

AGENDA # 12

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: May 19, 2010
TITLE: 431 West Dayton Street – PUD(GDP-SIP), Building Demolition for a Four-Unit Apartment Building. 4 th Ald. Dist. (18248)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: May 19, 2010	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Slayton, Todd Barnett, Mark Smith, Bruce Woods and Richard Wagner.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of May 19, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 431 West Dayton Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were David Ferch and Dan Bohl, representing 431 West Dayton Street, LLC; Scott Kolar, representing Mifflin West District, CNI; and Dennis Grosse. Bohl presented plans for demolition of a building and construction of a four-unit apartment building. The project will incorporate brick and limestone accents and have the visual appearance of a three-story building. The building setbacks are consistent with the neighborhood. The project includes 21 bicycle parking stalls and 2 moped parking stalls, 3 of which are interior, 5 are covered. Screening is provided for the HVAC units, with enclosed garbage and a small greenspace for the residents. Comments from the Commission were as follows:

- You should have more windows on east elevation. Natural light into the stairwells would be beneficial. You could introduce two windows in some of the bedrooms.
- Doesn't fit the neighborhood. Seems out of place. Wish this was something a bit fresher. Pseudo-historical.
- I can't hardly stand to look at what's down there. Abysmal area. Not sure it fits in with what's down there, but at the same time why not try something new.
- Consider balconies on the backside of the building.
- Landscaping should fit whatever architectural style the building ends up being.

ACTION:

On a motion by Slayton, seconded by Wagner, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (4-0). The motion for initial approval was for massing and building location, not architecture. The motion instructed the applicant to further examine expressions of building style, explore the architecture in a modern way, along with use of contemporary materials and to provide bike/moped parking at one stall per bedroom.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 431 West Dayton Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	5	3	-	-	-	5	-
	5	6	-	-	-	-	6	6
	5	5	5	-	-	6	7	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6

General Comments:

- Reconsider architectural style/era.
- Context good, architecture tired.