

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

January 8, 2024

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 10 S Franklin Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction

Legistar File ID # [80836](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: January 3, 2024

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Tom Lamberson, American Garage Builders

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new garage structure.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject property is located in the First Settlement local historic district.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.27 STANDARDS FOR NEW STRUCTURES.

- (1) General
 - (a) Primary Structures

The design for a new structure in a historic district shall be visually compatible with other historic resources within two hundred (200) feet in the following ways:

1. Building Placement. When determining visual compatibility for building placement, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as lot coverage, setbacks, building orientation, and historic relationships between the building and site.
2. Street Setback. When determining visual compatibility for street setbacks, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as the average setback of historic

resources on the same block face within two hundred (200) feet, and the setback of adjacent structures.

3. Visual Size. When determining visual compatibility for visual size, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as massing, building height in feet and stories, the gross area of the front elevation (i.e., all walls facing the street), street presence, and the dominant proportion of width to height in the façade.
4. Building Form. When determining visual compatibility for building form, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as building type and use, roof shape, symmetry or asymmetry, and its dominant vertical or horizontal expression.
5. Architectural Expression. When determining visual compatibility for architectural expression, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as the building's modulation, articulation, building planes, proportion of building elements, and rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the façade.

(b) Accessory Structures

1. Comply with requirements for new primary structures with other historic accessory structures serving as comparables.
2. Minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way, or be minimally visible from the front of the property for corner lots.
3. Clearly be secondary to the primary structure.

(3) Exterior Walls

(a) General

1. Materials used for new structures shall be similar in design, scale and architectural appearance to materials that date to the period of significance on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet, but differentiated enough so that it is not confused as a historic building.

(4) Roofs

(a) Form

1. Roof form and pitch shall be similar to the form and pitch of the roofs on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet.

(b) Materials

1. Roof materials shall replicate materials found on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet.

(5) Windows and Doors

(a) General

1. Door and window styles should both match the style of the new structure and be compatible with those on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet.

(f) Garage Doors

1. Garage doors shall be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities prevalent within the historic district.

(7) Building Systems

(c) Lighting and Electrical Systems

1. Decorative light fixtures shall be compatible in style and location with the overall design of the building.
2. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible.
3. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to construct a garage on the rear of the lot at 10 S Franklin. The principal structure is a two-story, front-gabled Folk Victorian that was constructed in 1874. The new garage is proposed for the rear yard. It is of a simple utilitarian design, which is typical of garages in the district. The clapboard building will be clad in the smooth wire-brushed LP Smartside product, which replicates the appearance of painted wood. Painted 4" to 6" clapboard is characteristic of garages historically found in the district. The pedestrian and vehicle door are also typical. The original plans included a window and the applicant has advised that they will not be installing a window, so the project will need updated plans showing the design without a window.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.27 STANDARDS FOR NEW STRUCTURES.

- (1) General
 - (a) Primary Structures

The design for a new structure in a historic district shall be visually compatible with other historic resources within two hundred (200) feet in the following ways:

 - 1. Building Placement. Garages are typically located behind the principal structure, as is the case with this proposal.
 - 2. Street Setback. N/A
 - 3. Visual Size. The simple single-story garage is typical of historic garages in the district.
 - 4. Building Form. The unarticulated square footprint is typical of these utilitarian accessory structures.
 - 5. Architectural Expression. The gable front garage is typical of historic garages.
 - (b) Accessory Structures
 - 1. This garage is typical of historic garages found in the district and follows the requirements of principal structures.
 - 2. The garage will be minimally visible, if at all visible from the developed public right-of-way.
 - 3. The simple single-story accessory structure will clearly be secondary to the two-story masonry primary structure.
- (3) Exterior Walls
 - (a) General
 - 1. The clapboard garage with simple vehicle and pedestrian doors, and approvable roof shingles is similar in design, scale and architectural appearance to materials that date to the period of significance on historic resources within the district, but will still read as a new building.
- (4) Roofs
 - (a) Form
 - 1. Roof form and pitch is similar to the form and pitch of the roofs on garages historically found in the district.
 - (b) Materials
 - 1. The architectural shingle proposed meets our standards.
- (5) Windows and Doors
 - (a) General
 - 1. The door styles match the building and are typical of those found on other accessory buildings.

- (f) Garage Doors
 - 1. The proposed vehicle door is in keeping with the design and style of doors found on garages historically in the district.
- (7) Building Systems
 - (c) Lighting and Electrical Systems
 - 1. There is no information on any proposed exterior lighting. Decorative light fixtures shall be compatible in style and location with the overall design of the building.
 - 2. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible.
 - 3. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

- 1. Any exterior lighting will need a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- 2. Submit updated plans showing no window, to be approved by staff.