

Note to Commission:
2021 Van Hise Avenue
University Heights Local Historic District

11/10/09

During the discussion to reconsider on November 2, 2009, Chairperson Stephans asked staff to put together a comprehensive list of the Ordinance language for the University Heights Historic District that pertains to this specific project. That language is attached.

The Commission has commended, on several occasions, the architectural detail of the proposal which pertain to most of the applicable sections of the University Heights Historic District language. However, staff still feels that there are two particular sections of this ordinance that are most relevant to the current concerns of the Commission, the side addition and the garage. Since the applicant's revisions have evolved to include a detached garage, staff feels that they should be dealt with separately:

33.19(12)(d) 6. Additions Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades:

“...Side additions shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade...”

33.19(12)(f) New Construction:

2. Accessory Buildings. Accessory buildings, as defined in Section 28.03(2) of the Madison General Ordinances, shall be compatible with the design of the existing buildings on the zoning lot, shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height and shall be as unobtrusive as possible. No accessory building shall be erected in any yard except a rear yard. Exterior wall materials shall be the same as those for construction of new principal buildings as set forth in Section 33.01(12)(f)1.c.(g)

The most recent motion on the Certificate of Appropriateness (from October 19th, 2009) included the following language: (*The motion failed by a 4-3 vote.*)

There was a motion by Maniaci to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness, with the following conditions, seconded by Taylor for discussion purposes.

1. The windows sills on the addition are to be raised to match the other windows as recommended in the staff report.
2. The more modern railing is okay as designed.
3. The eastern facade ‘bump-out’ between the original house and the addition is to be removed to create a better separation.
4. The garage is to be pushed back an additional 10 feet.

Respectfully submitted,
Rebecca Cnare and Bill Fruhling
November 10, 2009

Landmarks Ordinance applicable sections:

33.19 (5)(b)4c: Powers and duties:

4. Upon filing of any application with the Landmarks Commission, the Landmarks Commission shall determine:
 - c. Whether, in the case of any property located in an Historic District designated pursuant to the terms of Subsection (6)(d) hereunder, the proposed construction, reconstruction or exterior alteration does not conform to the objectives and design criteria of the historic preservation plan for said district as duly adopted by the Common Council.

33.19 (12) University Heights Historic District

33.19(12) (d) Criteria for the Review of Additions, Exterior Alterations and Repairs in R2 and R4AZoning Districts.

1. Height. All additions shall be no higher than the existing building; however, if the existing building is already a nonconforming one, no addition shall be made thereto except in accordance with Section 28.05(3)(c) of the Madison General Ordinances. Roof additions resulting in an increased building volume are prohibited unless they meet the standards in Section 33.01(12)(d)7 and are permitted under Chapter 28 of the Madison General Ordinances, or approved as a variance pursuant to Sections 28.08(2)(e) and 28.12(8)(d) or approved as a conditional use or as part of a planned residential development in accordance with Section 28.085(e).
2. Second Exit Platforms and Fire Escapes. *Not applicable.*
3. Repairs. Materials used in exterior repairs shall duplicate the original building materials in texture and appearance, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the existing building materials where the existing building materials differ from the original. Repairs using materials that exactly duplicate the original in composition are encouraged. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)
4. Restoration. Projects that will restore the appearance of a building or structure to its original appearance are encouraged and will be approved by the Landmarks Commission if such projects are documented by photographs, architectural or archeological research or other suitable evidence. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)
5. Re-Siding. *Not applicable.*
6. Additions Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades. Additions visible from the street, including additions to the top of buildings or structures, and alterations to street facades shall be compatible with the existing building in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Materials used in such alterations and additions shall duplicate in texture and appearance, and architectural details used therein shall duplicate in design, the materials and details used in the original construction of the existing building or of other buildings in University Heights of similar materials, age and architectural style, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the texture and appearance of materials and the design of architectural details used in the existing building where the existing building materials and architectural details differ from the original. Additions and exterior alterations that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Additions or exterior alterations that destroy significant architectural features

are prohibited. Side additions shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)

7. Additions and Exterior Alterations Not Visible from the Street. *Not applicable.*

8. Roof Shape. The roof shape of the front of a building or structure shall not be altered except to restore it to the original documentable appearance or to add a dormer or dormers in a location and shape compatible with the architectural design of the building and similar in location and shape to original dormers on buildings of the same vintage and style within the district. Alterations of the roof shape of the sides or back of a building or structure shall be visually compatible with the architectural design of the existing building. (Renum. by ORD-08- 00122, 11-22-08)

9. Roof Material.

a. If the existing roof of a building or structure is tile, slate or other material that is original to the building or structure and/or contributes to its historic character all repairs thereto shall be made using the same materials. In addition, in all cases any such roof must be repaired rather than replaced, unless the documented cost of repair exceeds the documented cost of re-roofing with a substitute material that approximates the appearance of the original roofing material as closely as possible, in which case re-roofing with a material that approximates the appearance of the original roofing material as closely as possible will be approved by the Landmarks Commission.

b. If the existing roofing material is asphalt shingles, sawn wood shingles or a nonhistoric material such as fiberglass, all repairs shall match in appearance the existing roof material; however, if any such roof is covered or replaced, re-roofing must be done using rectangular sawn wood shingles or rectangular shingles that are similar in width, thickness and apparent length to sawn wood shingles, for example, 3-in-1 tab asphalt shingles. Modern style shingles, such as thick wood shakes, dutch lap, french method and interlock shingles, that are incompatible with the historic character of the district are prohibited.

c. Rolled roofing, : *Not applicable:*

33.19(12) (f) Criteria for the Review of New Construction in the R2, R4, R4A, R5, R6, C1, C2 and OR Zoning Districts

1. Principal Buildings. *Not applicable:*

2. Accessory Buildings. Accessory buildings, as defined in Section 28.03(2) of the Madison General Ordinances, shall be compatible with the design of the existing buildings on the zoning lot, shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height and shall be as unobtrusive as possible. No accessory building shall be erected in any yard except a rear yard. Exterior wall materials shall be the same as those for construction of new principal buildings as set forth in Section 33.01(12)(f)1.c.(g) Conformance with Regulations, Maintenance of the District, Conditions Dangerous