

AGENDA # 2

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION	PRESENTED: December 5, 2011
TITLE: 723 State Street – Development adjacent to a Local Landmark – St. Paul Catholic Center and Residential College Redevelopment. Contact: Robert Shipley, AIA (20329)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Amy Scanlon, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: December 5, 2011	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Stu Levitan, Chair; Erica Gehrig, Vice Chair; Robin Taylor, Christina Slattery, and David McLean. Michael Rosenblum was excused.

SUMMARY:

Ron Trachtenburg, 33 E. Main, registered in support and wishing to speak. Trachtenburg introduced the project team. Mark Landgraf is the contractor's representative, Robert Shipley is the local architect, the designing architect is Randy Milgref, Matthew Alderman is the designer, Jeff Carls is Associate Director at St. Pauls, and Eric Neilson is the Pastor. Mr. Trachtenburg explained the project team would like a finding from the Landmarks Commission that the proposal does not impact the adjacent landmark. Mr. Shipley presented the proposed project. He explained that the architecture of the 1930's is the inspiration for the proposal. Mr. Shipley stated that the building is in the Romanesque Revival style. Shipley explained the basic layout and massing. He explained that the student center would open directly onto the State Street Mall. The student center and other major functions are organized in the taller mass. The service core is located to the side near the Pres House and the massing of that element steps down toward the Pres House.

There is general discussion about the proposal.

The Secretary noted that the area for the art piece is flat not concave. Mr. Shipley explained that the materials will consist of cut stone at the base, brownish red brick and cast stone on the upper details. He stated that there is no EIFS in the project.

The Secretary explained the staff report. She noted that the proposal was not found to be "so large", but it was found to be "visually intrusive" to the adjacent landmark. She explained that there are many traditional styles incorporated into the proposed design and suggested that the Commission recommend a more unified architectural expression.

There was general discussion about whether a strictly interpreted traditional style should be used. The Secretary stated that the Commission should discuss whether the design composition overpowers or "adversely affects" the adjacent landmark.

Fred Mohs, 512 Wisconsin Avenue, registered in support. He stated he had reservations about the previous scheme due mostly to height. He likes this plan, but thinks a simpler design would be best. He explained that the project team should be daring in use of detail but try to get the style right.

The Secretary asked if the building was so large and visually intrusive to affect the landmark. She reminded the Commission that details are not the issue before the Commission. Levitan agreed that the design is affecting the character and integrity of the landmark. McLean thinks the Pres House disappears in the foreground and that the proposal has too much mass and borders on being intrusive. McLean stated that he prefers that the service core mass be removed. He agrees that the design could be simpler and that Landmarks Commission should leave the actual design decisions to the Urban Design Commission.

Randy Milgref, design architect for R & G Planning and Design, brought photographs. He explained that the precedent they used is based on a number of projects utilizing the Romanesque Revival style and details. He said that the Pres House has detailing that you could argue may be too much or too little in the interpretation of the Neo-gothic style from the 1930's. He explained that the design goal is to get as many workable spaces and natural light into the proposed building. He explained that they are strongly considering a reddish brown hand molded brick.

There was general discussion about the design and the architectural expression and if those combined issues translated into an adverse affect on the adjacent landmark.

Mark Landgraf, 5964 Executive Drive, representing St. Paul's Catholic Center, appeared in support and available to answer questions.

Ron Trachtenberg, 33 East Main #300, representing St. Paul's Catholic Center, appeared in support

Jason Tish, 2714 LaFollette Avenue, representing Madison Trust for Historic Preservation, wishing to speak

Eric Nielsen, 129 W. Gorham, representing St. Paul's Catholic Center, appeared in support

Robert Shipley, 2211 Rowley Avenue, representing BW2 Architects, 2211 Parmenter Street, Middleton on behalf of St. Paul's Catholic Center, appeared in support

ACTION:

A motion was made by Gehrig, seconded by Taylor, that the Landmarks Commission does not find the proposal so large that it has an adverse affect on the historic character and integrity of the adjacent landmark. However, the Landmarks Commission does recommend to the Plan Commission and Urban Design Commission that a more unified architectural expression for the building be pursued. The motion passed by a vote vote/other.

Ayes: Taylor, Gehrig, McLean; Noes: Slattery; Non-Voting: Levitan, Excused: Rummel, Rosenblum.