



Project Name/Address: Madison Catholic Association Clubhouse, 15 E Wilson
Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration of front stoop
Legistar File ID # [35818](#)
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Issued: October 15, 2014

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Russ Kowalski, GMK Architecture
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the front stoop on a landmark building.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is a designated landmark site

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

33.19(8) Maintenance of Landmarks, Landmark Sites and Historic Districts.

(a) Every person in charge of an improvement on a landmark site or in an Historic District shall keep in good repair all of the exterior portions of such improvement and all interior portions thereof which, if not so maintained, may cause or tend to cause the exterior portions of such improvement to fall into a state of disrepair. This provision shall be in addition to all other provisions of law requiring such improvement to be kept in good repair.

33.19(5)(b)4. Upon filing of any application with the Landmarks Commission, the Landmarks Commission shall determine:

- a. Whether in the case of a designated landmark or landmark site, the proposed work would detrimentally change, destroy or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which said work is to be done;
- b. Whether, in the case of the construction of a new improvement upon a landmark site, the exterior of such improvement would adversely affect or not harmonize with the external appearance of other neighboring improvements on such site;

Analysis and Conclusion

The previous concrete entry stoop was removed and replaced with a new concrete entry stoop without permits or approvals. The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the new stoop and related handrails.

While the stoop does not detrimentally change or destroy an architectural feature of the landmark, it does adversely affect the appearance of the landmark. The concrete stoop is an odd size and shape and doesn't relate to the placement of the canopy supports. The concrete material has no detailing that allows it to harmonize with the architecture of the building. The design and location of the proposed handrails do not harmonize with the appearance of the building or the size and shape of the new stoop.

Staff did not feel that this work could receive an administratively approved Certificate of Appropriateness.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are not met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission discuss options that will meet the standards. These options may include the reduction in the width of the stoop, the installation of a veneer material or colored coating (colored concrete stain), the revised placement of handrails so that a handrail assembly is not centered on the doorway, the modified design of the handrails, and the extension of the top landing toward the steps.