

Regarding: 25 North Prospect Avenue – University Heights Historic District - Construction of a new single-family residence in the University Heights Historic District. (Legistar #25301)

Date: January 7, 2013
Prepared By: Amy Scanlon, Preservation Planner

General Information:

The Applicants are proposing to construct a new residence on the parcel located at 25 North Prospect Avenue in the University Heights Historic District. The property is zoned R2.

The project was previously reviewed by the Landmarks Commission on May 14, 2012. At that meeting, the Commission voted to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction. The motion and conditions of approval are as follows:

A motion was made by Rummel, seconded by Gehrig, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the new construction with the following conditions of approval:

1. *Recommend to Zoning Administrator and Zoning Board of Appeals to allow building height as designed.*
2. *The Applicants shall clarify the appearance and materials of the retaining walls and trellis materials at the driveway.*
3. *The Applicants shall clarify the appearance and materials of the front door and any hood projection over the door.*
4. *The Applicants shall explain the rain water conduction system and if scuppers or downspouts will be added.*
5. *The Applicants shall clarify the appearance and materials of the roof monitors.*
6. *The Applicants shall clarify the appearance of the garage door.*
7. *The Applicants shall clarify the appearance of the green roof during all seasons.*
8. *The Applicants shall submit final construction document floor plans and elevations.*

During the preparation of construction drawings, the Applicant and the Architect made changes to the project. Staff felt that the changes were significant enough to warrant review by the Commission. The previously granted Certificate of Appropriateness remains valid and any approved changes would be amended to the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Relevant sections of the Landmarks Ordinance:

33.19 (12)(f) Criteria for the Review of New Construction in the R2, R4, R4A, R5, R6, C1, C2 and OR Zoning Districts.

1. Principal Buildings.
 - a. Height. The maximum height for new buildings and structures in the R2, R4 and R4A Zoning Districts shall be 35 feet and shall not exceed 2-1/2 stories except as provided in Section 28.08(5)(e) of the Madison General Ordinances. The maximum height for new buildings and structures in the R5, C1 and C2 Zoning Districts shall be 40 feet. The maximum height in the R6 Zoning District for new buildings and structures shall be 50 feet.

- All new buildings and structures in all zoning districts within University Heights shall be no less than 15 feet high.
- b. **Materials.** Materials for the exterior walls of new buildings and structures shall be the same as or similar to materials prevalent in the University Heights Historic District. Permitted materials include brick, narrow gauge horizontal clapboards four or less inches in exposed width, stone, stucco, smooth shingles or combinations of the above provided the combinations occur in a manner and location similar to the materials on existing buildings in University Heights (e.g., brick on first floor with clapboard on second floor). Other materials, such as aluminum or vinyl must be visually compatible with buildings in the visually related area. The following materials are prohibited: concrete block, asbestos, wide clapboards over four inches in exposed width, diagonal boards, vertical boards, rough sawn wood, rough split shingles, shakes.
 - c. **Visual Size.** The gross area of the front facade, i.e., all walls facing the street, of a single-family, two-unit or commercial building shall be no greater than 125% of the average gross area of the front facades of buildings in the visually related area. The gross area of the front facade of a multiple family dwelling shall be no more than 125% of the average gross area of the front facades of all buildings within the visually related area or variations in the setback shall be designed in the front facade of the building to repeat the rhythm and proportions of buildings to space between them within the visually related area.
 - d. **Roof Shape.** The shapes and pitches of roofs on new buildings and structures shall be similar to the roof shapes and pitches on existing buildings within the visually related area.
 - e. **Roof Materials.** Roofing materials on new buildings or structures shall be similar in appearance to roofing materials used on buildings within the visually related area. Modern-style shingles, such as thick wood shakes, dutch lap, french method and interlock shingles, that are incompatible with the historic character of the district are prohibited. Rolled roofing, tar and gravel and other similar roofing materials are prohibited except that such materials may be used on flat or slightly sloped roofs which are not visible from the ground.
 - f. **Parking Lots.** No new parking lots will be approved unless they are accessory to and on the same zoning lot as a commercial building or multiple family dwelling. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)
2. **Accessory Buildings.** Accessory buildings, as defined in Section 28.03(2) of the Madison General Ordinances, shall be compatible with the design of the existing buildings on the zoning lot, shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height and shall be as unobtrusive as possible. No accessory building shall be erected in any yard except a rear yard. Exterior wall materials shall be the same as those for construction of new principal buildings as set forth in Section 33.19(12)(f)1.c.

Staff Comments and Recommendations:

Staff notes the following changes in the recently submitted materials:

1. The floor plan shape has changed.
2. The window size has changed.
3. The skylights have changed.
4. The driveway retaining walls, guardrails, and canopy have changed.

5. The building height has changed.

The comments below relate to the Ordinance sections above:

- 1a. The proposed residence is less than 35 feet and 2 ½ stories. The building is 15'-0" tall.
- 1b. The proposed exterior wall materials (brick) are the same as other materials prevalent in the historic district and are used on other existing buildings within the VRA. The brick material was previously approved.
- 1c. The gross area of the front façade is less than 125% of the average gross area of the front facades of buildings in the VRA. The overall width of the front elevation has decreased slightly from the previously approved 78'-0" width, and therefore meets this criterion.
- 1d. The proposed flat roof is similar to other roof types on existing buildings in the VRA. The roof type has not changed and was previously approved.
- 1e. The proposed roofing materials (plants – real or synthetic) are not similar in appearance to roofing materials used on buildings in the VRA; however, the Ordinance does allow for the use of prohibited materials on flat roofs which are not visible from the ground. The exception allows one to interpret that a "green roof" is acceptable within this standard. Staff believes that a green roof has aesthetic benefits to the neighboring properties and in this case, the material contributes to the architectural composition of the proposed structure. The roof material was previously approved.
- 1f. Not applicable.
- 2. Not applicable.

The Applicants have addressed numerous conditions of approval and Staff will continue to work with them on the outstanding conditions.

Staff recommends that the proposed changes be approved and amended to the previously granted Certificate of Appropriateness.