

AGENDA # 7

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: September 1, 2010
TITLE: 4620 Frey Street (Formerly 700 Block Segoe Road) - PUD(SIP) for "Hilldale Place Apartments." 11th Ald. Dist. (18649)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: September 1, 2010	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Mark Smith, Dawn O’Kroley, Todd Barnett, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, R. Richard Wagner, Melissa Huggins and Henry Lufler, Jr.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of September 1, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(SIP) for “Hilldale Place Apartments” located at 4620 Frey Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were J. Randy Bruce, representing Stone House Development; Mike Sturm, representing Ken Saiki Design; and Ald. Chris Schmidt, District 11. Bruce presented revised details addressing the Commission’s comments of the previous meeting. Stalls for bike parking have been increased from 3 to 6 at each location. Bike parking has also been added off of University Avenue (four stalls). The steel trellis originally planned has been changed to columns with steel bars running across. This uses a permanent piece of architectural screening as well as the ability to have landscape screening vertically during the growing season. Sturm addressed the landscaping issues by looking at the main concourse of Hilldale and their plant palette. They have omitted the Skyline Honey Locust as far as street trees. Details of the bioretention area as previously proposed were noted, in addition to an option that provides for a more usable/active lawn area with the front courtyard area. They discussed the possibility of turning two vehicle parking stalls into moped parking for sixteen mopeds, depending on market needs. Transoms have been removed from some windows and more transoms added to other windows. The canopy elements have been changed from off white to an iron gray color to give it more of an urban context. Comments from the Commission were as follows:

- Suggest adding flowering species to bioswale area.
- The second option for the bioswale allows for more trees and is more elegant.
- Take a look at the placement of the handicapped parking stall; it is effecting the grade change.
- I like the addition of the verticals on trellis feature ties back to the architecture of the building as shown. Page A-22 versus that shown on the display board.
- Think about a three dimensional trellis.
- Appreciate the finesse with reworking the façades and fenestration; it’s making this even better.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Lufler, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-0). The motion noted that the applicant should look at

grading at the Frey Street entry where handicapped accommodation forces an extreme pattern with the version of the arbor/trellis as detailed on Sheet A-22 featuring the fin concept approved with tower concepts as shown and final plans to be approved by staff.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 7, 7.5 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 4620 Frey Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	6	5	-	-	5	6	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	8
	6	7.5	7	-	-	6	7	7.5
	7	7	6	-	-	7	7	7

General Comments:

- Wonderful project!