

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: April 27, 2015

TITLE: 411 South Dickinson Street – Third
Lake Ridge Historic District – New
siding. 6th Ald. Dist.
Contact: Chris Jordan

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Amy Scanlon, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: April 27, 2015

ID NUMBER: 38054

Members present were: Erica Fox Gehrig, Chair; Christina Slattery, Jason Fowler, Marsha Rummel, and Michael Rosenblum.

SUMMARY:

Adam Tregre, and Chris Jordan, registering in support and wishing to speak.

Tregre explained that installing the siding will allow the house to be more in keeping with other homes in the historic district on the block. He explained that there is only one other house on the block that still has wood siding. There are the exact same shingles on another house in the neighborhood.

Slattery asked if there were other options for siding that would be compatible with the original historical character of the house because the proposed 6” exposure is not compatible.

Staff explained that some contractors put the foam insulation on the building, and then apply the siding. The proposed siding has the foam attached to the back so it’s easier to install. She explained that the texture of this building is created by all of the tight shadow lines of the narrow siding exposure and the scale that detail provides this little house. The 6” exposure siding will change the character dramatically.

Gehrig explained that the Commission admires that this house still has its original siding. She asked if the owners knew what it would cost to scrape the existing siding and replace the few rotted pieces.

Tregre explained that they did not investigate that information and that there is deteriorated wood all over the house.

Rosenblum explained that the siding looks nice as it is and that he would encourage them to keep that same look.

Staff asked if they had considered a Hardie board or similar product. She explained that the six inch exposure would change the appearance and the house would not have the same diminutive feel. She explained that the scallops are very important. In historic districts, essentially across the country, expect materials to be replaced in kind so in that case, if you would replace with cedar, I could administratively approve, but because this is Madison, we allow for other “compatible” materials and that’s what gets us into this trouble. We’re trying to maintain the historic character of the neighborhood using compatible materials that are only available in this area which puts the commission in a difficult spot.

There was general discussion about the treatment of the elements of the porch.

Rosenblum recommended they examine the feedback they received at the meeting and see if they can come up with some other alternatives whether its restoration/replacement and come back to a future meeting.

Jordan explained that they would do that and requested clear direction about appropriate treatment of the porch elements.

Staff explained that the replacement of the floor deck boards is something she typically administratively approves because it's not character defining as long as it's being replaced in kind.

Rosenblum explained that the preference would be to have the existing porch elements remain in place, but if there is significant damage to the wood and that element couldn't be retained, replacing with a material that is similar in appearance but matching existing details could be an option.

Gehrig asked the applicants to look into scraping and replacing the pieces that are rotted to see if it is possible in lieu of residing. She explained that there are other ways to install insulation and assumes there are houses on the street with vinyl siding over the original wood.

Slattery explained that for discussion purposes, it may be possible to leave the façade as is and install the proposed siding on the sides and back.

ACTION:

A motion was made by Rosenblum, seconded by Fowler to refer this to a future meeting. Motion passed by voice vote.