

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: December 2, 2009
TITLE: 4630-4672 East Washington Avenue - Sign Package for Previously Approved Project in UDD No. 5. 17th Ald. Dist. (16731)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: December 2, 2009	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Richard Wagner, Jay Ferm, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, Marsha Rummel, Dawn Weber and Ron Luskin.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of December 2, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a sign package located at 4630-4672 East Washington Avenue. Appearing on behalf of the project were Ryan Coffey and Sandra Mayer, representing SOFA Investments. Prior to the presentation staff noted that the commercial retail center located on the site was the subject of an addition to the original building's side and rear to provide for its expansion for flexible multiple tenant retail space as approved by the Commission in December of 2006, where consideration for signage was not provided; thus required to be considered by the Commission at this time. Staff noted that consideration of the uniform sign package as proposed did not request any adjustments or variances from the Street Graphics Ordinance, as well as the requirements for Urban Design District No. 5 where any deviation from the signage package as proposed required to meet or satisfy ordinance provisions would require additional considerations by the Commission. Coffey then presented details of the package noting the use of individual illuminated letters mounted on the raceway with letter faces either being red or white Plexiglas with an allowance for a tenant logo to include one additional color other than red or white. Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- The multi-tenant ground sign design seems inappropriate, could do a lot better, need to have more work to complement architecture, need to maintain viewability.

Continued discussion by the Commission concurred with issues relevant to the ground sign but noted lack of significance with its approval.

ACTION:

On a motion by Luskin, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (5-2) with Ferm and Rummel voting no. An amendment by Ferm, seconded by Rummel to require that the ground sign return for further consideration with modifications to better complement the building's architecture at the same time maintain viewability, failed on a vote of (2-5) with Rummel and Ferm in favor, and Wagner, Weber, Harrington, Luskin and Slayton voting no.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 4, 4, 5 and 5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 4630-4672 East Washington Avenue

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4

General Comments:

- Legal but uninspired design.