



City of Madison Department of Planning and  
Community and Economic Development  
Planning Division  
215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd., Suite 017  
P.O. Box 2985, Madison WI 53701-2985  
Phone: (608) 261-9134  
[madisonart@cityofmadison.com](mailto:madisonart@cityofmadison.com)

## Metro Transit Public Art Project - Community Feedback on Proposals

### Actual Size Artworks Proposal – Time Traveler

The vintage bus used in this project unfortunately invokes painful memories for a large portion of the community, given the era's segregation and racist policies around transport. I don't think using it in such a visible project would benefit the community and would actively harm a lot of the people who actually use public transportation in Madison. It also sends a message: using a bus shelter as the case for the bus display is ironic, given how few bus stops in Madison actually have bus shelters and how many people have no protection from the elements while waiting at bus stops. Does the city really have money to provide a vintage bus with bus shelters, but not its constituents? Finally, the way this project fills the space feels incomplete— in that it doesn't.

I feel that a large-scale mural will be more impactful than a sculpture or installation—consider that even passing cars will see a full-wall mural.

Seems fun. Bus and history centered. I love the idea of using the old bus for something, just not sure if this is the right project for it.

I really like the proposal by Jenie Gao. It fills the space well, it looks like it was carefully researched and planned, and it's understandable when driving past it, riding the bus past it, and when walking by it. I like how it uses both nature and humans and features a diverse cast of people in it! Madison is diverse and I want to see that in our murals.

These artists have some unique skills and have made some neat installations before. However, putting a vintage bus inside a bus shelter seems a bit silly. I don't personally see how this at installation will add any beauty to the area

I am not really sure what the point of this artwork is. It would be distracting from the road, and yet does not really fill the space at all. It does not really represent the history of Madison, and the majority of the artist's budget is just building a shelter and concrete base around the already existing bus. Frankly I would rather have another shelter built in town. I am also concerned about the time period this "vintage" bus is from and sincerely hope it is post-segregation.

Incorporating the historical bus is very interesting. I would like to know more about whether the bus from 1934 would have been segregated in any way. The current proposal for the bus shelter has a somewhat cage-like appearance. If it could be designed to be larger and with an area that people could also access for shelter, separate from the part that enclosed the bus, I would consider it to be a more viable proposal.

I find this underwhelming and don't really understand the point. I don't think it utilizes the space at all. While the vintage bus is cute, it could be displayed anywhere.

I think that the optics of building a shelter for a bus are bad when there are some stops where people wait in the elements with no shelter. The installation also doesn't focus on the rider, so I don't think it will resonate with the community. Finally it doesn't fill the space adequately to justify the budget.

While interesting, this feels like the least striking of all the submissions.

Not a practical use of money and disconnected from Madison community.

A bus in a box? Does not have the visual impact of a mural.

I watched all four of the presentations and this one felt extremely "off" to me. I was surprised that the the proposal did not take the entirety of the site into consideration. The technical aspect of the shelter for the vintage bus seemed very undeveloped and even if developed was not, in my opinion, going to hold up under weather, vandalism and maintenance upkeep. The concept did not seem to be a good fit for the whole of the site in the context of demographic, visual impact and practicality. I felt like it treated the project as an insider joke that only a few people would find amusing.

"Given the consistent concerns about bus shelters in Madison, I find this proposal cheeky but (unintentionally) in poor taste. While I appreciate that the 1930s bus is of sentimental importance to many of the transit workers and is of historical significance, I'm not sure that this proposal ultimately uses the space well or does justice to the bus itself. While I understand that it is fragile, I think enclosing it ultimately makes me question why it isn't preserved more carefully in another location.

Unlike many of the other proposals, this project does not make an extensive use of the exterior space. Because it is showing a sheltered bus, I would appreciate it more if this proposal also provided shelter or a resting space for pedestrians. I think ultimately the joke, quirkiness or charm is fairly one-note. Is this is calling back to the 1930s? Or it is supposed to illustrate the use of the bus for urban farming? Or is it supposed to be about the significance to the transit workers? Or is it supposed to be about preserving this one small part of Madison history?

I am also concerned about insects and glare, as one of the MAC members indicated. I think this could easily become an eyesore with an extensive need for maintenance."

I did not see their presentation. (I might be confusing Actual Size Artworks with DiBari, the one I saw was about creating a shelter for the vintage bus. (see below).

I like the proposal, but I feel it fails to fill the space intended to be devoted to artwork.

As a bus rider, it is kind of insulting to think that the city would spend \$100,000 on a bus shelter for a vintage bus and light-up chicken, and not actually put a shelter for people out there. It sounds like the artists came up with this idea based off of conversations from the Metro Transit employees - if the employees like it and want to see it happen, maybe they could work with Actual Size Artworks to make it happen, however I do not feel this is going to set a good precedent (being the first % for art project), for city public art.

"I find it to be a bit strange to choose a vintage bus used during an era of racial segregation on public transportation! As someone who lives in a nearby, diverse neighborhood, I find it appalling to highlight such an odd racist relic. I'm also confused about how this project is supposed to fill any space, since it doesn't. You'd maybe see it for a second as the bus drives by, not really the experience that the art installation could and should have.

In addition, let's talk about how many bus stops do not have shelters, meaning that bus riders often have no protection from wind or rain while waiting. So it's better to build something around an art piece and not people? That's a bit insulting."

I thought this one was boring and not a good use of the space. It also didn't strike me as having much to do with the larger, diverse community

This concept was poorly thought out - what does it say to bus riders if we can build a structure for a bus, but don't have one for people? Especially given this projects proximity to a location that ships folks experiencing homeless away from the area?

I like the "self-contained" aspects of this proposal which is independent of changes to the building, and the tie in to transportation history. The touch of whimsy with the chicken is very much a Madison appropriate idea as well.

This concept, while preserving a piece of Madison history, does not effectively bring beauty to the large swath of building that is proposed as the backdrop. Also, since the story of this bus is not widely known, perhaps the importance and connection of community to this art piece might get lost or not recognized as it could be elsewhere, because so many more people pass by in a vehicle instead of walking.

I don't feel like this project does much to beautify the exterior of the building. I was born in Madison and have lived in or nearby for nearly 40 years but I don't recognize that old bus and putting it in a bus shelter is quirky but not generally meaningful or attractive.

This proposal just seems silly. The city doesn't need to pay \$56K for a special custom-built shelter to show off a historic bus, just put it in a lobby or something. It's a lot of money for an installation that will have minimal visual impact and makes poor use of the available space.

This piece is confusing. I don't understand why we would stick an old bus inside a bus shelter and put a chicken in it. The artists seem to want to promote a pretty obscure story into lore for some reason, but one person can't promote a story to urban legend, even if they are given a public art budget to try. Lore and legends don't work that way. I've only lived in Madison for 20 years, but almost no one I know knows these "lore" stories. This piece seems out of touch.

This is not a fit for our city.

Maintenance would be on going. People won't be able to see it. And its concept/story that doesn't speak to Madison's diverse residents, just a few.

