



Project Name & Address: 505 S Dickinson Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District

Legistar File ID # [62823](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: January 5, 2021

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Scott Doughman, Home Depot

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of 17 windows.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. Height.
 - 2. Landscape treatment.
 - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
 - (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace 17 windows. The applicant provided a 3rd party assessment on the condition of the windows with the recommendation that they all be replaced. The proposed replacements appear to closely replicate the existing windows.

At the November 16, 2020, meeting the commission requested more information from the 3rd party assessment as it did not provide the necessary information. Staff received an update, which still lacked the necessary information for the commission’s consideration. Staff conferred with the person who did the 3rd party assessment of the windows and the contractor was uncertain about being able to provide the information the commission was asking for, but asserted that he would look into how to provide that information. The applicant has not had additional contact from the contractor and staff has not received any further documentation.

Several of these windows appear repairable, but quite a few of them do seem to be in need of repair. The applicant has proceeded in good faith with the process established by the commission. The contractor recommended by the Madison Trust did not provide the necessary information. The proposed window replacements do meet the commission’s standards as an appropriate replacement product. Staff recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the proposed replacement and staff will request that the Madison Trust remove this window repair contractor from their list for these types of projects.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) N/A
 - (b) No changes in the rhythm of solids and voids
 - (c) The proposed replacements adequately replicate the existing windows.
 - (d) N/A
 - (e) The sizes of the window components for the replacements are slightly different, but the differences in dimensions should be minimally noticeable.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met as the property owner has endeavored to comply with the window replacement process established by the commission, the 3rd party assessment recommends replacement, and staff recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the request as proposed.