

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION	PRESENTED: December 15, 2014
TITLE: 105 North Spooner Street – University Heights Historic district – Siding replacement. 5 th Ald. Dist. Contact: Tom Karras (36057)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Amy Scanlon, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: December 15, 2014	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Stu Levitan, Chair; Erica Fox Gehrig, Vice Chair; Christina Slattery, Jason Fowler, and Michael Rosenblum. Marsha Rummel and David McLean were excused.

SUMMARY:

Ben Lindberg, registering in support and wishing to speak. Lindberg brought samples of numerous siding materials and explained the installation challenges for each material. Lindberg explained that the existing crown molding and apron board will remain in place and the proposed siding and insulation will terminate below the apron board. The proposed termination strip will extend past the face of the apron board by approximately 5/8". Lindberg explained that the existing window trim will be clad in aluminum to mimic the existing trim profile.

Levitan asked if the staff report comments were addressed by the proposed work. Staff confirmed that the comments have been addressed in the discussions.

ACTION:

A motion was made by Rosenblum, seconded by Fowler, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the conditions of approval in the staff report and with a condition of approval that any on site conditions that have not been specifically approved in this review should be discussed with staff before proceeding with the work. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

AGENDA # 2

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION	PRESENTED: December 15, 2014
TITLE: 1018 Williamson Street – Third Lake Ridge Historic District – Demolition of residence. 6 th Ald. District. Contact: Jim Glueck, Glueck Architects (35572)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Amy Scanlon, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: December 15, 2014	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Stu Levitan, Chair; Erica Fox Gehrig, Vice Chair; Christina Slattery, Jason Fowler, and Michael Rosenblum. Marsha Rummel and David McLean were excused.

SUMMARY:

Staff provided an update on the progress toward the sale of 1018 Williamson.

ACTION:

No action taken.

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION	PRESENTED: December 15, 2014
TITLE: 114 Bedford Street – Multi-family Housing Adjacent to a Landmark – Doyle Administration Building. 4th Ald. District. Contact: Melissa Huggins (36432)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Amy Scanlon, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: December 15, 2014	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Stu Levitan, Chair; Erica Fox Gehrig, Vice Chair; Christina Slattery, Jason Fowler, and Michael Rosenblum. Marsha Rummel and David McLean were excused.

SUMMARY:

Melissa Huggins representing CA Ventures, registering in support and wishing to speak.

Christopher Johnson, representing CA Ventures, registering in support and wishing to speak.

Joe Herzog registering neither in support nor opposition

Tim Chinnock, registering in support, wishing to speak and available to answer questions.

Huggins explained that the project team would appreciate receiving comments from the Landmarks Commission. Johnson briefly introduced the project and project team. Chinnock and Herzog explained the proposed design considerations, massing, building siting, interior layout, materials and context.

Staff explained that this project requires conditional use approvals and that Planning Division staff did not feel that the conditional use standards were being met by the proposed design so a letter was sent by Director Cover to request that the project not begin the approval process. The proposed project received an Informational Presentation. The Landmarks Commission generally discussed the proposed project related to the adjacency ordinance language (28.144) and provided the following comments:

Levitan explained that more design relationship to the Washington Grade School would be appreciated, but not to the level of being reductive. The curved glass corners show respect to the Washington Grade School, but that design feature should be better rendered. The construction of the proposed building would promote the erosion of the Mifflin neighborhood by accelerating the neighborhood redevelopment process. The use and placement of brick is successful in design.

Gehrig explained that the proposed building is far enough away from the Washington Grade School and that the proposed massing and overall building appearance does not seem too large or visually intrusive. The design of the proposed building sits nicely adjacent to the Art Deco inspired landmark.

Slattery explained that design details are not in the purview of the Landmarks Commission and that the proposed building seems too large for the context and the landmark. Some height would be fine, but it is currently too large and the design (massing, setback and materials) needs to better relate to the landmark building.

Rosenblum explained that the proposed building is too large and visually intrusive. The height should be reduced to be more appropriate to the landmarks and to the context. The context of the Mifflin neighborhood is worth retaining. The reasoning behind the massing decisions are logical, but the building is too large.

Fowler explained that he agreed with most of the comments that had been made by the other Commission members and that adding more brick might make the building look bigger. Appreciates the current articulation of the large mass.

Alder Verveer arrived as the discussion was concluding and did not provide any comments.

ACTION:

No action was taken.

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION	PRESENTED: December 15, 2014
TITLE: Buildings Proposed for Demolition – 2014 (32607)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Amy Scanlon, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: December 15, 2014	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Stu Levitan, Chair; Erica Fox Gehrig, Vice Chair; Christina Slattery, Jason Fowler, and Michael Rosenblum. Marsha Rummel and David McLean were excused.

SUMMARY:

ACTION:

A motion was made by Rosenblum, seconded by Gehrig, to convey to the Plan Commission that the Landmarks Commission regrets the loss of historic fabric and the appropriate scale of the existing building adjacent to the residential neighborhood regarding 2503 University; finds that there is no known historic value regarding 840 Hughes, but that the existing building contributes to the consistent neighborhood context; and finds that the building at 2583 University is a classic service station model of mid-century design. The motion passed by voice vote/other.