This proposal doesn't make use of the long wall corridor either."

On this proposal, looks like the artist are more focused on their own experience and joy, rather than in what will do a service to the community. The scale of their piece also fails to fit the monumentality of Washington avenue and the building itself.

While a fun idea, I feel this proposal falls short on the potential of the project. Most people won't even notice the old bus as they drive by. And while it may tell a quirky story, it misses an opportunity to tell the story of what Madison is today. With the cost of the proposal, I think a lot more could be done.

I love the fact that there is an actual artifact from Madison's history on display, and the history is entertaining — I feel that the majority of the public will not notice/see the isolated work as they pass by on East Washington, and might prefer to see the restored bus in a venue that invites more up-close interaction with viewers

The vintage bus is interesting, but I would like to see the wall of the building utilized for the artwork.

This project-putting a bus under a shelter-doesn't really resonate with me. It doesn't tell much of a story about Madison, and is very literal. It's not inspiring or very interesting-there's no human element. It also isn't very eye catching due to the lack of color. It doesn't use much space along the visible building either. Not a lot of bang for your buck, if you ask me.

First and foremost, the artistic value of this piece is very small. Visually, a vintage bus encased in glass does not feel like a piece of beautiful and engaging public art, but rather like well-protected property. I don't see how this project celebrates our community or will inspire community members. Using a bus shelter as the case for the bus display is, in fact, insulting to the community that utilizes public transit, given how few bus stops in Madison have bus shelters and how many people have no protection from the elements while waiting at bus stops. In addition, the vintage bus recalls a time in Madison when public transit was racially segregated. I see no reason to celebrate that time in

Madison's history and am concerned this could be insulting to many of the folks in Madison who utilize public transit on a regular basis. To put it bluntly, I think this piece is ugly and offensive. The amount of money it would require to install and maintain would be better spent on a different artist's proposal.

This submission seemed to be deeply lacking in both creativity and use of the full space available. Given this city's problematic history of efforts to prevent people from sleeping in bus shelters while not funding sufficient housing options for people struggling with homelessness, it is not really the aspect of Madison Metro that we want highlighted. I think the reality is that people will try to seek actual shelter in this "art", both the bus and the shelter itself. Using a vintage bus also focuses people away from a time when transportation was available to all people and all the current and future efforts the Metro seems to be making in moving toward sustainability. Please do not choose this option, it's a terrible use of funds and doesn't even seem to be art.

This proposal is not a good use of space - it doesn't actually use the space. It's also unfortunate that the vintage bus gets a shelter when many actual bus stops do not have shelters around Madison.

This proposal is completely inadequate for the architectural scale of the site, the values of the city, the point of this call, and displays a galling lack of self-and, community awareness- to the point of resemblance to a 'Portlandia' comedy sketch. (They've even "put a bird on it".) If it were merely irrelevant to, and out of touch with, actual riders of the metro, that would be understandable from a cloistered academic team, but it is tone-deaf to the point of offensive; it is exactly the wrong kind of urban anthropology to represent Madison's values. It suggests unmistakably a time when buses were still segregated, and worse, attempts to raise it to the level of fine art, by no more original a concept than lazy recontextualization. While some Parisian critics found this approach 'cute' or 'clever' in 1917, back when a readymade WAS still an innovative concept of Marcel Duchamp's, 105 years later in 2022, it will draw only the negative responses R.Mutt's urinal "fountain" received. It confusingly uses funds intended to improve the building's facade, by ignoring it entirely, and engages viewers primarily by spending a large portion of said budget on a shelter for an inanimate object, at both greater expense and dimensions than many of the ACTUAL bus shelters the riders of metro lines need. This proposal is truly disappointing from a team with so much experience. I'm glad a few metro employees got to lovingly restore a legitimate antique that they have a real, and deep connection to; but that is painfully few collaborators or stakeholders to consult for a budget of this size, and for an a project of this impact, which needs to be an iconic landmark. This highlights so many metrics by which Madison looks worse, but not in a tongue-in-cheek way that might suggest how things can be improved, but an unsophisticated nostalgia with an insultingly minimal amount of artistic effort that a budget of this size could enable from artists who live here. This would have been appropriate for a history museum, but if it is just going to sit under glass, it would have been better used as a chicken coop.

The idea of protecting a fragile bus with a newly built shelter while people so often stand in the elements to wait for transportation is not something that I find appealing. The shelter limits visibility and is an afterthought rather than an integral part of the artistic vision that I think they are trying to put forward.

"The vintage bus used in this project unfortunately invokes painful memories for a large portion of the community, given the era's segregation and racist policies around transport. I don't think using it in such a visible project would benefit the community and would actively harm a lot of the people who actually use public transportation in Madison.

"Not a fan of making a sculpture where the bus is put into a bus shelter, like how are we even supposed to see it or interact with it? There's no space for it inside the shelter, they'd need to make it bigger so we can interact with it. Also maybe I just couldn't find it, but do the solar panels provide all the energy offset needed to light up the project?

As a quirky project, I think this could go well in the Madison Children's Museum or the Zoo or a local museum if we could do it. It's a pretty good idea, but I don't think this is the place for it. I'd recommend it to another contest. "

The scale of the piece is not appropriate for the project site. The imagery of a vintage bus locked into a shelter does not create a connection to the community. I strongly oppose this proposal.

The old bus should definitely be made available for public viewing, but this proposal isn't so much "art" as it is an historic installation. Putting it in a jewel box shuts it off from the community and more inclusive exploration.

It's a cool concept, but such a small offering for that entire open space.

Using a historical item directly connects to the community and the facility. The scale allows both pedestrians and vehicular viewers to enjoy. Concern about the bus shelter element, keeping it free from critters and keeping the clear panels from getting hazy over time.

"I felt this proposal was not well thought out. For starters the piece did not fill the space well. Secondly I have concerns about how the Actual Size Artworks were inspired by the "social good" of public transit but were so focused on elevating a bus from a time period when segregation was still legal. Additionally, I did not appreciate how the artists became defensive when asked about this in their interview. Moreover, Actual Size Artworks felt the need to try to convince viewers to see it the way they do. To me "social" should be represented through people, not an object. As someone who has ridden buses out of necessity at multiple points in my life (I've lived in Madison for my entire 29 years of life) I have spent hours waiting for buses in inclement weather. It feels weird to me to have a shelter serve as a piece of art when many metro bus stops do not provide shelter for customers. I also have concerns about long term maintenance of this piece due to all the moisture in Madison.

It's a cool idea, but doesn't feel scaled to the space. I would love to see the old bus made into something but it just feels a bit small for this installment.

The vintage bus idea as well as the people from Wisconsin idea both feel disconnected from the larger focus of the project. As a resident of Madison for over 8 years, there is no connection to the community to either of those ideas, and there are many concerns about the historical and contemporary issues that neither project addresses well. There are also issues of originality, and I feel like both projects aren't taking the opportunity to fully engage in the intended space and make it unique and creative. The project pitched by Jenie Gao is one that would aesthetically be pleasing as well as addresses the importance of community and identity that is unique to Madison.

