

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: August 22, 2012

TITLE: 1 West Dayton Street – Comprehensive
Design Review, Madison Concourse Hotel.
4th Ald. Dist. (27331)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: August 22, 2012

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Richard Slayton, Marsha Rummel, Dawn O’Kroley, John Harrington, Cliff Goodhart, Dawn O’Kroley and Melissa Huggins.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of August 22, 2012, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a Comprehensive Design Review located at 1 West Dayton Street, limited to first floor and parking directional signage only. Appearing on behalf of the project were Mary Beth Growney Selene, representing Ryan Signs, Inc.; Barb LaVoy, Joan Herzing and Stephen Zaroni. Growney Selene provided a detailed overview of the sign package that consists of various first floor level wall signs, a parking directional identification projecting sign, canopy signs along with upper story wall signs. Zaroni spoke on various issues that underlay the need for elements of the signage package as proposed. Comments by the Commission were as follows:

- Signs #6 and 7, the high signs on the building’s façade have issues.
- Concerns with the amount of pedestrian level signs; prefer larger signs with a lesser amount of signage but alright as proposed.
- The incorporation of a black frame around all signs at the first and lower story levels would add punch.
- Question the use of lots of small signs and why they are needed.
- The large signs in combination with small signs are excessive.
- Sign #6 is the biggest problem; out of character with the building s well as the downtown area.
- No problem with ground plane signs; tower signage is the issue, concern with precedent setting issues in regards to the Capitol Square.

ACTION:

On a motion by DeChant, seconded by Harrington, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-1) with O’Kroley voting no. The motion provided for approval of ground level signage, less Sign #1.4; not Signs #6 and 7 and modifications to Sign #4 to straighten arrow along with the finding that the standards for Comprehensive Design Review have been met.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 6 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1 West Dayton Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	6	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	6	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	5

General Comments:

- Encourage study of a comprehensive package with larger perpendicular canopy signage to identify the building for both pedestrians and vehicles. Omit high signage and possibly some smaller signage.
- Street level signs – too numerous but decent design. Tall signs set poor precedent downtown.
- Sign #6 is out of context.
- Ground level signs make sense. Upper level signage precedent setting.
- Signs 6 & 7 inappropriate for downtown location.