

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: December 3, 2008
TITLE: 229 West Lakelawn Place & 201 West Lakelawn Place – PUD(GDP-SIP), Rental Housing Development. 2 nd Ald. Dist. (12710)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: December 3, 2008	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Mark Smith, Dawn Weber, Richard Wagner, Jay Ferm, Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton and John Harrington.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of December 3, 2008, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 229 West Lakelawn Place and 201 West Lakelawn Place. Appearing on behalf of the project were David Kaul, Atty. Bill White, Adam Winkler and Bryan Fraser, all representing The Alexander Company; and Bill Andrae, representing Acacia Fraternity. A review of modified plans noted the following:

- The massing for the new building located at the rear of the Acacia Fraternity is not as tall as other buildings in the neighborhood, not out of scale.
- The building is comprised of a base, middle and cap, where the elevations feature a stone base, a combination of brick and EIFS on upper elevations with EIFS noted as similar to real stucco on adjacent buildings in the area as well as providing for articulation.
- The dumpster enclosure has been relocated away from the corner of the site and relocated between the rear and front of the existing and proposed buildings.

In reference to the Landmarks Commission's recommendation for rejection of the project, it was noted that the Landmarks Commission would like to see a more significant entry to the building, as well as addressing other requirements for development in Downtown Design Zones, especially at entry at the center of the proposed structure.

Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- The corner entry needs work.
- The 35 bike parking stalls are not enough for the number of bedrooms. Issue with where bikes will go. Such a dense project it requires more in an area which is insufficient in providing for bike parking, need to mitigate bike parking.
- Can't support project with corner entry as proposed. Need to provide important features on public way. Need something that fits corner of street intersection, as move existing entry treatment to the corner. The entry as proposed is hidden. Consider two entries to building, one at the corner with the other as proposed with modifications.

- In regards to landscaping, using too much of the same species. The use of burning bush doesn't fit Acacia building and neighborhood. Too much shade in area for cornflower and too much area for phlox.
- Replace the removed ash at side of building.
- Need to address the articulation and other issues as noted within the memo from Kitty Rankin, in addition to address of the flat roof issue.
- Entry elevation is more of a back door, less safe and less prominent, needs to be made more active, more public; more of a space.
- On the end elevation of the building facing Lakelawn Place, the change in materials should be a change in plane/plan.
- EIFS at other levels feels applied, take brick all the way up with vertical bands with EIFS inset panels.
- The entry to the building is down in a hole is extremely problematic; a security issue. Side mass at entry toward the street.
- The use of EIFS is the wrong material for area, doesn't allow for articulation, use masonry as expected within the area.
- Corner needs to address street not as a back door; Lakelawn Place façade needs better pedestrian treatment and architecture.

ACTION:

On a motion by Wagner, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of this item. The motion passed on a vote of (9-0). The motion to refer required address of the above concerns with an emphasis that the project doesn't meet the standards for development in Downtown Design Zones as currently proposed, and the following:

- Resolve the entryway issue.
- Address alley/street façade issues.
- Bring parking level down to provide an at grade entry at street, extend sidewalk with elimination of a tree to bring entry on grade.
- Provide consideration for two entries to the building.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 4, 5, 5, 5, 6, 6 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 229 West Lakelawn Place & 201 West Lakelawn Place

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
	5	6	4	-	-	-	5	5
	6	6	-	-	-	5	6	6
	5	5	-	-	-	4	8	5
	4	6	6	-	-	4	6	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	2	4	4	-	-	4	5	-
	4	6	6	5	-	5	6	5

General Comments:

- Not satisfied that projects meets Downtown Design Guidelines, address entry, corner of Lakelawn and West Lakelawn, building articulation.
- Move entrance to grade level and to street.
- Entry presence is of critical importance!
- Too much building for site. Must address concerns of Landmarks.
- Entry and elevation issues must be resolved. Can entry be at grade at parking level? Raise parking level to ELEV. 48.0'. I would support 6' to 1' of additional building height. Show proposed building on aerial image in context!
- Revisit entry and Landmarks/Kitty Rankin comments. If east entry becomes secondary consider entering mid-level or up one level, non-accessible alleviates some difficulties. Ramp to historic building could occur in the courtyard, separate from the building non-accessible entry, or study grades and making the entry court an active space, interior and exterior.
- Entry needs to be visible and at corner treat "alley" as a street.