Using the length and height of the majority of the wall carries the viewers' attention from beginning to end. Each section flows smoothly from one to another.

"Doesn't take up any of the space of the wall. Boring. Doesn't connect with the community. Idolizes a time in our past where we systemically segregated whole communities by placing a mechanism of segregation (The Bus) on a literal pedestal. That idea actually sickens me enough that I would participate in acts of vandalism to this structure.

Also I am amplifying my BIPOC sister, as we must do in this age:

The vintage bus used in this project unfortunately invokes painful memories for a large portion of the community, given the era's segregation and racist policies around transport. I don't think using it in such a visible project would benefit the community and would actively harm a lot of the people who actually use public transportation in Madison. It also sends a message: using a bus shelter as the case for the bus display is ironic, given how few bus stops in Madison actually have bus shelters and how many people have no protection from the elements while waiting at bus stops. Does the city really have money to provide a vintage bus with bus shelters, but not its constituents? Finally, the way this project fills the space feels incomplete— in that it doesn't. "

Most engaging of all the proposals. Fun and humorous and craftsmanship unequalled. I would pick this one

The shelter wrapping the vintage bus felt squeezed and uncomfortable. I could see maintenance becoming a real issue over time. the chicken concept/history may be lost on the wider public. the bus is cool though.

The size and location of the bus as well as the necessity of its enclosure make it hard for the community to engage with it, though it is a beautiful bus and a charming idea

While I appreciate some of the past work this team has done and their stated aims for this particular project (public transportation as a common good), I found the idea of essentially caging a vintage bus in a bus shelter a bit odd. The past use of the vintage bus as a chicken coop is an interesting aside, but I doubt whether there is sufficient substance to build a public artwork around that story and simply displaying the bus. Perhaps the bus could be used in a future transit or other museum, where it could be contextualized in the overall story of transportation in the city, with questions about whom that bus served (U.W. Campus as the destination sign suggests?) and whom that bus did not serve.

Seriously? Not a very well thought out plan! So much money spent on squashing a nice old bus into a way-too-close, too-confining bus shelter?? Even if made more spacious, still would invite ridicule! Please do not do this! it would not enhance the property at all..

The visual impact of this proposal seems very low. An old bus in glass will not change the site and improve its neighborhood.

I will echo what others have said—this vintage bus used in this project unfortunately invokes painful memories for a large portion of the community, given the era's segregation and racist policies around transport. The way the design fills and uses the space is incomplete and not especially visually appealing to the range of both motorized and pedestrian or cycling traffic in the East Washington corridor.

I like this project a LOT! But I like it as a piece of conceptual artwork, and I don't know that I see it best serving the public of Madison as a piece of public art tied to a infrastructural system that serves the entire community.

## Debra Aschheim Proposal – Time Machine

This proposal disappointed me. I don't think Deborah did much research on the actual community of Madison, much less the people who take the bus. The idea of celebrating the history of transportation in Madison, starting in the 1880s, not only has the same problems around whitewashing the racist history of transit and celebrating white supremacy and the violence against Black Madisonians, but also erases the Indigenous communities of the area who were here long before 1880 and horse-drawn buggies used as public transit. We are on Ho-Chunk land—where are the dugout canoes? This erasure is another slap in the face to Madison's frequently overlooked Indigenous community. I'm also concerned with the amount of vinyl this project uses— that's a lot of plastic waste. For a proposal that claims to envision a greener future for Madison, it misses the mark.

History centered. Seems more impactful to pedestrians than bus riders.

The theme for this art is more for a museum it book. I don't believe it is relatable for most of the community. A variety of small of artworks for this installation won't be viewable to drivers or riders. The sidewalk is far enough from the building the pedestrians won't see them we'll unless they choose to leave the sidewalk.

I think this piece could be more aesthetically pleasing. The large brick wall is an excellent space for a mural, and yet the use of space looks awkward here both in spacing and size of the portraits. They would be hard to see from a distance, and especially with leaves on the trees. I also think choosing the 1880's as a starting point for transportation is a bit odd. Transportation did not start suddenly in the 1880's and I would be interested to see the various boats, bicycles, canoes, etc employed both before 1880's and also including Indigenous modes of transportation. Perhaps having a detailed history that goes back farther would also help fill the awkward spaces between the murals while avoiding erasure of Indigenous peoples.

The style of this mural is nice, but I don't think the proposal actually reflects the population of bud riders well.

The scale of these pieces doesn't fit the scale of the installation and could be distracting to people driving by.

Aschheim's proposal doesn't feel particularly creative or like a good use of space.

Not inspiring and disconnected from community.

I'm less interested in this proposal. I would prefer a design that uses or fills most of the space.

"I was disturbed by the fact that this 'history of Madison transit' started with the area's settlement by European immigrants. The area has a story — and Native peoples were in transit — long before settlement. This habit of starting history where it's attractive and convenient is a common one within white culture, and it needs to be broken.

In addition, the artwork was sufficiently detailed that it seems it would be hard to see from a moving vehicle. "

"I appreciated that Deborah came from out of town and did thoughtful sketching and discussion with the staff from the metro transit system. I was hoping that the sketches took a conceptual and structural leap when the proposal moved from sketchbook to the long exterior walls of the site. When this did not happen I felt there was a missed opportunity. The proposed technical connection to the wall was explained in a hasty way and felt undeveloped. I realize the Deborah would be coming to Madison for more discussions with the community but the quality of the proposal was not something I was drawn to see developed at the proposed scale. I also would have like to see her utilize local resources for printing the panels etc.

"This proposal disappointed me. Starting in the 1880s to celebrate the history of transportation in Madison erases Indigenous communities and oversimplifies painful (and ongoing) histories of transit inequities and segregation. I'm also concerned with the amount of vinyl this project uses.

If this piece is about the historic trajectory of transportation, I am not sure it's about speaking about Madisonians versus a larger (and somewhat generic) history of public transit. If it's specifically about Madisonians, then I still feel that it is oversimplified."

The individual "paintings" were interesting, but I wasn't sure about the negative space between the panels, or the sustainability of the panels. The inclusion of diverse images was noteworthy, but the lack of local voices in the research of the project, compared to Jenie's "oral histories" was evident in the two presentations.

I think this project does not reflect the existing art style of Madison, nor does it strike me as particularly interesting. It looks more like an old world Wisconsin painting.

I sensed a lack of commitment and forethought on the proposal, and am concerned about what that will say for the budget, timeline, and ultimate implementation of the plan. When met with push-back, the artist basically backtracked on the whole idea, which was unsettling. Also unsettling to hear the artist want to display a history of transit in the area starting with colonization in the 1800s with 'buggies' - we know there are people who were here before colonization, it's a disservice to the people of this city and area to ignore that history and only present the window in time that she plans to portray. I liked that this artist took time to talk to local people, and that they committed to having the printing done locally, keeping the money in Wisconsin. As far as the aesthetic, using line drawings and watercolor, it is beautiful and subtle, however I am worried about how it will come off from a distance. Even if you're walking on the sidewalk there on E Wash, you're still sort of far away from the building. The renderings were not sufficient to give confidence to this point.

