



Project Name & Address: Lot adjacent to 1103 Jenifer Street and 511 S Ingersoll Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for the relocation of a house

Legistar File ID # [66287](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: July 20, 2021

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Eric Welch

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the relocation of a house to a newly created lot adjacent to 1103 Jenifer Street and 511 S Ingersoll Street.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are

located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)

- (a) Gross Volume.
- (b) Height.
- (c) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facades.
- (d) Materials used in the street facades.
- (e) The design of the roof.
- (f) The rhythm of buildings and masses.
- (g) Directional expression.
- (h) Materials, patterns and textures.
- (i) Landscape treatment.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to relocate a house from 151 W Wilson Street to a newly created lot adjacent to 1103 Jenifer Street. The structure currently located at 151 W Wilson St was constructed in 1911 as a 3-story apartment building. As is typical of corner buildings, it is taller than the adjacent structures, which are largely 2 and 2 ½ story buildings. The proposed new location in Third Lake Ridge consists of structures that range in date from 1870s to 1930s, with a concentration of them being 1890s-1910s. In terms of style and date of construction, this building would blend with this block in Third Lake Ridge. The existing residential structures on the block range from single-story to the three-story structure at 1102 Spaight St, which most structures within 200 feet being 2 ½ stories. This structure will have a similar overall height to the structures at 1103 Jenifer and 1102 Spaight and have a similar massing.

The application materials show how this relocated structure would look in the new setting. This building will fill most of the new parcel. As part of the process for redeveloping these properties, the proposal is also proceeding through a land use process that will address new zoning in addition to the land division.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) N/A
 - (b) N/A
 - (c) While this is an existing structure, it will still need to meet the construction standards for the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.
 - (d) The structure at 151 W Wilson had previously been identified as a potential landmark. A relocation to a historic district would allow the City to conserve a historic structure and allow for ongoing preservation by placing it in a historic district, thus supporting the public interest in preservation of historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)

- (a) The application materials do not provide specific numbers on gross volume. However, the visuals do provide the context of the volume of this structure in relation to the immediately adjacent structures. The total living area for 151 W Wilson is 3987 sq ft, 4220 sq ft for 1102 Spaight, 2482 sq ft for 1112 Spaight, 2224 sq ft for 1111 Jenifer St. the Assessor information for 511 Ingersoll and 1103 Jenifer use Primary Floor Area (which includes finished basements) instead of living area (which excludes finished basements), so the PFA for 1103 Jenifer is 5893 sq ft and at 511 Ingersoll it is 3691 sq ft. This building would be comparable to the two corner properties on this block, but larger than the other adjacent properties.
- (b) At 3-stories, this building will look taller than most of the other structures in the vicinity. However, many of the historic structures within 200 feet make extensive use of dormers for finished attic areas above their second story. The building will be of comparable height to the two corner properties on this end of the block.
- (c) As a building constructed within the period of significance of the historic district, it has similar architectural features to most structures in the district and on this block, including the proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street façade.
- (d) The structure uses similar materials used in the street façade, which are largely wood, with a brick foundation.
- (e) The hipped roof form with centrally located dormers is common in the Third Lake Ridge historic district. The arched-style dormers are unusual for the district.
- (f) This lot previously contained a residential structure. The siting of this building would maintain the contextual setback of structures on the block face. The mass of the building would largely fill the existing lot, which is more common for properties on the side streets than those on the primary streets in the district, but the mass of the structure will be located towards the front of this longer lot, with an open area in the back of the parcel, which is typical of these longer lots.
- (g) The vertical orientation of the directional expression is in keeping with the historic resources in the vicinity.
- (h) This structure has similar materials, patterns and textures as historic resources within 200 feet.
- (i) With a contextual setback, this structure will have a similar front yard configuration as the other residential structures within 200 feet.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the request as proposed.