PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

July 7, 2025



PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

| Project Name & Address: | 3565 Tulane Avenue |
|-------------------------|---|
| Application Type: | Demolition Historic Value Review |
| Legistar File ID # | <u>88900</u> |
| Prepared By: | Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division |
| Date Prepared: | July 3, 2025 |
| | |

Summary

Relevant Ordinance Section:

28.185(7) <u>Review for Historic Value</u>. Every application for demolition or removal of a principal structure shall be reviewed by the Landmarks Commission, which shall provide input to the Building Inspection Division regarding the historic value of the property with the building or structure proposed for demolition or removal.

- (a) If the Landmarks Commission determines that the property with the proposed demolition or the structure proposed for removal has no known historic value, the demolition or removal may be approved administratively under sub. (8)(b) below, provided that at least one of the standards for administrative approval have been met.
- (b) If the Landmarks Commission determines that the property with the proposed demolition or the structure proposed for removal has historic value, then the Plan Commission shall approve the demolition or removal under sub. (9) below, after considering input from the Landmarks Commission.
- (c) Nothing in this subsection eliminates the requirement in MGO Secs. <u>41.09</u>(1)(c) and <u>41.12</u>(3) that the demolition of landmark structures or structures in historic districts must also be approved by the Landmarks Commission through the issuance of a Certificate of Approval.

41.28 HISTORIC VALUE ADVISORY RECOMMENDATION

- (1) <u>Review for Historic Value</u>. Following a review of MGO Sec. 28.185 applications for demolition by the Landmarks Commission and based upon application materials, and a report by the City's Preservation Planner, and any public testimony, the Commission shall review <u>MGO Sec. 28.185</u> applications for demolition and assign one of the following Categories to each principal building proposed for demolition:
 - (a) <u>Category A Demolitions</u>: denotes that the Landmarks Commission finds that the building has historic value based on architectural significance, cultural significance, historic significance, as the work/product of an architect of note, its status as a contributing structure in a National Register Historic District, listed in the National Register of Historic Places, and/or as an intact or rare example of a certain architectural style or method of construction.
 - (b) <u>Category B Demolitions</u>: denotes that the Landmarks Commission finds that the building has historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, cultural practices, or as the work/product of an architect of note, but the building itself is not historically, architecturally or culturally significant.
 - (c) <u>Category C Demolitions</u>: denotes that the Landmarks Commission finds that the building has no known historic value. This category may also denote sites or properties that have historic value, and the significance will not be negatively impacted by the removal of the building itself. This category may also include sites or properties that have archaeological or other site findings of significance, but where removal of the building itself will have no impact.
- (2) <u>Presence of Archaeology</u>. When applicable, each finding shall also note the presence of an archaeological or burial site on the site of the building proposed for demolition.

<u>3565 Tulane Avenue</u> Commercial building constructed 1953





Google Streetview

Google Earth

Applicant: Sean Meyers, Threshold Development

Applicant's Comments: The existing building no longer meets the needs of the owner. The spaces are not large enough and are too fragmented to support the current and desired users and uses. More importantly there are deferred maintenance issues that would be too costly to address as well as issues with basement water intrusion management. Every spring the roof leaks, and there are cracks in the basement foundation wall system too costly to repair. We intend on re-using as much of the existing materials as is feasible (spire, sanctuary glu-lams, pavers, bricks). The project team will submit a re-use and recycling plan to the city as required of the demolition process.

The building was built circa 1953 (Figure 1); the architecture firm was Siberz, Purcell, Cuthbert & Newcomb. An addition was completed circa 1954 (Figure 2) also by Siberz, Purcell, Cuthbert. Another addition was completed circa 1958 (Figure 3) by Edward Tough. The building is not a landmark and is not in a landmark district nor do we believe the building has enough historical significance to warrant preservation. The building has served the community and the Lakeview Moravian Community Church, and more recently Common Grace (including Zion Lutheran Church), for nearly 75 years, but it has reached the limits of what it can support moving forward. We believe the demolition standards can be met for this proposed demolition.

Staff Findings: There is no preservation file for this property. The property is within the boundary of the Walterschiet archaeological site (DA-0274), documented by Charles Brown in 1911. The exact boundaries of the Woodland-period campsite and workshop site are unclear. The applicant should be prepared for the possibility of inadvertent discoveries of archaeological materials. Otherwise, this church structure and associated educational wing are of a simple post-WWII design. There are no significant historical associations, and the structure is not architecturally significant.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommends a finding of (c) no known historic value. Applicant should be prepared for inadvertent discoveries of archaeological materials related to possible Native American habitation in this location. If any human remains are discovered, work should stop immediately, and the property owner should contact the Office of the State Archaeologist.