"How could we have a history of transportation if it only covers the last hundred years? With the amazing excavation of a dugout canoe from the lake this past year, I find it so disappointing that the artist overlooked this—I don't think Madison needs another art installation that whitewashes and ignores the history of this place before white European settlers showed up, we have enough of that already.

It also sends the message that the city and Madison Metro are completely unconcerned with making a greener future, which I hope isn't the case. Vinyl, which this project utilizes an enormous amount of, is made from petroleum. There are sustainable materials out there."

The sketches were fine, but not particularly exciting. I was also concerned that it seemed like mostly white people were being represented, but it was hard to tell from the size of the sketches. It wasn't something that I found very compelling and seemed to overlook some problematic history around racism and transportation.

I like the use of the long horizontal space to express travel through time, and the transportation themed artworks. One concern might be the depiction of local businesses which could be construed as advertising and favor some places over others in the community. I am concerned the scale of pictures on a wall might not be very engaging from a vehicle passing by the work.

While this concept is a good use of the large space provided, I don't believe it represents the community. It demonstrates an appreciation for the history of Madison Metro, but overlooks the diversity of our community and the modes of transport prior to the 1880s. There are no people of color represented in the mural and thus highlighting Madison's racist past, rather than focusing on the strength of our community derived from all the many different people who live here now and in the past.

These works are definitely too small to see well from the road and I think that is important for this location both for safety reasons and because it is a transit building.

This is not a real proposal, this is a request by an artist for the city to pay them while they fart around and come up with something that fits into the generic "installation" they've suggested.



Meh. Unoriginal and again, rather dated. This doesn't really excite me. I wouldn't go visit it, I wouldn't enjoy looking out the window of the 6 at this in the slightest.

"Love her research exploration in our community to represent it. Conceptually it doesn't wow me but I like how she does the art. Because of the scale it seems a little disjointed though.

I'd love to see something like this on a smaller scale maybe in the city elsewhere

I wasn't a big fan of the subject matter of busses through time when thinking about what that means for our diverse population"

The use of the space as a traditional gallery, displaying rectangular canvases, is zero attractive, also focusing the proposal on the history and past more than The present and the community is missing an opportunity.

I don't like the disjointed nature of the panels in this proposal. Having the unevenly spaced and disparate drawings doesn't give this as much of a sense of a single, cohesive piece. I would also like to see the panels made in Wisconsin, if not Madison, rather than Quebec.

I really like the city- and site-specific references to Madison's history of public transit, and would like to see the images and information laid out in this timeline format to study and see — The visual impact of so many little isolated panels on the side of the long building is a little underwhelming and hard to read from any distance further than that of a pedestrian ... sort of antithetical to the transit-theme. Not sure I'm a fan of the sketchy/watercolor pen-and-ink style of the images, which will seem dated very quickly.

While I appreciate that this proposal uses the full wall available and incorporates Madison imagery, I think the size of the paintings will be hard to see across the street and so will be less enjoyed by travelers. It won't have the same impact as a large scale piece.

While Deborah's proposal aims to tell a story about the history of transit in Madison, it doesn't quite provide the impact that I think this space could provide. It is also very literal-images of buildings that are already in the neighborhood doesn't really engage-it just makes a factual statement, "this building exists." Like Grampa's pizzeria. Yup, it exists. Also, the watercolor style is a bit detailed and muddled-I don't think people driving by would really be able to take in the detail of the images, and they are so small for the space that they would be hard to see from the street. It doesn't use up a great deal of the available space on the building either.

This piece is okay. I feel it takes a fairly generic approach to a public art project and doesn't feel particularly inspiring or engaging to me. Although I appreciate Deborah's attempt to engage the community in the process, I think someone with local ties would be more successful with a piece that attempts to represent our community. Although seeing the evolution of transit is interesting, it is similarly problematic as Actual Size Artworks in that it erases the negative aspects of that history. It also blatantly erases the history of transit pre-colonization. As Madison - also known as Teejop - is on Ho-Chunk land, it would only be right to include their methods of transit as well (dugout canoes). As Madison's Indigenous community is already frequently overlooked and erased, despite being such a vital and vibrant part of our city, I am not in support of this proposal.

"While somewhat original, I think it will be hard to experience this art while going past the site and the details are not quite a fit for the majority of those experiencing it by driving past or riding a bus past it.

The concept is racist - a history of transportation in Madison since the 1880s erases the Indigenous communities who were here before then.

Perfectly fine, inoffensive, very much like ad campaigns already used by the metro, and does not occupy the space in a way that changes it.

I don't think Deborah did much research on the actual community of Madison, much less the people who take the bus. The idea of celebrating the history of transportation in Madison, starting in the 1880s, not only has the same problems around whitewashing the racist history of transit and celebrating white supremacy and the violence against Black Madisonians, but also erases the Indigenous communities of the area who were here long before 1880 and horse-drawn buggies used as public transit. We are on Ho-Chunk land— where are the dugout canoes?

I don't like the idea of her coming into Madison for "community engagement" when we have local artist Jenie Gao that already has done the work and is working with our own community and lived here, has Deborah ever lived here because looking at her work it's mostly in CA and the West Coast?

The "timeline" style of mural is a worn out concept (and given that this mural will be in place for a long time, it will freeze the present into the future). A nostalgia for old, inaccessible buses does not represent what our city and transit agency stands for. I strongly oppose this proposal.

The multi-panel design of this proposal is an inappropriate scale for this site. People in cars, buses, and even bikes will not be able to see or experience the art as they pass by, and the large setback from the sidewalk will make experiencing the art difficult even for pedestrians.

There's a lot to like about Deborah's idea and design, but I don't think the time machine concept will be as meaningful years down the line. It's missing a timelessness and a future-focus. Also, too much of the building is visible behind the art pieces.

The concept and showing the history of Metro directly connects to the community and the facility. The scale and spacing of the art seems dwarfed on the large wall and seems best viewed by pedestrians. Having fewer panels but larger would have a bigger impact to those driving by and better to mask the current dull wall.

"This proposal is stale. The proposed art does not fill the entirety of the space and there appears to be more blank wall than art. Moreover, it's nothing I haven't seen before and the choice of vinyl as the main material is not eco friendly. The artist's inspiration seems to come from a history of transportation, more specifically a white washed version. It's shameful not to include the original innovation of transportation in Teejop, HoChunk dug out canoes. I don't see this piece as being relatable to most people who ride the bus and demonstrates a lack of knowledge about all of the communities in Madison.

I like the style of the art and the local focus. However, it seems like the canvases are small relative to the building facade.

"Although it meant well, this project did not feel like it was well researched on the actual community of Madison, much less the people who take the bus. There is a long history of Madison being the center for many communities in terms of travel, and it feels like there was so much missing from her project. Additionally, what seemed like a celebration of transportation is actually a form of erasure as she doesn't address the BIPOC communities that make up most of Madison and who use the bus the most.

