

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: July 12, 2006
TITLE: 22 East Dayton Street and 208 North Pinckney Street – PUD(GDP-SIP), Relocation of Existing Building, Seven Units. 4 th Ald. Dist. (04001)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: July 12, 2006	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Ald. Noel Radomski, Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Lisa Geer, Cathleen Feland, Robert March and Michael Barrett.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of July 12, 2006, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) for the project located at 22 East Dayton Street and 208 North Pinckney Street. Appearing on behalf of the project was John Sutton, architect and Gene Devitt of Capitol Neighborhoods. Following a review of the adjacent “First United Methodist Church” redevelopment of their properties in Block 91, Sutton provided an overview of an overall GDP for the properties within the same block owned by Scott Lewis involving the acquisition of a lot currently occupied by surface parking owned by the church to be the site of a relocated 7-unit apartment building currently at 18 East Dayton Street to be related to 208 North Pinckney Street. The overall PUD-GDP also provides for the future development of a 48-unit, five-story apartment building on the collective sites at 18 East Dayton Street (the former site of the 7-unit), the future demolition of a 2-unit at 24 East Dayton Street, in addition to the full restoration of a 2-unit structure at 206 North Pinckney Street. The plans as presented featured the following:

- A reconfiguration of a surface parking lot owned and utilized by the church with the relocation of the residential structure; also providing for shared access for the future residential development envisioned within the PUD-GDP off of Dayton Street.
- The lower level parking envisioned within the future residential building on East Dayton Street is provided with the option to interconnect with potential redevelopment of a proposed surface parking area located on the adjacent church’s property.
- Gene Devitt of Capitol Neighborhoods spoke in support of both the church’s redevelopment and Lewis’ development envisioned within the PUD(GDP-SIP) noting the relocation of a house provided for a uniform consistent residential character on Pinckney Street within the historic neighborhood.
- Sutton noted to the Commission that both the two-flat to remain and be refurbished and that proposed to be demolished would be maintained until the future SIP phase was formally approved.

Following the review of the plans, the Commission noted the following:

- Appreciate the setback provided along the western elevation of the future 5-story residential structure.
- The enhanced landscaping should be provided in combination with the church's development of the surface parking area.

ACTION:

On a motion by March, seconded by Geer, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (7-0). The motion required that the potential demolition of the 2-unit at 24 East Dayton Street shall not occur until formal approval of the future SIP for the development of the 5-story residential development has been approved.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6, 7.5, 8 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 22 East Dayton/208 North Pinckney Streets

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	8	8
	-	-	-	-	-	-	7	-
	-	7.5	-	-	-	-	-	7.5
	6	6	5	-	-	6	6	6
	7	-	-	-	-	-	9	8
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6

General Comments:

- House location seems like a win-win proposal.
- Good urban infill. No, this is a restoring of urban fabric.
- Approved with a strong dose of faith (no pun intended!) that this will proceed with continuing infill, especially at the corner.
- Add shrubs to screen parking from proposed 5-story apartment building. Add rain garden plants to planting plan to reflect grading, stormwater.
- Will improve the neighborhood.
- Nice infill – with relocation of existing residence rather than demolition.