

AGENDA # 12

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: July 11, 2007
TITLE: 333 West Washington Avenue - Amended PUD-GDP for a Hotel. 4th Ald. Dist. (06876)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: July 11, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Lou Host-Jablonski, Richard Slayton, Todd Barnett, Michael Barrett, Joan Bachleitner, and Marsha Rummel.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of July 11, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of an amended PUD-GDP located at 333 West Washington Avenue. Appearing on behalf of the project were Attorney Bill White, Rosemary Lee, Nathan Novak, Jonathan Cooper, Eugene Devitt, Ed Freer and Adam Winkler. Att. Bill White explained to the Commission that the nature of the amendment to the existing PUD-GDP for “Capital West” project was to allow for the portion of the site located at 333 West Washington Avenue to be developed for an alternative use. The original recorded PUD-GDP for “Capital West” provided for approximately 84 condominium units at 13 stories in height. The amendment to the GDP provides for a proposed Hyatt Place Hotel in an 11-story structure featuring 151 suites. A major feature of the hotel as it relates to the West Washington right-of-way is its front entry with a drive-thru passenger drop-off, porte cochere canopy connected to the front hotel lobby. The amendment to the previously approved GDP also includes adjustments to the phasing of Capital West project and provides for the scheduling of development of the Main Street Townhomes to be reallocated from the current Phase I to Phase III, along with future development of the vacant site at 306 West Main Street adjusted from Phase II to Phase III, the development of both sites intended to occur simultaneously with this development. In addition, the proposed pedestrian bridge across Washington Place will also be constructed within Phase III as construction anticipated with the adjusted other components within the phase. The development of a hotel also provides for a covered link, below grade, to an existing parking structure on Main Street with a trash closure provided within the building. Rosemary Lee spoke in favor of the project. Jonathan Cooper of the Bassett West Neighborhood Steering Committee of the Capitol Neighborhoods spoke in favor of the concept of the hotel but raised concerns with the streetscape treatment (the use of the public right-of-way for drop-off purposes), the extension of the porte cochere into the street and sidewalk, as well as issues with loading and unloading within the drop-off to be more appropriately located and not within the street right-of-way. He also noted that the pedestrian bridge’s phasing would be more appropriately provided as part of Phase II concurrent with the construction of this hotel facility. Cooper also noted the need for appropriate lighting, screening of mechanicals and the use of green technology to be applied to the hotel project. Following the presentation, the Commission noted the following:

- The drop-off for the hotel may be appropriate but overhang onto the sidewalk of concern.

- The use of the site for a hotel is appropriate but the design of the hotel facility will need to evolve with the future SIP.
- Concern with drive-up; it will usurp greenspace within the public right-of-way as well as areas used for on-street parking. It will disrupt the green framing for the West Washington Avenue Corridor.
- Consider alternatives to provide a drop-off area beneath the façade of the building or public right-of-way.
- Drop-off doesn't fly; what it does to the West Washington Avenue right-of-way; develop drop-off at curb without effecting pedestrians on sidewalk.
- Provide alternatives to the utilization of the public right-of-way for drop-off purposes internal to the building and the site.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barrett, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of this project. The motion was passed on a vote of (5-0-2) with Barnett, Barrett, Host-Jablonski, Rummel and Slayton voting in favor, and Wagner and Bachleitner abstaining. The motion to refer instructed the applicant to look at alternatives to utilization of the public right-of-way for drop-off purposes, as well as a location for the porte cochere canopy to not extend within the West Washington Avenue right-of-way.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 3, 4, 5 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 333 West Washington Avenue

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	5	-	-	-	4	6	5
	2	6	2	-	-	2	4	4
	-	-	-	-	-	5	7	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	3

General Comments:

- Site plan: loss of green curb terrace. Landscape plan: loss of green curb terrace. The hotel adaptation is an appropriate one. The design is very nice. The usurpation of the well-planned, historic, public greens of the wide curb terrace is wrong. We must preserve this spectacular amenity that frames the approach to our Capitol.
- Look at drop-off options, OK with phasing change.
- Looks good to start except drop-off concerns.
- Using terrace as vehicle-oriented private drop-off is really problematic. Not on special West Wash.