



**Project Name/Address:** 1431 Spaight  
**Application Type:** Certificate of Appropriateness  
**Legistar File ID #** [40096](#)  
**Prepared By:** Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Gavin Macaulay  
**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations including the installation of siding and the replacement of windows.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location:** The subject site is located in the Marquette Bungalows Historic District

### Relevant Historic Preservation Ordinance Sections:

41.25(5) Standards for the Review of Exterior Alterations and Repairs. All exterior alterations and repairs must be compatible with the historic character of the structure and the Marquette Bungalows Historic District.

- (a) Re-Siding. Re-siding with aluminum or vinyl that replaces or covers clapboards or non-original siding on structures originally sided with clapboards will be approved by the Landmarks Commission provided that the new siding imitates the width of the original clapboard siding to within one inch and provided further that all architectural details including, but not limited to, window trim, wood cornices and other ornament either remain uncovered or are duplicated exactly in appearance. All trim must continue to project out beyond the plane of the siding. Brick, stucco, and half-timber detailing shall match the original in appearance. Original wood shingle siding should be repaired or replaced to match the original in appearance, whenever possible; however, covering wood shingles with double-four vinyl or aluminum may be approved.
- (f) Windows and Doors.
  - 1. General Standards. The original appearance of leaded glass and other non-rectangular decorative windows (e.g., curved top windows) on any facade of the structure shall be retained. Replacement of such windows shall duplicate the original in size, configuration and appearance. Picture windows are prohibited. Trim on new or remodeled windows shall match the original window trim on the structure.
  - 2. Street Facades. Windows and doors on the front or street facade of the structure and on side faces within ten (10) feet of the front facade of the structure shall retain their original or existing appearance, including true muntins where they exist. Replacement windows and doors may be approved if they match the original appearance.
  - 3. Non-Street Side Facades. Retention of the original appearance of windows and doors on the sides of the structure is encouraged. However, if replacement or new windows are proposed, the muntin design of the original windows on the structure may either be replicated with true-divided lights or with exterior or interior applied grids or with grids applied between the panes of glass. New windows shall either be casement windows or double-hung windows. Sash on new windows over four (4) feet square shall be divided by muntins or mullions. Bay windows may be

approved if they have sides perpendicular to the wall and if they do not extend beyond the eaves of the roof.

4. Rear Facade. Replacement, remodeling or installation of new doors and windows on the rear facade will not be restricted except as discussed under "General Standards" above.

## Analysis and Conclusion

A brief discussion of 41.25(5) follows:

- (a) The proposed siding is vinyl. It is assumed that the existing aluminum siding will be removed and the relationship between the plane of the siding and the plane of the window trim will remain the same.
- (f)
  1. The original decorative curved top window is being retained and restored.
  2. The front windows are 3-over-1 double hung and while the glazing has not been maintained, the sash cords are broken, and there are some areas of deterioration, the windows seem to be original and are in fair to good condition. Information about the replacement window product has not been provided for review, but the submission materials note that the replacement windows will have a historically appropriate appearance. The replacement windows on the street façade and 10 feet down each side of the building must have "true" muntins which are simulated divided light at a minimum. Flat muntins with a "tape-like" appearance or muntins that are only on the exterior of the glass are not appropriate.
- 3/4. It is assumed that the same replacement unit window manufacturer will be used for all windows so the windows on the remainder of the sides and rear would have the same qualities described above.

## Recommendation

Staff believes that more information is needed for the Commission to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness and recommends that the Commission either refer the item to the October 5 meeting or allow the Applicant to work with staff.

If the Applicant provides the information and the proposed replacement window will meet the ordinance standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness as discussed in this report, staff recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions of approval:

1. The Applicant shall document any original elements that are exposed under the aluminum siding.
2. The Applicants shall confirm that the aluminum siding is being removed and that the existing window trim will remain exposed.
3. The Applicant shall provide manufacturer information regarding the replacement window product details that meet the ordinance standards.