

AGENDA # 2

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: February 21, 2007
TITLE: 110 South Henry Street – Existing PUD-SIP, Façade Renovation, Meriter. 4 th Ald. Dist. (05084)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: February 21, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Lisa Geer, Robert March, Bruce Woods, Todd Barnett, Ald. Noel Radomski and Michael Barrett.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of February 21, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of an existing PUD-SIP façade renovation for Meriter Hospital located at 110 South Henry Street. Appearing on behalf of the project was Bruce Simonson. Prior to the presentation staff noted that the project was granted final approval at the meeting of December 6, 2006 with some contingencies to return, the revised plans include some additional modifications. Simonson presented revised plans which featured the following:

- A new treatment for the main entry to the building featuring a canopy cover.
- Simplified balconies with the removal of tubular structures on the upper three stories of the building combined with balcony tier relocation and a reduction from 4 tiers to 3 tiers.
- On the roof a proposed stair tower has been eliminated.
- The option for the potential use of EIFS panels in lieu of aluminum panels on the upper façade.
- A proposed window replacement on the lower levels would be pushed off to a later time based on budget consideration.

Following the presentation, the Commission noted that they preferred the old design of the balconies which was less pedestrian; consider all three layers of decks to be structurally supported by one line on each side with one anchor point as an option.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Woods, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (7-0). The motion supported approval as presented with the applicant to have the flexibility to redesign the support mechanism for the balconies as noted within the text of the report with staff approval.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6, 6, 7, 7 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 110 South Henry Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	7	-	-	-	-	-	7
	-	6	-	6	-	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	6	-	-	-	-	6	6
	-	7	-	-	-	-	7	7
	6	6	6	6	-	8	7	7
	-	7	-	-	-	-	-	-

General Comments:

- Balconies are less successful.
- The balconies seemed too heavy before. I prefer the simplified individual balconies.
- Good to see a homely building get spruced up instead of torn down. The only negative: over-promising and ultimately downgrading.