



City of Madison

City of Madison
Madison, WI 53703
www.cityofmadison.com

Meeting Minutes - Approved URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

Wednesday, July 9, 2008

4:30 PM

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.
Rm LL-110 (Madison Municipal Building)

CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

Barnett arrived at 4:50 during Item Number 1.

Present: 8 -

Marsha A. Rummel; Todd R. Barnett; Bruce F. Woods; Richard L. Slayton;
John A. Harrington; Bonnie A. Cosgrove; R. Richard Wagner and Lou W.
Host-Jablonski

Excused: 1 -

Jay B. Ferm

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Woods, seconded by Rummel, to Approve the Minutes.
The motion passed by voice vote/other.

PUBLIC COMMENT

ANNOUNCEMENTS

-Meeting reminders

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

1. [10706](#) 2501 and 2601 West Beltline Highway - Comprehensive Design Review. 14th Ald. Dist.

The motion noted satisfaction of the criteria required based on the integration between the elements of the comprehensive sign plan and the overall architecture and site design and layout of the "Arbor Gate Development." The motion required the following:

- Instead of 6 front and 2 end signs on the secondary sign band, reduce to 2 end signs and 4 front signs with no signs over projecting window boxes, with the first floor signage approved as proposed except for the deletion of sign type 8-1B. All other first floor signage types approved, including

ground signs and directionals.

- The four front and two end signs within the secondary sign band shall come back to the Urban Design Commission for approval of the specific design and layout.
- The reason for approval is because it is a Comprehensive Design Review, where it is felt the merit for this particular architecture deserves this flexibility.
- The projecting signs shall be eliminated with the text added to maintain the alignment of the signage within the secondary sign band depicted on the elevations as contained within the packet.

A motion was made by Wagner, seconded by Barnett, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

2. [10521](#)

822-844 John Nolen Drive - New Construction of a Hotel and a Restaurant in Urban Design District No. 1. 14th Ald. Dist.

The motion required address of stated concerns relevant to providing tree landscaping adjacent to the walkway within the surface parking area, understory plantings in tree island such as grand covers with expanded details on how they relate to the main drive aisle approach.

- Bring infill vegetation up to and into the interior patio courtyard; get rid of the formal aspect.
- Provide more details on the sweep and architecture of the upper roof canopy and the hotel's corner.

A motion was made by Cosgrove, seconded by Harrington, to Grant Initial Approval. The motion passed by the following vote:

Excused: 1 -

Jay B. Ferm

Ayes: 7 -

Marsha A. Rummel; Todd R. Barnett; Bruce F. Woods; Richard L. Slayton; John A. Harrington; Bonnie A. Cosgrove and R. Richard Wagner

Noes: 1 -

Lou W. Host-Jablonski

SPECIAL ITEM OF BUSINESS

3. [11077](#)

Amending Sec. 28.03(2), creating Sec. 28.04(18)(e); repealing Secs 28.08(2)(c)16., 28.08(9)(c)5., 28.08(11)(c)9., 28.12(13)(a)10.d.; renumbering current Secs. 28.12(13)(a)10.e. through g. to Secs. 28.12(13)(a)10.d. through f., respectively; amending Secs. 30.01(3)(b)5., 30.01(5)(b); repealing Secs. 30.01(9)(c)9. and 11.; renumbering current Sec. 30.01(9)(c)10. to Sec. 30.01(9)(c)9.; amending Sec. 30.05(2); repealing Sec. 30.05(5); renumbering current Secs. 30.05(6) through (17) to Secs. 30.05(5) through (16), respectively; amending Sec. 30.05(9); repealing 30.05(11)(e); creating new Sec.

30.05(13)(d); renumbering current Secs. 30.05(13)(d) through (f) to Secs. 30.05(13)(e) through (g); creating new Secs. 30.05(13)(h), 30.05(15)(b), 30.05(15)(c); renumbering current Secs. 30.05(15)(b) and (c) to Secs. 30.05(15)(d) and (e); and repealing Sec. 33.19(12)(d)3.; renumbering Sec. 33.19912)(d)4. through 11. to 3. to 10.; repealing Sec. 33.19(12)(f)1.f.; renumbering Sec. 33.19(12)(f)1.g. to f.; repealing 33.19(13)(d)8. and renumbering Sec. 33.19(13)(d)9. through 13. to 8. through 12., respectively of the Madison General Ordinances to update provisions relating to solar/wind systems.

