

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: July 10, 2013

TITLE: 5802 Odana Road – Comprehensive Design Review in UDD No. 3/Street Graphics Exception for an Additional Ground Sign for “Don Miller Mazda.” 19th Ald. Dist. (17567)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: July 10, 2013

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Chair; Tom DeChant, Henry Lufler, John Harrington, Richard Slayton, Lauren Cnare and Cliff Goodhart.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of July 10, 2013, the Urban Design Commission **PLACED ON FILE** a Comprehensive Design Review in UDD No. 3 located at 5802 Odana Road. Appearing on behalf of the project were Tim Ascher and Don T. Miller. Ground signs were previously approved at a 2010 meeting. They are now requesting a third ground monument sign as an amendment to the previously approved sign package. The new ground sign is consistent in size and design with the existing ground signs. They are also requesting a variance to the 20-foot setback; the existing signs are set at about an 11-foot setback. The Secretary noted that when the two existing ground signs were originally approved they were given consideration for the setback exception from the provisions of UDD No. 3. Harrington felt there was too much signage at this location as was already approved with the original site plan that did not allow for a third ground sign as currently proposed.

ACTION:

On a motion by Cnare, seconded by Harrington, the Urban Design Commission **PLACED ON FILE** the request for additional signage, noting the application did not meet the standards for Comprehensive Design Review which was at issue with the previous approval. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-0).

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 5802 Odana Road

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	6	-	6	6
	-	-	-	-	4	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	5

General Comments:

- Too high density, visual confusion.