"Every about this presentation feels non-exciting, boring even. The artist clearly has put no thought into our community yet. Compare this against a local artist who already has done the work and delivered a complete product.

Also I am amplifying my BIPOC sister, as we must do in this age:

This proposal disappointed me. I don't think Deborah did much research on the actual community of Madison, much less the people who take the bus. The idea of celebrating the history of transportation in Madison, starting in the 1880s, not only has the same problems around whitewashing the racist history of transit and celebrating white supremacy and the violence against Black Madisonians, but also erases the Indigenous communities of the area who were here long before 1880 and horse-drawn buggies used as public transit. We are on Ho-Chunk land—

where are the dugout canoes? This erasure is another slap in the face to Madison's frequently overlooked Indigenous community. I'm also concerned with the amount of vinyl this project uses— that's a lot of plastic waste. For a proposal that claims to envision a greener future for Madison, it misses the mark. "

This proposal disappointed me. I don't think Deborah did much research on the actual community of Madison, much less the people who take the bus. The idea of celebrating the history of transportation in Madison, starting in the 1880s, not only has the same problems around whitewashing the racist history of transit and celebrating white supremacy and the violence against Black Madisonians, but also erases the Indigenous communities of the area who were here long before 1880 and horse-drawn buggies used as public transit. We are on Ho-Chunk land— where are the dugout canoes? This erasure is another slap in the face to Madison's frequently overlooked Indigenous community. I'm also concerned with the amount of vinyl this project uses— that's a lot of plastic waste. For a proposal that claims to envision a greener future for Madison, it misses the mark

Nice drawings, but are too detailed and complicated to read from a distance. The white rectangular panels look unfinished and swallowed up by the scale of the architecture.

The images of people and antique transportation are the most engaging of the collection, but as a whole it fails to inspire. If I wanted to see Willy St while driving, I'd drive down Willy St.

I liked the parts of this work that represent the staff of Madison Metro and the types of jobs that are necessary to keep the buses running. I'm less enamored of starting the story in the 1800s. Since people were living here before that, we've been trying to move toward acknowledging and including those stories, rather than glossing over them. And while Ms. Aschheim's drawings are lovely and she depicts a wide range of bus riders, this seems to be artwork that should be appreciated at close range. People driving by or riding on a bus would just catch fleeting glimpses of the work. The spaces between the panels also doesn't seem to take full advantage of the total wall surface that is available as a canvas. Regarding fabricators, at least one is Wisconsin-based, which is a plus.

Deborah Aschheim's proposal will be perceived as more than a little bit patronizing and categorizing, seemed to put people in "types." which means that many would glance and quickly look away. For that reason alone, we should not accept it.

This proposal strikes me as tedious and redundant. Why do we need pictures of buildings a few blocks away on the side of the Metro building?

Again, I will say that idea of celebrating the history of transportation in Madison, starting in the 1880s has the same problems around whitewashing the racist history of transit and celebrating white supremacy and the violence against Black Madisonians. It also erases the Indigenous communities of the area who were here long before 1880 and horse-drawn buggies used as public transit. We are on Ho-Chunk land— where are the dugout canoes? This erasure is another slap in the face to Madison's frequently overlooked Indigenous community.

I like that this proposal connects to the people and fabric of Madison, but I am concerned its formal implementation is too generic and anticipated.

## Vito DiBari & Associates Proposal – Wisconsin Wall of Fame

This proposal is actually offensive. I don't see how it connects to the Madison community at all. Not all of these "famous Wisconsites" are from Madison, nor do they necessarily have a connection to the community here. This idea shows a lack of research and a lack of respect for the Madison community and our concerns, thoughts, and diverse cultures. Vito has no connection to the city of Madison or its community and that is reflected in his proposal. In terms of design and use of space: the idea leaves a lot of blank space in between each portrait frame that could be much better utilized. It would really suck to cut down all of those beautiful trees for a project that doesn't even use the entire wall. I also find the idea of downloading an app in order to interact with the mural in augmented reality both cumbersome and worrisome: cumbersome because 1. providing a QR code to the app download doesn't guarantee that everyone will be able to access it, as not everyone's phones can read QR codes; 2. there is no consistent source of wifi nearby over which an augmented reality app can be downloaded. Do you expect passersby to use their data? What if they have limited data? What if they don't have data? Not everyone has access to unlimited cell phone data (I have 4gbs/mo and I use all of them) and this excludes everyone who can't download an app over their data. Unless the Metro transit building wants to provide free wifi to everyone on the street? Is that financially feasible?-- and worrisome, because technology advances at an extremely rapid pace. It won't be long before this app's functionality is obsolete and dated at best, unusable at worst. What happens when the app is too old to download on the phones available five or ten years from now? Will it be updated consistently to work on the latest devices and operating systems? Will it be updated to use the latest in augmented reality technology, or will it be left to decay as a dated piece of the 2020s? No one will want to use it-- it has the potential to become very tacky very fast.

I enjoy the concept and technique behind these portraits, but I feel that the design is less cohesive and visually stunning given that it does not cover the entire wall. I also think that portraits of famous individuals (especially when isolated from a cohesive historical narrative or theme) is less resonant than Jenie Gao's and Deborah Aschheim's representations of a cross-section of anonymous Madisonians. I feel that these portraits would better serve a public indoor space, where their scale would look more impressive and where they could be accompanied by wall text explaining more about these individuals.

I love the many portraits idea. Also very pedestrian focused and the AR is fun.

A variety of paintings on the side of the building won't be visible by anyone driving in the road or riding in vehicles. Did he take any community input?

I don't think an out-of-townie with a wealth hoarde should be painting a mural to represent our city.

This is pretty much the same mural that can be found in many places. I have seen portraits like this in museums. Even the application itself seems like it was copied and pasted from a previous application to a different city. They leave a lot of empty space and would not be all that visible from the road. Because of their size, it also looks awkward to view them from the sidewalk. This will result in the death of the grass around there if people choose to get a closer view. I would also prefer to have something that shows the history of Madison, rather than celebrities from all of Wisconsin. It also seems unclear how exactly community feedback on the 40 portraits would happen and whether people of Madison would get a say in this.

This does not seem like a good utilization of the space and does not capture Madison well.

The proposal is conceptual but doesn't include enough detail to be fully considered (the subjects are not yet determined). This piece also lacks a Madison community feel. While the people may be Wisconsinites, the choices may or may not resonate with the Madison community. The installation does not focus on the rider or any aspect of transit. The pieces will also be small when driving by.

Doesn't reflect Madison community.

"This would be cool to look at if I was walking by, but it feels less cohesive as a piece. Broken up individual portraits with blank space separating them.

Also seems like it could be distracting to drivers trying to see the images due to size. "

I dislike the fact that this concept focuses on individual achievement rather than community strength. The bus is for \*everyone\*, whether or not you win awards or achieve fame.

