

## AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	<b>PRESENTED:</b> April 9, 2008
TITLE: Tenney Park Shelter – Public Building. Ald. Dist. 2. (07628)	<b>REFERRED:</b> <b>REREFERRED:</b> <b>REPORTED BACK:</b>
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	<b>ADOPTED:</b> <b>POF:</b>
DATED: April 9, 2008	<b>ID NUMBER:</b>

---

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, Bonnie Cosgrove, Richard Wagner and Jay Ferm.

### **SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of April 9, 2008, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a public building – Tenney Park Shelter. Appearing on behalf of the project were Simon Widstrand, City Parks Division; Steve Kieckhafer representing T. Wall Properties; Sandra Ward, Peg Smelzer representing Friends of the Yahara River Parkway; and Patrick McDonnell, representing the Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood Association. The revised plans as presented featured the following:

- The revised design incorporates the use of the existing shelter's foundation in order to maintain much of the existing site's setting; taking advantage of the views, existing proximity and amenities within the park.
- Bike racks have been located adjacent to the existing path.
- An outdoor grilling area is provided, as well as an enclosed playground as previously suggested by the Commission.
- A new drop-off area in the existing parking lot has been developed.
- On architecture, building is reminiscent of the arts and crafts style within the Tenney Park neighborhood.
- The building materials consist of split face stone, cement board, an exterior motif in the form of cedar, a roof of recycled shingle materials, along with an elevated roofline for the incorporation of clearstory windows.

Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Changes on the right track, changes in planning good.
- Concern with accessibility to the pond.
- Building embraces site now.
- Need varied plantings at edge to discourage bike cut through and go around or conversely encourage.
- Provide as much daylighting as possible into the building.
- Design of relocated path should slow down high-speed traffic.

- Develop kitchen and storage to relate and provide access to adjacent outdoor eating area.
- Verify architectural treatment with detailed building elevations; the renderings are unclear.
- On the roof tiles, prefer slate, consider metal roofing.
- Need to clarify fireplace issue; sustainability of gas versus wood; supports the utilization of wood. Not convinced on safety issues.

### **ACTION:**

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-0). The motion required address of the above stated concerns with consideration of final approval of the project.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6, 6, 6, 7, 7, 7.5 and 8.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: Tenney Park Shelter**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	7	7	-	-	-	-	-	8
	8	8	6	8	-	7	8	7.5
	6	6	-	-	-	6	5	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	7	7	-	7	-	6	-	7
	6	-	6	-	-	7	7	7
	6	6	-	-	-	5	6	6
	6	6	-	-	-	5	-	6

General Comments:

- Much improved. Address green and LEEDS standards.
- Accessibility to water's edge space from building needed. Much improved.
- Still looks a little too "north woods."
- Discourage (prevent) bike traffic to west of pavilion. Genuine slate shingles would be nice.
- Great improvements.