

AGENDA # 2

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION **PRESENTED:** February 1, 2012

TITLE: 202 & 206 North Brooks Street – **REFERRED:**
 PUD(GDP-SIP), Five-Story Residential **REREFERRED:**
 Building with Fourteen Units. 8th Ald. **REPORTED BACK:**
 Dist. (24171)

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary **ADOPTED:** **POF:**

DATED: February 1, 2012 **ID NUMBER:**

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett, Dawn O’Kroley, Richard Slayton, Melissa Huggins, John Harrington and Henry Lufler.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of February 1, 2012, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 202 and 206 North Brooks Street. Appearing on behalf of the project was Joseph Lee, representing JD McCormick Companies. Appearing in opposition was Gary Brown, representing the UW-Madison. Lee presented renderings with changes requested by the Commission at their previous review of the project. Changes include the corner element on the building and treatment of materials, studies with metal panel patterns, with the developer preferring their original proposal. The patio space of unit 101 has received more separation between the public sidewalk and private space with the installation of two steps and swinging doors will be installed. A more detailed landscape plan was submitted and a more substantial material sample board was presented. Gary Brown spoke in opposition. This project is within the Campus Development Plan and has been shown in the 1995 and 2004 campus plans. It is also shown as academic research in the Regent Street Neighborhood Plan approved in 1998. The UW is in opposition due to the land use issue that they would like the Plan Commission to address. Staff referenced the project’s inconsistency with the Regent Street Campus Neighborhood Plan, which supports use of the property for “Academic/Research”, in addition to its designation as “Campus,” a Special District in the Comprehensive Plan. Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- Barnett read a letter from McCormick which read, in part, that the University had a 10 year option to purchase this property and that lapsed in 2006. In talks with the University 10 years ago and this past summer it was determined that due to lack of funding the purchase could not be made; this site is not in the University’s five year plan.
 - It’s a 6 year capital plan that we approve every 2 years as part of the state budget and the education building is not in the 6 year plan. There are varying priorities going on in the School of Education. They have mentioned in the past doing fundraising.
- The point that this is a Plan Commission decision is valid.

ACTION:

On a motion by Huggins, seconded by O'Kroley, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of this item to allow the project to proceed with the Plan Commission in order to render the land use base decision on the project's inconsistency with the Regent Street Campus Neighborhood Plan and Comprehensive Plan prior to final consideration. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-1) with Rummel abstaining.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 202 & 206 North Brooks Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	6	-	-	-	-	6	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	7	7	6	5	-	6	8	7

General Comments:

- Attractive student housing.
- Nicely done.
- Please work with the University.