the conditions of approval recommended by the Landmarks Commission will sufficiently ensure that historic details related to the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District are addressed.

Planning Division staff recommends that the Plan Commission finds that the demolition standards can be met, and **approve** the request subject to input at the public hearing and conditions from reviewing agencies.

Recommendations and Proposed Conditions of Approval

Major/Non-Standard Conditions are shaded

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Heather Stouder, 266-5974)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the demolition standards can be met and **approve** the request subject to input at the public hearing and the following conditions:

Planning Division (Contact Heather Stouder, 266-5874)

- | |
|---|
| <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Final plans submitted for review and approval by staff will address all conditions of approval recommended by the Landmarks Commission on December 13, 2010. |
|---|

The following conditions have been submitted by reviewing agencies:

Zoning Administrator (Contact Pat Anderson, 266-5978)

2. Provide a reuse/recycling plan, to be reviewed and approved by the City's Recycling Coordinator, Mr. George Dreckmann, prior to a demolition permit being issued.

3. MGO Section 28.12(12)(e) requires the submittal of documentation demonstrating compliance with the approved reuse and recycling plan. Please note, the owner must submit documentation of recycling and reuse within 60 days of completion of demolition.
4. Final plans submitted for staff review and approval shall be consistent with the front and rear yard variances granted by the Zoning Board of Appeals on January 27, 2011.

Water Utility (Contact Dennis Cawley, 261-9243)

5. The Madison Water Utility shall be notified to remove the water meter prior to demolition. This property is not in a Wellhead Protection District. All wells located on this property shall be abandoned if no valid well operation permit has been obtained from the Madison Water Utility.

Fire Department (Contact Bill Sullivan, 266-4420)

6. Note: A residential fire sprinkler system may be installed in accordance with NFPA 13D and Comm 82.40(3)(e). Additional information is available at the Home Fire Sprinkler Coalition website:
<http://www.homefiresprinkler.org/Consumer/ConsHome.html>

City Engineering Division (Contact Janet Dailey, 261-9688)

This agency submitted a report with no conditions of approval for this request.

Traffic Engineering Division (Contact John Leach, 267-8755)

This agency submitted a report with no conditions of approval for this request.

Metro Transit (Contact Tim Sobota, 261-4289)

This agency did not submit a response for this request.