On a substitute motion by Wagner, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **VOTED TO NOT RECOMMEND APPROVAL** of Legistar I.D. 11077, Amending Sec. 28.03(2), creating Sec. 28.04(18)(e); repealing Secs 28.08(2)(c)16., 28.08(9)(c)5., 28.08(11)(c)9., 28.12(13)(a)10.d.; renumbering current Secs. 28.12(13)(a)10.e. through g. to Secs. 28.12(13)(a)10.d. through f., respectively; amending Secs. 30.01(3)(b)5., 30.01(5)(b); repealing Secs. 30.01(9)(c)9. and 11.; renumbering current Sec. 30.01(9)(c)10. to Sec. 30.01(9)(c)9.; amending Sec. 30.05(2); repealing Sec. 30.05(5); renumbering current Secs. 30.05(6) through (17) to Secs. 30.05(5) through (16), respectively; amending Sec. 30.05(9); repealing 30.05(11)(e); creating new Sec. 30.05(13)(d); renumbering current Secs. 30.05(13)(d) through (f) to Secs. 30.05(13)(e) through (g); creating new Secs. 30.05(13)(h), 30.05(15)(b), 30.05(15)(c); renumbering current Secs. 30.05(15)(b) and (c) to Secs. 30.05(15)(d) and (e); and repealing Sec. 33.19(12)(d)3.; renumbering Sec. 33.19912)(d)4. through 11. to 3. to 10.; repealing Sec. 33.19(12)(f)1.f.; renumbering Sec. 33.19(12)(f)1.g. to f.; repealing 33.19(13)(d)8. and renumbering Sec. 33.19(13)(d)9. through 13. to 8. through 12., respectively of the Madison General Ordinances to update provisions relating to solar/wind systems, but if approved require actual approval by the Director of the Planning and Community & Economic Development Department, not a designee with the Director empowered to ask for additional advice and feedback from relevant committees and commissions such as the Landmarks Commission and the Urban Design Commission. The motion was passed on a vote of (7-1) with Cosgrove voting no.

In its discussion on the motion the Urban Design Commission affirmed its support for solar/wind systems but noted the need to make a strong statement that the State statute and ordinance amendment as presently before it ignore important matters as to design and aesthetics.

A motion was made by Wagner, seconded by Rummel, to Return to Lead with the Following Recommendation(s) to the PLAN COMMISSION. The motion passed by the following vote:

Excused: 4 -

Todd R. Barnett; Bruce F. Woods; John A. Harrington and Jay B. Ferm

Ayes: 4 -

Marsha A. Rummel; Richard L. Slayton; R. Richard Wagner and Lou W. Host-Jablonski

Noes: 1 -

Bonnie A. Cosgrove

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

4. [10286](#) 2317 Allied Drive - Allied Neighborhood Revitalization, Phases I and II, PUD(GDP) and Phase I, PUD-SIP. 10th Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by Wagner, seconded by Harrington, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

5. [09860](#) 3001 South Stoughton Road - New Construction for a Commercial Building in Urban Design District No. 1. 16th Ald. Dist.

The motion to refer at Ald. Compton's urging noted the need to address the

Alder's comments relevant to the use of EIFS and corrugated steel, especially its vertical application around the rear of the building, in addition to the following:

- Provide a better rear elevation treatment with less use of corrugated metal, as well as EIFS on all elevations.
- Not enough landscaping along rear boundary to provide sufficient screening.
- Brick and metal could be used on front of part of an integrated design.
- On back of building the verticality of the metal siding an issue, rendering doesn't speak to quality, provide profiles of metal siding samples.
- The placement of dumpster outward of the building should be adjusted. Square up the building along with sufficient screening in conjunction with proposed plantings.

A motion was made by Wagner, seconded by Rummel, to Refer to the URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

6. [07629](#) 520 East Johnson Street - PUD(GDP-SIP), Relocated Three-Unit Building. 2nd Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by Barnett, seconded by Cosgrove, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by the following vote:

Excused: 1 -

Jay B. Ferm

Ayes: 7 -

Todd R. Barnett; Bruce F. Woods; Richard L. Slayton; John A. Harrington; Bonnie A. Cosgrove; R. Richard Wagner and Lou W. Host-Jablonski

Noes: 1 -

Marsha A. Rummel

7. [06302](#) 119, 123 & 125 North Butler Street and 120 & 124 North Hancock Street - PUD(GDP) and PUD-SIP for a New 38-Unit Apartment Building with the Retention of Two Existing 2-Unit Buildings. 2nd Ald. Dist.

The motion required that further development of the green roof include a pond/rain garden amenities, including additional landscaping and improvements to walkways to return to staff for approval.

A motion was made by Slayton, seconded by Harrington, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Harrington, seconded by Woods, to Adjourn at 9:13 p.m. The motion passed by voice vote/other.