

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: November 15, 2006
TITLE: 2200 West Broadway – New Construction, Multiple Tenant Commercial/Retail Building in Urban Design District No. 1. 14 th Ald. Dist. (03433)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: November 15, 2006	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Michael Barrett, Cathleen Feland, Lisa Geer, Ald. Noel Radomski, Bruce Woods and Robert March.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of November 15, 2006, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of new construction located at 2200 West Broadway. Appearing on behalf of the project were David Nelsen and Homer Simpson with Joseph Hennessy registered neither in support nor opposition. The modified plans as presented by Nelsen featured the following:

- The multiple tenant one-story retail building now features a masonry base with vertical wood siding, along with a green metal roof. The building has been relocated to a parallel orientation to West Broadway immediately abutting an existing drainage easement.
- An alternative building design featured the use of horizontal cedar siding in combination with the metal roof; an option to relate to the wood siding found on a few of the structures within the immediate vicinity of the site.
- A review of the landscape plan emphasized the provision of screening of existing residential units along the northerly boundary of the site.

Following the presentation, the Commission noted the following:

- The layout of doors and windows on the architectural drawings do not correlate with the site plan layout; update site plan to match architectural drawings for the proposed building.
- Need shade trees in parking lot islands to the rear of the building, in addition to screening between the driveway and adjacent residential apartments to the east.
- It was emphasized that dormers needed to be functional to let light into the interior and not dependant on tenant build-out criteria.
- Issue with the West Broadway elevation featuring a blank façade with only four blank doors facing the street; the façade needs more fenestration such as windows.
- Issue with not emulating height of other buildings that are two stories within the area; the project continues the low-rise strip mall effect of one-story buildings along West Broadway.
- It stands out that the building turns its back to West Broadway; the elevation needs something more dramatic, a door or entrance and more windows, in addition to a safe and direct pedestrian route to the building from West Broadway.

- In terms of parking, examine parallel parking along the drive aisle in order to facilitate a two-story alternative.
- Reexamine the access drive; narrow down to reduce the extent of pavement.
- Issue with bringing building to street; requires a two-sided building, a sidewalk linkage to a door, need to deal with utilities on street side and at same time make both sides look like a front.
- Despite potential for services doors on Broadway side, still needs more windows.
- Eliminate easterly drive to increase greenspace, landscaping and reduce hard surface.
- Reexamining the location of the building; rotate the building to be perpendicular to street and relate to other buildings; place active area toward Antlers and reduce hard space between buildings as an alternative.

ACTION:

On a motion by Geer, seconded by Host-Jablonski, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of this item. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (9-0). The motion to refer required address of the above stated concerns with any further consideration of the project.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 3.75, 4, 4, 5, 5, 5, 5, 6 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 2200 West Broadway

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	4	5	5	6	-	4	5	5
	4	5	5	6	-	3	4	4
	4	5	5	-	-	4	4	4
	5	5	5	-	-	5	5	5
	5	6	7	8	-	4	6	6
	5	5	6	5	-	5	6	5
	5	5	6	6	-	5	5	5
	3.5	4	-	-	-	-	4	3.75
	6	6	7	8	-	-	6	6

General Comments:

- Rotate building 90-degrees and move to east side of lot. Make dormers functional.
- Needs work to minimize paving and increase site efficiency to gain greenspace.
- Needs work to fit site better and interact with Broadway.
- Plan and site need further development.
- Whole layout needs rethinking.
- South elevation is lacking. Look at entry drive – three seems overkill.
- Update the site plan to address building doors and window locations. Add trees in parking lot islands by the new building and screening to the east, possibly narrow shade trees and low shrubs. Add windows to front along Broadway. Could be more efficient with the parking layout by locating the second drive between the building and double loading the parking.
- Site concept needs rethinking. This is unfortunately a strip mall of a most suburban stripe.
- Windows on street side essential.