



City of Madison

City of Madison
Madison, WI 53703
www.cityofmadison.com

Meeting Minutes - Approved URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

Wednesday, September 16, 2009

4:30 PM

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.
LL-110 (Madison Municipal Building)

CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

Mark Smith arrived during consideration of Item #6.

Present: 9 -

Marsha A. Rummel; Dawn O. Weber; Todd R. Barnett; Bruce F. Woods;
Richard L. Slayton; John A. Harrington; Ronald S. Luskin; R. Richard
Wagner and Jay B. Ferm

Excused: 1 -

Mark M. Smith

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

**A motion was made by Slayton, seconded by Harrington, to Approve the
Minutes of September 2, 2009. The motion passed by the following vote:**

Excused: 1 -

Mark M. Smith

Ayes: 7 -

Marsha A. Rummel; Dawn O. Weber; Todd R. Barnett; Richard L.
Slayton; John A. Harrington; Ronald S. Luskin and R. Richard Wagner

Abstentions: 1 -

Jay B. Ferm

Non Voting: 1 -

Bruce F. Woods

PUBLIC COMMENT

- Rosemary Lee

September 16, 2009

COMMENTS TO UDC ON SUBWAY SIGN ON WEST MAIN

Dear Commissioners,

This evening I come to ask for your help with the garish sign and awning that are now on the exterior front facade of Subway's new location in the 1 block of West Main Street. I became aware of it recently when walking up State & Carroll Streets to the Capitol Square on a beautiful summer afternoon. I could see it as soon as I got to the top of State Street. I was appalled to think that any City decision makers had authorized it. The workmen were in Subway finishing the builtout. I asked if anyone from Subway Company was there. There was so I asked if Subway had City approval for the gaudy sign. When the answer was yes I expressed my distress that the City had permitted the flashy awning and the huge backlit sign above it. The response was that the signage was expensive. I replied that I didn't care how much it cost because it was an atrocity to install it on a facade facing our beautiful Capitol Square, the gem of our city. I also informed the gentleman that both the State and City are spending millions of dollars to improve and beautify the entire Square area. I mentioned that the other businesses on the 1 block had very low-key and tasteful signage. The Subway employee could not understand my points and gave me the impression that he didn't care about the aesthetics of the Capitol Square area. Because of what I consider the poor attitude

of Subway I am strongly encouraging everyone I know to boycott them. You who know me will understand how outraged I was. Because I had never seen the Subway signage on any UDC, Plan Commission or other City committee agenda my next stop was, you guessed it, the Plan Department. One of the professional staff was kind enough to talk to me. I asked if I had missed the Subway signage on an agenda. I was told no that permission for the awning and sign were granted by an administrative signoff.

Now, I would like to know if there is any action this commission can take to remedy the situation either by a review of the signoff or an order that Subway must reduce the candlepower of the lit sign and that it must be off no later than 9:00pm 365 nights a year. Please help me solve the problem of this ostentatious blight on our square.

THANK YOU!!!

SECRETARY'S REPORT

SPECIAL ITEM OF BUSINESS

- 1. [15783](#) Creating New Section 33.24(15) and renumbering Current Section 33.24(15) to Section 33.24(16) to establish Urban Design District No. 8 and amending Section 33.24(11)(b) of the Madison General Ordinances to move properties from Urban Design District No. 4 to Urban Design District No. 8.

The motion required the following:

- The "Landscape and Open Space" provisions in Section 33.24(15)(e)5.a. shall be amended to address the need for uniform standards for canopy trees on the street facade to establish a minimum and maximum height, standard spacing and size in order to provide a street face dominated by canopy trees.
- Section 33.24(15)(e)7.b.v., Guidelines shall be modified as follows: "Franchise businesses **may be required** to modify their corporate designs, if necessary, to fit the District's character.

A motion was made by Luskin, seconded by Rummel, to RECOMMEND TO COUNCIL TO ADOPT - PUBLIC HEARING. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

- 2. [10903](#) 2202-2300 South Park Street - Amendment to the "Comprehensive Design Review" Sign Plan for the Villager Mall Atrium in Urban Design District No. 7. 14th Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by Wagner, seconded by Rummel, to Refer to the URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION. The motion passed by the following vote:

Excused: 1 -
Mark M. Smith

Ayes: 7 -
Marsha A. Rummel; Dawn O. Weber; Todd R. Barnett; Richard L. Slayton; John A. Harrington; R. Richard Wagner and Jay B. Ferm

Abstentions: 1 -
Ronald S. Luskin

Non Voting: 1 -
Bruce F. Woods

3. [15800](#) 515 South Park Street - Building Addition, "La Hacienda" In Urban Design District No. 7. 13th Ald. Dist.
- The motion provided for details of the existing building's architecture to be incorporated into the addition as appropriate, adjustments of the north elevation arch and spring point, and an examination of stormwater management on the site per the comments to be reviewed and approved by staff. The motion provided for details of the existing building's architecture to be incorporated into the addition as appropriate, adjustments of the north elevation arch and spring point, and an examination of stormwater management on the site per the comments to be reviewed and approved by staff.
- A motion was made by Weber, seconded by Luskin, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**
4. [15916](#) 3322 Agriculture Drive - Four Building Addition to the Danisco USA, Inc. Facility in Urban Design District No.1. 16th Ald. Dist.
- The motion provided for initial approval on the south parking lot to include additional tree islands at an interval of 12 stalls, a redo of the landscape plan and favor the use of more canopy trees rather than a solid screen. Canopy trees should be provided along the southerly parking lot's easterly side as well as a double row of canopy trees along its westerly side adjacent to existing surface parking. Canopy trees shall be shade trees. In addition the use of "no mow" grasses are required to be utilized in favor of formal lawn as much as possible. Future consideration shall provide for a reexamination of the fire access on the northerly portion of the site to reduce pavement in addition to the grouping of windows and precast panels as well as future separate consideration of permanent screening and signage.
- A motion was made by Slayton, seconded by Rummel, to Grant Initial Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**
5. [15355](#) 6225 University Avenue - GDP-SIP, Building Demolition and New Office Development in Urban Design District No. 6. 19th Ald. Dist.
- Referred at staff's request to resolve ownership issues.
- A motion was made by Slayton, seconded by Harrington, to Refer to the URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

