



City of Madison

City of Madison
Madison, WI 53703
www.cityofmadison.com

Meeting Minutes - Approved URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

Wednesday, September 17, 2014

4:30 PM

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.
Room LL-110 (Madison Municipal Building)

CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

Present: 7 - Dawn O. O'Kroley; Cliff Goodhart; John A. Harrington; Richard L. Slayton; Melissa R. Huggins; Thomas A. DeChant and R. Richard Wagner

Excused: 1 - Lauren Cnare

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by O'Kroley, seconded by Goodhart, to Approve the Minutes of August 20, 2014 and August 13, 2014 (Bus Tour). The motion passed by voice vote/other.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

DISCLOSURES AND RECUSALS

Huggins: #2 and recused on #18.

SECRETARY'S REPORT/AGENDA OVERVIEW

SPECIAL ITEMS OF BUSINESS

1. [35365](#) Creating Sections 31.101 and 31.041(3)(a)8. of the Madison General Ordinances to allow decorative coverings of vacant storefronts in the Downtown Core and Urban Mixed-Use districts and establish permit and application fees for said permit.

This item was approved as a consent item.

This Ordinance was RECOMMEND TO COUNCIL WITH THE FOLLOWING RECOMMENDATIONS - PUBLIC HEARING

2. [35496](#) Report of the Facade Grant Staff Team - 216 State Street, Orpheum Theater. 4th Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by Huggins, seconded by Harrington, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

3. [35497](#) Report of the Facade Grant Staff Team - 1148 Williamson Street,

Solidarity Realty. 6th Ald. Dist.

This item was approved as a consent item.

A motion was made by Huggins, seconded by Goodhart, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

4. [35498](#)

Report of the Facade Grant Staff Team, 2733 Atwood Avenue - Community Care Veterinary Clinic. 6th Ald. Dist.

This item was approved as a consent item.

A motion was made by Huggins, seconded by Goodhart, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

5. [33109](#)

202 East Washington Avenue - Redevelopment of the "Pahl Tire" Site for a 10-Story, 146-150 Room "AC Hotel by Marriott Hotel" in UDD No. 4. 2nd Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by O’Kroley, seconded by Harrington, to **REFER** based on a finding that the “exceptional design” standards for additional height were not addressed. The motion failed on a vote of (3-4) with O’Kroley, Harrington and Goodhart voting yes, Huggins, DeChant, Slayton voting no, with Chair Wagner voting no to break the tie.

On a motion by Huggins, seconded by DeChant, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (4-3) with Huggins, DeChant and Slayton voting yes, O’Kroley, Harrington and Goodhart voting no, with Chair Wagner breaking the tie.

A motion was made by Huggins, seconded by Goodhart, to Grant Initial Approval. The motion passed by the following vote:

Ayes: 4 - Richard L. Slayton; Melissa R. Huggins; Thomas A. DeChant and R. Richard Wagner

Noes: 3 - Dawn O. O’Kroley; Cliff Goodhart and John A. Harrington

Excused: 1 - Lauren Cnare

6. [34641](#)

Consideration of a demolition permit to allow demolition of an auto repair facility and four-unit dwelling to allow construction of 164-room hotel at 202 E. Washington Avenue and 15 N. Webster Street; 2nd Ald. Dist.

The Chair voted Aye to break the tie.

A motion was made by Huggins, seconded by Goodhart, to Return to Lead with the Recommendation for Approval to the PLAN COMMISSION. The motion passed by the following vote:

Ayes: 4 - Richard L. Slayton; Melissa R. Huggins; Thomas A. DeChant and R. Richard Wagner

Noes: 3 - Dawn O. O’Kroley; Cliff Goodhart and John A. Harrington

Excused: 1 - Lauren Cnare

7. [35010](#) SUBSTITUTE Creating Section 28.022 - 00140 and Section 28.022 - 00141 of the Madison General Ordinances to change the zoning of property generally addressed as 202 East Washington Avenue, 2nd Aldermanic District, from DC (Downtown Core) District and 15 North Webster Street, 2nd Aldermanic District, DR1 (Downtown Residential 1) District to PD(GDP-SIP) (Planned Development (General Development Plan- Specific Implementation Plan) District to demolish an auto repair facility and a four-unit apartment to allow construction of a 164 room hotel.

A motion was made by Huggins, seconded by DeChant, to Return to Lead with the Recommendation for Approval to the PLAN COMMISSION,. The motion failed by the following vote:

Ayes: 4 - Richard L. Slayton; Melissa R. Huggins; Thomas A. DeChant and R. Richard Wagner

Noes: 3 - Cliff Goodhart; John A. Harrington and Dawn O. O'Kroley

Excused: 1 - Lauren Cnare

ROLL CALL

Present: 6 - Dawn O. O'Kroley; Cliff Goodhart; John A. Harrington; Richard L. Slayton; Melissa R. Huggins and R. Richard Wagner

Excused: 2 - Lauren Cnare and Thomas A. DeChant

8. [32837](#) 2504 Winnebago Street (East Washington Avenue and Milwaukee Street) - PD(GDP) for the Union Corners Development. 6th Ald. Dist.

The motion noted that this should not set a precedent for buildings along public street fronts that do not have any pedestrian penetrations (door to street).

A motion was made by Goodhart, seconded by Huggins, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

9. [34366](#) 2401 East Washington Avenue - PD-SIP, Phase 1 of UW Health Clinic and Signage Plan at Union Corners in UDD No. 5. 6th Ald. Dist.

