

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

**REPORT OF:** URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION      **PRESENTED:** March 19, 2014

**TITLE:** 711 State Street - Exterior Remodeling in  
the Downtown Core, "Subway." 8th Ald.  
Dist. (33310)      **REFERRED:**

**REREFERRED:**  
**REPORTED BACK:**

**AUTHOR:** Alan J. Martin, Secretary      **ADOPTED:**      **POF:**

**DATED:** March 19, 2014      **ID NUMBER:**

---

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Chair; Richard Slayton, Dawn O’Kroley, Cliff Goodhart and John Harrington.

**SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of March 19, 2014, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of exterior remodeling in the Downtown Core located at 711 State Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Bill Montelbano, Pat McGowan, representing the University Book Store; and Vimal Patel. Plans are for a 12-foot deep, 35-foot long space in front of the UW Bookstore on Library Mall that would allow outdoor seating for a Subway restaurant that is going into their basement. There would be access out from the restaurant to the eating area, as well as a stair down from the sidewalk into that area. The railing along the sidewalk would be painted steel to match the finish on the existing window frames. A new retaining wall would be installed along the sidewalk; the other three are existing foundation walls. Once they excavate they may have to cover but the intent is to match the existing finish on the building. With State Street and Library Mall under construction this is the prime time to excavate this space.

Staff noted that this is going to the Plan Commission as a conditional use for an outdoor eating area. There are issues with the signage package that haven’t been clarified. Signs are usually where your entrance is located and pertinent to your space. The issue with Zoning is where they are proposing the signs, below the window or on the wing walls; both may not be appropriate based on the entranceway.

Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- Hearing this description today, that’s not what I thought this was. You think of an entrance into a Subway, descending, get a cool modern fence and modern signage integrated in your fence, not stuck on your building. If you were going to Subway I would run down the stairs, grab a sub, you give it to me in a bag, I’m not going to sit and eat in the Subway in a cavern. If I could get back up to grade and you had a little fence on grade if you want an outdoor eating area, sit in the mall. I don’t want to sit in the depressed area.

- The other concern I have is this small glass opening versus what that depressed area is like. If you really want to make that basement space usable, it seems to me you need much more light. The Pres House lower level works because it has a lot of light. This looks like a basement, not a lower level.
- This is creepy, scary to me. It's not visible enough from the interior.
  - We would commit to put all glass in there with doorways because I think it would look better. But in reality if we're going to dig it out we might as well make it as visual as possible.
- If you had a gate that closed when you closed at the top of the stair, I don't know if that's a good thing.
- Instead of sitting and eating down there, maybe a landscape rock garden that you walk through and walk back out through, instead of expect to be sitting in a pit.
- It would fit better with the mall in general if your sign was simple. You're not driving by this.
- Any chance you could do a glass rail?
- Something that doesn't emulate wood.
- (Staff) You're giving a lot of recommendations, and what they're going to the PC for is strictly the outdoor eating area, so if we do anything we do two motions. If we aren't objecting to the outdoor eating area based on input from this Commission about its final design, we should make that recommendation. They can come back with their final design and address these comments. That allows them to take care of the land use decision which they're on the schedule for.
- There's not room to do what you want to do there.
  - Yes, the bookstore actually hangs out about 4-feet into that space.
- Maybe a dumbwaiter.
- What if you got rid of the tables down below and you just have a landscape feature down below. What if you slid your stair east and you actually have a little terrace area at grade, right next to the bookstore entry, you could have a table there. You only need 5-feet at the bottom of the landing. Put your door way east.
- I'm thinking about "Cheers" with a stairway going down but the activity needs to be in the store and this is just a passageway. I think you can make a bigger deal up at the top.
- 

## **ACTION:**

On a motion by Harrington, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (4-0). The motion provided for address of the comments relative to design options and signage.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall rating for this project is 3.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 711 State Street**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	3