This proposal felt very dated to me. When the proposed paintings were described as "pop art" I felt that this already aged the concept. I was also concerned that the changing nature of people in the Madison community and the historical Wisconsinites proposed to be "painted" in frames were something that didn't address the more broad spectrum of the stories of the community. I did appreciate that there was a very understandable technical drawing of how the panels would be attached to the wall. A concern I also have was that there was a "10 year" life-span of the panel quality before reprinting would need to be addressed. I was hopeful about this proposer because of the previous work that was shown the the presentation. However, the quality of the Madison proposal did not meet the expectation that was set at the beginning.

"This is not a particularly unique or novel proposal, and is not particularly aware of or sensitive to the Madison community historically or contemporarily. The use of space is sporadic and awkward — I don't find the design cohesive or dynamic.

I also believe that, for drivers, these portraits of historic figures will either be lost entirely or distracting. I think the QR code interface is clunky and far from innovative. While there is some pedestrian traffic throughout the year on this block, I am not sure that it feels like a space conducive to the contemplative and in-depth observation of forty unique biographies. I think the pop-art style portraits in the proposal will age poorly.

This project does not seem to be responsive to the site or the significance of the Metro Transit Maintenance facility and seems incredibly arbitrary (not all the famous Wisconsinites are from Madison, have concerns about who is represented and in what capacity, etc.)"

Interesting notion for a different project, or a complementary installation, but didn't have the breadth or inclusion or sustainability of Jenie's idea. Really didn't seem to address (other than the history of the bus/artifact) the community engagement and public art work component of the directive.

I enjoy this idea, but I do not think the project reflects Madison, simply Wisconsin. And even that, from a "Google Search" research point of view, not a resident point of view. The pictures seem to be too small as well to be "readable" from traffic. I am also concerned as to the time span that it will take for this project to be finished, as well as the budget.

Every time Mr. DiBari said how surprised he was that "Wisconsin was so interesting", and that there were "actually so many interesting people from here" was a dig- embarrassing and insulting. To have someone who doesn't really even know any living people from the area (did he even take the time to visit?), be the first artist awarded with the % for art commission would be really sad and set a disappointing precedent. The presentation did not feel personalized for Madison. I am concerned about the upkeep and ongoing costs associated with the "VR" component. Although that technology is on the cutting edge for right now, I worry it might get quickly outdated and have high associated upkeep costs - I also question how useful it would be when you could just as easily google any one of the people on your phone anyways. If this is selected, I think the city needs to think long and hard about who is included and who is not, and what their policy and plans might be in the face of any public controversy associated with those people - as we know from the demonstrations last summer, monuments are not neutral, and who has a statue or picture up means something about the character and values of the people there.

"To me, this idea is unoriginal and reads as a recycled pitch from another Wisconsin city's proposal, even going as far as wanting to cut down trees to make the space fit the art, rather than aiming for art that fits the space and fits our city. Most of the people I know appreciate our tree-lined streets and would actively disagree with removing even more greenery from the E Wash corridor, which has been built up very quickly in recent years.

This art project also highlights an access disparity by focusing heavily on a QR code/app thing (requiring people who have certain smartphones AND data/broadband to boot). I think right now this is a trendy thing for short-term exhibits that get taken down and rely on today's exact tech, but for something intended to be a long-standing, public installation, it feels like a misstep, and the proposal doesn't seem to account for any long term costs to handle updates/maintenance."

Terrible. Really, no connecting to Madison, to riders who use the system regularly, to the local communities. Do we really need more pictures of "famous Wisconsites"????

The portraits don't seem to utilize the advantages and size of the space. I am concerned the choice of subjects can be a political minefield. Also the associated "tech" idea of an app seems good, but I am concerned who will maintain that app. I have seen too many abandoned websites and blogs accompanying books, etc. that don't keep up with technology and changes that keep it relevant.

This concept could be hard to see from far away, with such a large backdrop, but each image is small. While it is a cool idea, for residents and tourists alike, to learn about the famous people who are from Madison/WI, I worry that the majority of the people in the list provided are white folk. People of color make up a large percent of the population in Madison and of those who ride the buses, and by focusing this piece on majority white past residents, it speaks volumes to Madison's racist past and doesn't pave the way for a future where more POC residents are recognized for their accomplishments and lifted up for all yo see. There are plenty of BIPOC Madison leaders and admirable people (maybe not famous) in our community that deserve to be included even if they are not famous on a global/national scale.

Celebrity portraits are extremely tacky. What message does it send to have portraits of wealthy people with a loose connection to Wisconsin on a public transit building? I strongly dislike this one. This is the worst of the group.

This seems very redundant. There are plenty of existing installations with famous people from X or walks with important people to a particular location, in many other cities and Madison already. I also have concerns about the longevity of the AR support and the installation panels themselves.

Ugh. Please no more walks of fame. These kinds of works, ESPECIALLY for small cities usually do the opposite of what is intended—small city hall of fames are honestly just NOT that impressive, so this ends up making our community seem more of a sleepy backwaters than it actually is.

It feel generic- not a great fit for our city

Again, this proposal looks like should be redirected to the overture galleries.

I'd like to see this focus only on Madison individuals since it is the Madison Metro bus barn, not a state venue. But I question the sole focus on famous people. Shouldn't we also elevate those who have been influential in the direction of the city? Community leaders, activists, groundbreaking politicians. The expected 10 year lifespan feels limiting. I would like to see materials that we can expect to last several decades.

The Leroy Neiman-esque images are a little less than appealing, and while the people are Wisconsin-connected, they are not necessarily all Madison-connected (I also note that the image and description of psychic Jeane Dixon was accidentally labeled for Liberace — oops). The visual impact of so may little isolated panels on the side of the long building is a little underwhelming and hard to read from any distance further than that of a pedestrian; the smartphone connection assumes viewer participants \*have\* this technology available, and that there will be the

creation and ongoing support of an app or website to facilitate this (the standing QR code signs also need some design love...)

Is there a connection to Metro transit that I am missing? The design could go anywhere.

While I appreciate that this proposal uses the full wall available, I think the size of the paintings will be hard to see across the street and so will be less enjoyed by travelers. It won't have the same impact as a large scale piece.

These images are bright and colorful, but also just portraits of famous people. Famous people are already elevated and venerated in society. Do we need another altar to celebrity? I think about Madison, our Wisconsin idea, our state motto, Forward. Does looking back at famous people engage the community or inspire us to be different or better, or does it just codify the status quo, normative values of the majority? This doesn't do it for me, and also kind of makes me mad. This doesn't represent the community I live in.

The fact that Vito DiBari focuses so much on tourism in his proposal really turns me off. This proposal is the one that seems the least connected to Madison and our community. Although being able to say, "so-and-so was from Madison" is great, I don't think a celebration of celebrity will serve our community. If this piece is meant to attract tourists, I can only begin to imagine the impact of road and foot traffic on one of our main thoroughways. The tech aspect, although very cool and futuristic, also seems counterintuitive to me. Public art, in my opinion, should be accessible to all community members. This art piece assumes that everyone has access to a smartphone, that the smartphone reads QR codes, and that they have sufficient data in their plan to download an augmented reality app. Those are some HUGE assumptions. Even if one has all three of those things, would said person go to the lengths to download said app? I personally wouldn't. By taking inspiration primarily from the large population of young tech professionals in Madison, we erase all the other important folks who make this city home. Many of whom are being forced to move further from downtown as rent prices increase and neighborhoods become hip and trendy. This art piece shouldn't just be for the young or the tourists. It should be a spot that folks living in Madison want to come see. A piece they spot on their commute down E Wash that brightens their day. Vito DiBari is very clearly not a Madisonian and did not even try to consider what would be meaningful to our community as a whole. He just wants to make something trendy. And - another thing a public art piece should be is LASTING.

