

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

| | |
|--|---|
| REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION | PRESENTED: April 5, 2006 |
| TITLE: 731 State Street and 439 North Murray Street – PUD(SIP), Church/Mixed-Use Project. 8 th Ald. Dist. (03312) | REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK: |
| AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary | ADOPTED: POF: |
| DATED: April 5, 2006 | ID NUMBER: |

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Ald. Noel Radomski, Lisa Geer, Cathleen Feland, Jack Williams, Bruce Woods, Michael Barrett, Todd Barnett, Robert March and Lou Host-Jablonski.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of April 5, 2006, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a church/mixed-use PUD(SIP) located at 731 State Street and 439 North Murray Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Randy Bare, Ed Sue and Wendi Sue, architects. In response to the Commission's previous comments on the project, the modified plans featured the following:

- The proposed use of goutweed was eliminated in favor of locally available varieties.
- The photometric plan has been modified to reduce canopy light levels, in addition to provision of a full lighting and photometric plan and required fixture cutsheets.
- Detailed locations of proposed bike racks were provided, including a combination of covered and uncovered, in addition to information distributed on the U-type hoop rack to be employed.
- The proposed use of trellises on upper portions of the elevations have been eliminated.
- The guardrail type on most of the balconies has been modified to incorporate the use of brick.
- Simulated stone trim is now utilized in areas formerly proposed as siding. Asphalt shingles are proposed to set up by standing metal seam roof for economy purposes.
- The upper elevations of the building feature the addition of a loft bedroom, which adds additional roofline treatment to the building's upper elevations.
- Bike parking is provided for every bedroom provided within the building.

Following the presentation, staff noted that Kitty Rankin, Preservation Planner had examined the final plans and noted that they were consistent with the previous approval by the Landmarks Commission, therefore requiring no further consideration. Following the presentation, the Commission noted the following:

- Like the building, the bike racks and project as a whole. The bulk and mass of the building need something to visually stabilize it such as a colonnade on the south side of the building. The applicant noted that a previous proposal for a colonnade was eliminated in discussions with the University of Wisconsin who intends to develop the property to the south where the additional space is necessary for vehicular circulation between the two proposed structures. It was noted that it was disappointing that the UW prioritized truck traffic over good design.

- It was questioned the use of brown shingles versus a slate or gray color to complement that of the church.
- Concerns were still raised with the high lighting levels at the entry and need for adjustment.

ACTION:

On a motion by March, seconded by Host-Jablonski, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (9-0). The motion provided for the following:

- Reduce lighting levels at the entry to the building, as well as minimize spillage of church uplighting to be reviewed and reduce lighting levels at the entry to the mixed-use facility to a single digit level to be approved by staff and verified by the Building Inspection Plan Review staff.
- Give latitude on the shingle color and railing profile alternatives to the architect.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 7, 7.5, 8, 8, 8, 8 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 731 State Street and 439 North Murray Street

| | Site Plan | Architecture | Landscape Plan | Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc. | Signs | Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular) | Urban Context | Overall Rating |
|-----------------------|-----------|--------------|----------------|--------------------------------|-------|-------------------------------------|---------------|----------------|
| Member Ratings | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | 8 |
| | 6 | 6 | 6 | 6 | - | 6 | 7 | 6 |
| | 7 | 8 | 7 | 8 | - | 7 | 8 | 8 |
| | 7 | 9 | 6 | 5 | - | 7 | 9 | 8 |
| | 6 | 8 | 7 | 8 | - | 7 | 8 | 7.5 |
| | 8 | 7 | 8 | - | - | 7 | 8 | 8 |
| | 7 | 8 | 7 | 7 | - | 8 | 7 | 7 |
| | 8 | 7 | 7 | 7 | - | 9 | 8 | 8 |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |

General Comments:

- This will be a very appropriate improvement to this part of the City. Kudos.
- Reduce lighting level hot spots.
- Wonderful complement to exterior historic buildings.
- A bit massive but quality design helps mitigate it.
- Elimination of colonnade is disappointing. Change to railings at desk is an improvement!
- Very nice design; very thoughtful lighting and bicycle facilities. Very disappointed that the University prioritizes truck traffic over good design (the 1-story vestibule on south elevation). A critical design element: the south side ground floor vestibule. Truck traffic is not more important than good design!
- Difficult, difficult site should be noted.