ROLL CALL

Present: 10 -

Marsha A. Rummel; Mark M. Smith; Dawn O. Weber; Todd R. Barnett; Bruce F. Woods; Richard L. Slayton; John A. Harrington; Ronald S. Luskin; R. Richard Wagner and Jay B. Ferm

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

6. [14907](#) 400 Block State Street - Lisa Link Peace Park Improvements in the C4 District. 4th Ald. Dist.
- A motion was made by Luskin, seconded by Wagner, to Grant Final Approval. The motion was amended by Barnett, seconded by Rummel, to require six foot benches. On a vote of (5-2-1) with Luskin, Harrington and Wagner voting no; with Barnett, Rummel, Slayton, Weber, voting yes, with Smith abstaining. The main motion passed by the following vote:**

Ayes: 5 -

Richard L. Slayton; John A. Harrington; Ronald S. Luskin; R. Richard Wagner and Dawn O. Weber

Noes: 2 -
Todd R. Barnett and Marsha A. Rummel

Abstentions: 1 -
Mark M. Smith

Non Voting: 2 -
Bruce F. Woods and Jay B. Ferm

7. [05667](#) 8133 Mansion Hill Avenue - Signage Package, Amended PUD(GDP-SIP) for a Nursery School/DayCare. 1st Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by Barnett, seconded by Weber, to Refer to the URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

8. [15685](#) 1802 Maple Crest Drive - Hawk's Landing Golf Club Lot 53 - PUD(GDP-SIP) Allowing for the Replacement of Fifteen 6-Unit Buildings with Fourteen Duplex Units and Seven 10-Unit Buildings. 1st Ald. Dist.

The Urban Design Commission Received an Informational Presentation

9. [15686](#) 1252 Williamson Street - PUD(GDP-SIP) for a Mixed-Use Building with 31 Residential Units and 2,400 Square Feet of Commercial Space. 6th Ald. Dist.

The motion provided:

- That the rain garden needs to be redesigned with a more deliberate form. Suggestions to relate to the configuration of the adjoining patio.
- The encouragement for the Parks Street Trees Division to utilize canopy trees along the Baldwin Street elevation.
- Detail and study the design for the trellis feature vs. the archway feature off of the southern corner of the building along Williamson Street.
- Provide for the use of more yellow and purple within the prairie drop seed mix.
- Reincorporate the use of cantilevers where possible along the Williamson Street elevation.

A motion was made by Slayton, seconded by Luskin, to Grant Initial Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

10. [13649](#) 430 and 434 South Thornton Avenue/1526 Jenifer Street/430 Cantwell Court - PUD-SIP to Renovate 3 Existing 4-Unit Structures and Construct a New 2-Unit Structure. 6th Ald. Dist.

The motion provided that the house not be moved until certificates of Occupancy have been granted by the Inspection Division on the three buildings remaining on the site currently under renovation for unless a building code issue precludes any unit's occupancy. In addition, look at architecture to provide lintels and sill details on both the new building and new openings on the three buildings currently under renovation.

A motion was made by Slayton, seconded by Barnett, to Grant Initial Approval. The motion passed by the following vote:

Ayes: 5 -
Mark M. Smith; Dawn O. Weber; Todd R. Barnett; Richard L. Slayton and John A. Harrington

Noes: 3 -
Ronald S. Luskin; R. Richard Wagner and Marsha A. Rummel

Non Voting: 2 -
Bruce F. Woods and Jay B. Ferm

11. [13650](#) 1144 and 1148 Jenifer Street - PUD-SIP to Move a 2-Unit Structure Onto a Vacant Lot and Make Alterations to an Existing 2-Unit Structure. 6th Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by Barnett, seconded by Slayton, to Grant Initial Approval. The motion passed by the following vote:

Ayes: 5 -
Dawn O. Weber; Todd R. Barnett; Richard L. Slayton; John A. Harrington and Mark M. Smith

Noes: 3 -
Ronald S. Luskin; R. Richard Wagner and Marsha A. Rummel

Non Voting: 2 -
Bruce F. Woods and Jay B. Ferm

NEW BUSINESS

12. [15974](#) 30 North Mills Street - UW Physical Plant Office and Shops Building, Advisory Recommendation for a Conditional Use. 8th Ald. Dist.
The motion emphasized the need to address landscaping comments, provide windows in the stair towers and a change in plane in the windows as much as possible, continue to review the parking arranging for more efficiency, provide a break area adjacent to the break room, and modify the north and south elevations where they abut the rear west elevation to eliminate the cold spot, extend and thicken wingwalls at corners, and the incorporation of a canopy over portions of the west elevation.

A motion was made by Smith, seconded by Barnett, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

BUSINESS BY MEMBERS

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Wagner, seconded by Smith, to Adjourn at 11:52 p.m. The motion passed by voice vote/other.