This proposal feels like a cut and paste format used for public art proposals anywhere. These people are not all from Madison and don't seem to have a reason why they were chosen. Please do not choose this minimal effort five minute google search submission. We deserve better site specific work and a focus that is at least current or future oriented.

The heavy use of the QR codes in this concept concerns me - it will be outdated quickly and is exclusive to those in the community who don't have smartphones or who have limited data.

I'm glad he found a wikipedia page listing famous Wisconsinites, it's a pity so few of them are from Madison. For a better, more integrated and intersectional example of this very approach, see the city of Baraboo's expandable, inclusive and local hall of fame mural.

This corridor is not a heavily walked area so the details of the images will be seldom viewed. The concept of choosing "famous people from Wisconsin" is problematic in so many ways - from who is chosen to who is doing the choosing.

"I don't see how it connects to the Madison community at all. Not all of these "famous Wisconsinites" are from Madison, nor do they necessarily have a connection to the community here. This idea shows a lack of research and a lack of respect for the Madison community and our concerns, thoughts, and diverse cultures. Vito has no connection to the city of Madison or its community and that is reflected in his proposal. In terms of design and use

of space: the idea leaves a lot of blank space in between each portrait frame that could be much better utilized. It would really suck to cut down all of those beautiful trees for a project that doesn't even use the entire wall.

I also find the idea of downloading an app in order to interact with the mural in augmented reality both cumbersome and worrisome: cumbersome because 1. providing a QR code to the app download doesn't guarantee that everyone will be able to access it, as not everyone's phones can read QR codes; 2. there is no consistent source of wifi nearby over which an augmented reality app can be downloaded. Do you expect passersby to use their data? What if they have limited data? What if they don't have data? Not everyone has access to unlimited cell phone data (I have 4gbs/mo and I use all of them) and this excludes everyone who can't download an app over their data. "

why are we centering Madison Metro on tech, like it's not the tech workers taking the bus, they are driving Teslas and other expensive cars, the idea itself is not bad and the app is actually kinda cool, but the framing is all wrong like this dude clearly belongs in a more metro city setting like Seattle, NYC or SF

The proposal lacks a connection to our community. Yes, the portraits are meant to be of famous Wisconsinites, but would we have seen those people in our community, riding the bus? Would they look like those riding the buses past the artwork? I strongly oppose this proposal.

The multi-panel design of this proposal is an inappropriate scale for this site. People in cars, buses, and even bikes will not be able to see or experience the art as they pass by, and the large setback from the sidewalk will make experiencing the art difficult even for pedestrians. And there sure are a lot of white men in the list of 80 potential portraits. I didn't examine the list closely, but didn't notice any indigenous people at all.

Like Deborah's, this proposal is so focused on Wisconsin's past; it isn't forward thinking enough. It also doesn't cover enough of the building for my taste. Lastly, it doesn't seem like the portraits will be very visible from the opposite side of East Wash.

Celebrities are already glorified with awards and in museums. This lacks a connection to the actual people of the Madison community and has no connection to Metro itself. Concern with the use of QR code, the longevity of the technology being used along with the physical QR being able to withstand environmental elements and still being scannable. Scale and quantity of the artwork is only appropriate for pedestrians.

"Messy. That's all I can say about this one. Too much blank wall space and people who don't even have strong ties to this land are celebrated. I'm really struggling to see any relation to public transit in the proposed piece. This whole concept is so elementary and the lack of ties to the community is glaring. It's offensive that this would even be considered as public art, like a Google search could have gotten me more relevant info. The augmented reality aspect is so out of touch. I work in a public library and the amount of transit customers who don't have a phone, let alone a smartphone is significant. I know this because it's a common request to print paper bus schedules because customers do not have access to the metro bus app. This art piece would just further signify the gentrification of Madison metro...I'd rather keep the wall blank if it was this or leaving the building as is...

Lovely paintings, but they feel disconnected from the purpose of a bus maintenance facility. I also strongly dislike the emphasis on high-tech, trendy interaction that will exclude those who don't have access to smartphones.

I struggle with how Vito was selected for this opportunity. His project has very little research on Madison as a whole, and the project doesn't focus on the city itself. It felt like the proposal was thrown together and lacked any originality or creativity. Although the idea of using an app to interact with the work seemed unique, there is the issue of how it would be designed, much less how to have the Madison community interact with it. This project was disconnected and didn't seem as put together as the other two.



I dislike the AR component, as a technologist by trade I fear the technology will simply die to quickly to be enjoyed. Also dislike that it is a series of portraits, there is simply not enough BIPOC people on this list. I also dislike bringing in a ""Big City Artist"" when we have plenty of talent right here at home.

Also I am amplifying my BIPOC sister, as we must do in this age:

This proposal is actually offensive. I don't see how it connects to the Madison community at all. Not all of these "famous Wisconsites" are from Madison, nor do they necessarily have a connection to the community here. This idea shows a lack of research and a lack of respect for the Madison community and our concerns, thoughts, and diverse cultures. Vito has no connection to the city of Madison or its community and that is reflected in his proposal. In terms of design and use of space: the idea leaves a lot of blank space in between each portrait frame that could be much better utilized. It would really suck to cut down all of those beautiful trees for a project that doesn't even use the entire wall. I also find the idea of downloading an app in order to interact with the mural in augmented reality both cumbersome and worrisome: cumbersome because 1. providing a QR code to the app download doesn't guarantee that everyone will be able to access it, as not everyone's phones can read QR codes; 2. there is no consistent source of wifi nearby over which an augmented reality app can be downloaded. Do you expect passersby to use their data? What if they have limited data? What if they don't have data? Not everyone has access to unlimited cell phone data (I have 4gbs/mo and I use all of them) and this excludes everyone who can't download an app over their data. Unless the Metro transit building wants to provide free wifi to everyone on the street? Is that financially feasible?-- and worrisome, because technology advances at an extremely rapid pace. It won't be long before this app's functionality is obsolete and dated at best, unusable at worst. What happens when the app is too old to download on the phones available five or ten years from now? Will it be updated consistently to work on the latest devices and operating systems? Will it be updated to use the latest in augmented reality technology, or will it be left to decay as a dated piece of the 2020s? No one will want to use it-- it has the potential to become very tacky very fast.

