

AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: May 9, 2007
TITLE: 119, 123 & 125 North Butler Street and 120 & 124 North Hancock Street – PUD(GDP-SIP), Residential Redevelopment. 2 nd Ald. Dist. (06302)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: May 9, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Michael Barrett, Marsha Rummel, Bruce Woods, Robert March and Richard Slayton.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of May 9, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 119, 123 and 125 North Butler Street and 120 and 124 North Hancock Street. Appearing on behalf of the project was James McFadden. The project involves the redevelopment of four contiguous properties within the 100 Block of North Butler Street. Of the existing five buildings on the site two of the buildings will be retained along the property's Hancock Street frontage with one building to be relocated elsewhere and the remaining two to be demolished on the property's North Butler Street frontage. The combined relocation and demolitions will provide for the construction of a new four-story building at the rear of those buildings to be maintained with below grade parking access off of the property's Hancock Street frontage. The lower level parking structure will contain 38 parking stalls with the main entry to the new building facing North Butler Street. It is anticipated that the units will be predominantly one-bedroom with the building featuring broad balconies on the street side elevation with all units having balconies. Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Good effort at infilling. Provides access to lower level parking garage with open space on upper deck the Hancock buildings to be maintained.
- Front elevation is too active, consider the use of a shed dormer in the recessed center between gabled bookends.
- Beautiful architecture referencing the vernacular of the area, concern with precedent of tearing down for the neighborhood, one building taking up three lots where area features one building per lot.
- Concern with the fit of a big building as it relates to the scale of the area.
- Could be persuaded based on green amenities.
- Concern with wall on front elevation Butler Street.
- Concern with precedent of project, it changes the rhythm and voids at the street that currently exists with existing buildings within the block, the project will change this relationship. Project is not proportional in scale.
- Access to the 38 stalls located off of a narrow driveway between existing buildings will create a lot of coming and going; consider alternative on Butler Street.
- The wall at Butler Street in plan view curves with everything else being square; consider alternatives.

- Lower the parking level as much as possible; to facilitate the design outdoor space above parking deck.
- The main problem with the project if you look at the block plan; the building will disrupt view and open space core at midblock and establish a development pattern inconsistent with that which exists within the block as a whole.
- Question where rain garden will be everything being concrete.
- The project creates a big block amongst single-family/two-story neighborhood.
- On return for further consideration provide views and cross-sections of entire site as it relates to the block as a whole and adjacent block faces of both existing and proposed development, in addition to providing context photos of all surrounding development including adjacent block faces.
- Generally like, great job relevant to architecture, difficult to conceive the rental units framing the access drive.
- Something about the brick building is intriguing, sad to be going along with the loss of carriage house at rear; a piece of history that will be lost, something similar could be developed instead of a big block building approach.
- Concern with the footprint not the streetscape, consider reducing scale of building.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION**, no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 4, 4, 6, 6 and 7.5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 119, 123 & 125 North Butler Street and 120 & 124 North Hancock Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	7.5	-	-	-	-	7	-
	6	7	-	-	-	6	6	6
	5	7	-	-	-	7	9	7.5
	-	6	-	-	-	-	6	-
	4	4	4	-	-	-	5	4
	5	7	-	-	-	5	6	6
	2	4	5	5	-	6	5	4

General Comments:

- Nice job. Really nice job.
- Although with the central 3rd peak, the front façade is a little over active, this project is an appropriate infill on this site. We need to see internal block views to be able to judge the project’s impact as to bulk.
- Good use of terrain (very good parking). Opportunity to create outdoor space over parking is important to “exploit”.
- Higher density but well suited to neighborhood.
- Nice architectural detailing, but it does seem massive in its footprint since it fills the lot from front to back.
- Disrupts rhythms and voids of intact street and open backyards. Concern over parking exit between Hancock house. Reuse carriage house if possible.
- The precedent is worrisome. The issue of scale is very important. Making this a truly green project might help mitigate the bulk. That includes solar, geothermal, rain gardens and greenspace (including trees over the parking).