



Project Name/Address: 411 S Dickinson
Application Type: Exterior alteration in the Third Lake Ridge historic district
Legistar File ID # [38054](#)
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: May 7, 2015, *Revised and corrected May 13, 2015*

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Chris Jordan
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed exterior alteration which includes the replacement of siding in a historic district.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Section:

33.19(11)(i) Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.

1. Alteration of any existing structure shall be evaluated according to all criteria listed in Sec. 33.19(11)(g).
2. Alteration of the surface material, pattern and texture in the facade(s) of any existing structures shall be compatible with the original or existing historical finishes.
3. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain or be compatible with the original or existing historical rhythm of masses and spaces.
4. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain the existing historical landscape plan or shall develop a new plan which is compatible with the plans of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
5. Alteration of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

33.19(11)(g) Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Commercial Use.

1. Alterations of the height of any existing structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
2. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical rhythm of solids and voids.
3. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
4. Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.

Analysis and Conclusion

As described in the submission materials, the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the existing siding and install new siding on the residence at 411 S Dickinson. Because the applicant is requesting removal of the siding, it may not be necessary to have the related trim elements built out in new material.

A brief discussion of the criteria of 33.19(11)(i) follows:

1. Alteration of any existing structure shall be evaluated according to all criteria listed in Sec. 33.19(11)(g). Those criteria are listed below:
 1. The overall height of the building is not being changed.
 2. The street facade of the residence will retain all existing windows and doors in their existing sizes.
 3. The historical materials of the front façade will be removed and replaced with new materials. The existing beveled siding is proposed to be replaced with new siding with a similar exposure. The scalloped shingle siding will be replaced with scalloped shingle siding. All trim boards, frieze boards and skirt boards will remain as architectural details. The soffit and fascia boards will be made of vinyl elements.
 4. The existing main roof form is being retained.
2. The historical materials of the front façade will be removed and replaced with new materials. The existing beveled siding is proposed to be replaced with new siding with a wider exposure. The scalloped shingle siding will be replaced with scalloped shingle siding. All trim boards, frieze boards and skirt boards will remain as architectural details. The soffit and fascia boards will be constructed of vinyl elements.
3. The proposed alteration retains the historical rhythm of masses and spaces.
4. The proposed alteration does not alter the existing landscape.
5. The door and windows of the street facade(s) are not being altered.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the alterations to the exterior are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request with the following conditions of approval:

- ~~1. The siding exposure shall be more similar to the existing exposure.~~
2. The scalloped shingle siding shall be similar in size to the existing scalloped shingle siding.
3. The applicant shall confirm that all trim boards, frieze board and skirt boards will remain as architectural details and shall describe how they will be treated. ~~Staff assumes the existing trim and architectural details will remain and will not be built out or wrapped.~~
4. The existing details of the soffit and fascia shall remain. ~~The applicant shall describe how the proposed aluminum wrap will work with and terminate against the existing architectural details of the soffit and fascia.~~