The motion noted that this should not set a precedent for buildings along public street fronts that do not have any pedestrian penetrations (door to street). The motion also approved the proposed signage for the project.

A motion was made by Harrington, seconded by Goodhart, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by the following vote:

Ayes: 4 - Cliff Goodhart; John A. Harrington; Melissa R. Huggins and Dawn O. O'Kroley

Noes: 1 - Richard L. Slayton

Excused: 2 - Thomas A. DeChant and Lauren Cnare

Non Voting: 1 - R. Richard Wagner

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

10. [32683](#) 441 North Frances Street - Revisions to a Previously Approved Project - The Hub at Madison. 4th Ald. District.

The motion provided for address of the Commission's comments, and the following to be approved by staff:

- Integrate color and texture of stucco tower with other adjacent building elements.
- Regarding ventilation openings for first floor commercial/retail storefront on streetside elevations, all louvers shall be located with the same continuous horizontal band above storefront systems specific to window openings and be blackout or be glass, and attempt to use adjacent tenancy's installations if possible.

A motion was made by Huggins, seconded by Goodhart, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by the following vote:

Ayes: 4 - Cliff Goodhart; Richard L. Slayton; Melissa R. Huggins and Dawn O. O'Kroley

Abstentions: 1 - John A. Harrington

Excused: 2 - Thomas A. DeChant and Lauren Cnare

Non Voting: 1 - R. Richard Wagner

11. [35359](#) Creating Section 28.022 -- 00147 of the Madison General Ordinances to change the zoning of property located at 126 South Carroll Street, 4th Aldermanic District, from DC (Downtown Core) District to PD (Planned Development) District and approving a General Development Plan and Specific Implementation Plan to demolish a parking ramp to construct a mixed-use building with 7,500 square feet of commercial space, 96 apartments and 550 underground parking stalls.

A motion was made by Harrington, seconded by Huggins, to Return to Lead with the Recommendation for Approval to the PLAN COMMISSION. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

12. [35356](#) Creating Section 28.022 -- 00146 of the Madison General Ordinances to change the zoning of property located at 115 South Hamilton Street and 25 West Main Street, 4th Aldermanic District, from DC (Downtown Core) District to PD (Planned Development) District and approving a General Development Plan and Specific Implementation Plan to construct an addition to an existing office building at 25 W. Main Street.

A motion was made by Harrington, seconded by Huggins, to Return to Lead with the Recommendation for Approval to the PLAN COMMISSION. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

13. [31497](#) 9414 Silicon Prairie Parkway - Modified Plans for a Previously Approved Conditional Use for a Proposed Seven-Building, 248-Unit Multi-Family Residential Development. 9th Ald. Dist.

The motion instructed the project's architect to include heating/cooling details on exterior elevations as part of the original approval process in the future.

A motion was made by Slayton, seconded by Huggins, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

14. [34510](#) 633 North Henry Street - Minor Alteration to Approved PD(SIP) -

Proposed Exterior Lighting Plan. 2nd Ald. Dist.

The motion provided for approval of first floor lighting only, with upper lighting to be Placed on File per Tim Park's Planning Division staff report.

A motion was made by Huggins, seconded by Goodhart, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

NEW BUSINESS

15. [35508](#) 5025 Sudbury Way - Public Project - Elements Welcome Center. 3rd Ald. Dist.

This item was approved as a consent item.

The applicant was encouraged to study the overhangs, fascia and soffit with staff to celebrate some building form a bit more.

A motion was made by Huggins, seconded by Goodhart, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

16. [35425](#) 601 Langdon Street - Addition to Existing Hotel for Top Floor Restaurant and Rooftop Terrace. 8th Ald. Dist.

This item was approved as a consent item.

A motion was made by Huggins, seconded by Goodhart, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

17. [34915](#) Consideration of an alteration to an approved Planned Development (General Development Plan and Specific Implementation Plan) to allow construction of additions to a hotel at 601 Langdon Street; 8th Ald. Dist.

This item was approved as a consent item.

A motion was made by Huggins, seconded by Goodhart, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

ROLL CALL

Present: 5 - Dawn O. O'Kroley; Cliff Goodhart; John A. Harrington; Richard L. Slayton and R. Richard Wagner

Excused: 3 - Lauren Cnare; Melissa R. Huggins and Thomas A. DeChant

18. [35494](#) 707-709 Rethke Avenue - Madison Supportive Housing Project for 60 Studio Apartments. 15th Ald. Dist.

The Urban Design Commission Received an Informational Presentation

BUSINESS BY MEMBERS

-New training sessions for board and commission members.

-John Harrington gave a report on landscape failures. In a review of seven projects approved by the UDC, he found that only 1 or 2 came close to matching their submitted proposed plans. This is an enforcement issue. Addresses should be submitted for Building Inspection and Zoning Inspectors to look into. The Chair suggested an experiment wherein they select at least

10% of the projects one year later to see if their landscape plans have been implemented. For example, the Taco Bell on Whitney Way is nothing but gravel mulch. Dunkin' Donuts apparently did not follow their submitted landscape plans at all. Zoning used to do this on a consistent basis and is starting to get back up to the level of doing systematic checks. Matt Tucker needs to be sure that the people he is hiring to enforce these issues are knowledgeable enough to do so. There was discussion that when violations are reported, the property owner should be required to remove what doesn't follow their submitted and approved plans.

-The Secretary noted that a special meeting for discussing Policies and Procedures could be scheduled for October 22, 2014.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was Adjourned at 8:15 p.m. by unanimous consent.