



**Project Address:** 857 South Shore Drive  
**Application Type:** Certificate of Appropriateness for alterations to a landmark  
**Legistar File ID #** [32025](#)  
**Prepared By:** Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

## Summary

**Applicant/Property Owner:** Sindhu Raju

**Requested Action/Proposal Summary:** The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior alteration of the Eggiman House

**Applicable Regulations & Standards:** Section 33.19 of the Madison General Ordinances (see below)

**Review Required By:** Landmarks Commission

## Background Information

**Parcel Location:** The subject site is the site of the designated landmark, Eggiman House, located in the Bay View neighborhood overlooking Monona Bay. The property is also individually listed on the National Register.

### Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

#### 33.19(5)(b) Regulation of Construction, Reconstruction and Exterior Alteration.

4. Upon filing of any application with the Landmarks Commission, the Landmarks Commission shall determine:
  - a. Whether, in the case of a designated landmark or landmark site, the proposed work would detrimentally change, destroy or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which said work is to be done; and

#### 33.19(8) Maintenance of Landmarks, Landmark Sites and Historic Districts

- a. Every person in charge of an improvement on a landmark site or in a Historic District shall keep in good repair all of the exterior portions of such improvement and all interior portions thereof which, if not so maintained, may cause or tend to cause the exterior portions of such improvement to fall into a state of disrepair. This provision shall be in addition to all other provisions of law requiring such improvement to be kept in good repair.

## Analysis and Conclusion

The Eggiman House was constructed in 1936 in the International Style. It is a prefabricated product called a "Motohome" as manufactured by American Houses, Inc. and is the only Motohome in Wisconsin. Please see the attached landmark nomination form for more information about the significance of this structure.

The Applicant explains that the windows have deteriorated beyond repair after numerous attempts to repair them and keep them in maintained working order and requests that the Landmarks Commission allow replacement of all windows with fiberglass or vinyl window products. Unlike a wood window that can be easily repaired with epoxy or Dutchman repairs, a steel window is more difficult and more costly to repair and in many

cases may require full unit replacement. Staff toured the property in the spring of 2013 and believes that the existing windows are in fair to poor condition.

Because the significance of this landmark structure is partially due to the design of the assembly using steel components and panelized systems, the steel windows and their configuration with narrow horizontal muntins and minimal stile and rail components are architecturally significant. The loss of the steel windows will negatively impact the integrity of the structure. While the integrity may be affected, it might be possible to replace the steel windows with windows that have similar configurations and stile and rail dimensions, but are made from different, yet similar, materials. Staff is concerned by the proposal to use fiberglass or vinyl replacement units in this historic context.

Aluminum windows would have similar extrusion options and would likely replicate the appearance of the original steel windows. After a quick search, staff found that aluminum window manufacturers offer windows with similar horizontal muntin patterns, but with wider stiles and rails and frames resulting in less glass than the original window configuration (staff briefly reviewed Fleetwood, Western Window Systems, Milgard, All Weather and International Window Corp. to make this determination). It should be noted that there are custom window options offered that were not researched by staff and that a design professional could assist with the research and selection of a window with overall attributes that closely resemble the existing window which would maintain the historic appearance of the landmark.

Staff maintains that the integrity of materials and the appearance are equally significant considerations. If the existing original windows are going to be replaced, the replacement window must be of similar material and must closely match the existing window dimensions and configuration.

## **Recommendation**

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of windows at the landmark site are not met based on the submission materials and recommends that the Landmarks Commission refer the request until more information can be submitted. Staff encourages the applicant to contact the State Historic Preservation Office to discuss new legislation regarding the tax credit program.