This proposal is actually offensive. I don't see how it connects to the Madison community at all. Not all of these "famous Wisconsites" are from Madison, nor do they necessarily have a connection to the community here. This idea shows a lack of research and a lack of respect for the Madison community and our concerns, thoughts, and diverse cultures. Vito has no connection to the city of Madison or its community and that is reflected in his proposal. In terms of design and use of space: the idea leaves a lot of blank space in between each portrait frame that could be much better utilized. It would really suck to cut down all of those beautiful trees for a project that doesn't even use the entire wall. I also find the idea of downloading an app in order to interact with the mural in augmented reality both cumbersome and worrisome: cumbersome because 1. providing a QR code to the app download doesn't guarantee that everyone will be able to access it, as not everyone's phones can read QR codes; 2. there is no consistent source of wifi nearby over which an augmented reality app can be downloaded. Do you expect passersby to use their data? What if they have limited data? What if they don't have data? Not everyone has access to unlimited cell phone data (I have 4gbs/mo and I use all of them) and this excludes everyone who can't download an app over their data. Unless the Metro transit building wants to provide free wifi to everyone on the street? Is that financially feasible?-- and worrisome, because technology advances at an extremely rapid pace. It won't be long before this app's functionality is obsolete and dated at best, unusable at worst. What happens when the app is too old to download on the phones available five or ten years from now? Will it be updated consistently to work on the latest devices and operating systems? Will it be updated to use the latest in augmented reality technology, or will it be left to decay as a dated piece of the 2020s? No one will want to use it-- it has the potential to become very tacky very fast.

Wisconsin celebrities are cool and the execution looked solid. Appreciated the lighting aspect for night viewing. But the proposal doesn't really tie in to the local community or riding a bus.

Lacks real connection to and understanding of Madison, our community, and culture. I would feel let-down and disappointed while driving past this unoriginal work. Please, no.

"The pop art style is lovely but the idea is so painfully boring with such little substance. "Celebrities! Viral! AR!"

I have concerns about potential pedestrian traffic it could cause and I'm not interested in downloading an app for which I'll have to create an account for which I'll have to give my email address just to engage with community art.

I think focusing on the 18-44 age demographic, although it represents 50% of the city's population, leaves out too many other city residents. The art gallery style presentation and use of the space also seems to favor pedestrian viewing; people in transit on E. Washington would not get much out of seeing this installation in motion. I would have liked to see some connection to transportation, which this artist does not address, instead focusing on notable Wisconsin personalities. In terms of materials, while PVC may be theoretically recyclable, I wonder how much of it really is recycled, or whether it is better to avoid the use of materials that are problematic to manufacture and dispose of at the end of their life cycle (see the film Blue Vinyl about the problems with PVC). I'm also dubious about the use of augmented virtual reality in this project. Too much of our lives is already screen mediated.

This proposal might be considered for interiors of buses, a good idea for users to read inside the buses, in poster form. Outdoors, unrealistic in distance from street and sidewalk. Many of the names were totally unfamiliar to me, so their depiction might lead to discussion, but more likely to divisiveness.

This proposal is almost insulting. There is no scenario where public art funds should be used to make a shrine to celebrities. It also seems to be designed as temporary since the artist says the material will only last 10 years.

I'm afraid I thoroughly dislike this proposal. I don't see how it connects to the Madison community at all. Not all of these "famous Wisconsites" are from Madison, nor do they necessarily have a connection to the community here. This idea shows a lack of research and a lack of respect for the Madison community and our concerns, thoughts, and diverse cultures. Vito has no connection to the city of Madison or its community and that is reflected in his proposal. In terms of design and use of space: the idea leaves a lot of blank space in between each portrait frame that could be much better utilized, and in a city that claims to prioritize green space it makes no sense cut down all of those beautiful trees for a project that doesn't even use the entire wall.

I'm very concerned this is far too generic an approach and a hugely missed opportunity to invest in something uniquely Madison, in both content and style and substance.

## Jenie Gao Proposal – The Time is Ours

"Jenie's proposal is the one I put my full support behind. Jenie has put so much thought and effort into this design, and it shows in how carefully she has researched and considered Madison's community. Jenie has a connection to Madison: she is part of our community despite being in Vancouver for her Master's, her business took root and grew here, and she remains connected and involved in Madison's goings on. Jenie is well known as an expert in artistic ethics and that is obvious through her plan for execution of this project. Her proposal centers the real community of Madison in a way that is both deep and lasting. She took the time to interview people who rely on public transportation and really listen to them. Her resulting design is not just surface level, not just portraits of the diverse members of Madison's community, but really gets to the heart of what we all have in common when we ride the bus. And this mural should center those of us who use public transit! Erasing people who use public transit from a mural on the public transit building would be insulting. Jenie is the only finalist of color out of the four. Wisconsin may seem like a very white state on the surface, but this is the home of so many communities of color that are just as deeply rooted as the settler state (and in the case of Indigenous communities, much, much more so). Jenie's proposal centers the BIPOC community of Madison on whose labor and existence much of the wealth of the city is built. It honors us in a way that none of the other proposals do, it doesn't erase us, it doesn't evoke the racist history of transit but it also doesn't whitewash it and pretend it doesn't exist.

Aesthetically, Jenie's design is just the prettiest option. The flow of time is masterfully portrayed, the colors are well selected, and the space is used well. Jenie's proposal is specifically designed so as to not remove any of the mature trees on the street, which is really, really important to me as a constituent. She also doesn't use any plastic, which is not something the other artists can say. It's really well planned. She also planned to keep the budget within the community—sourcing local materials and labor is so, so important, especially for a project with such a large budget. If Madison picked Vito's or Deborah's murals, that money would leave Madison. Jenie involves the community at every step of her project."

I really enjoy Jenie Gao's proposal both aesthetically—because it is the design that covers the greatest wall space and makes the greatest visual impact—and conceptually—because it is the design that most clearly engages with race, class, and community. Jenie Gao's explanation of her bus stop imagery is exceptional in that Gao identifies the great things that come from Madison's public transport while still acknowledging the room for improvement, for example warmer and more numerous shelters. Also, Gao's prolific work as a muralist in Madison is recognizable and cohesive while still presenting a huge range of subjects and adapting to many different wallscapes. In my opinion, the city would be thrilled with another Jenie Gao mural! Gao has rightly emphasized how rare it is for women of color to be awarded large public commissions, which the city should be proactive in addressing.

I love that her installation is bus rider focused. Love the huge colorful murals and aluminum die cuts. Could see the big shapes used for other projects or merch. I would vote for this project above the others.

I was impressed by Jenie's deep interrogation of what public transit means for the people of the city, particularly people of color, and how she represented their voices in her proposal.

Hi! I'm so excited by Jenie Gao's mural proposal. I grew up in Madison and I've taken the bus for such a big part of my life. As I grow up here more each year, I've loved watching the world go by outside me as I

bus to work. Something that really struck me about Jenie's piece is the way she captures the dynamic rushing by of the outdoors. There's something kind of magical about watching the scenery fly by you... you watch the leaves swirl by, look at every different type of tree covered in a new soft snowfall, watch two people embrace, see a skateboarder or a bicyclist keeping up with the bus for a second, watch an old man pick something you'll never know up off the ground... and it all reminds you how connected we all are in this city, we are watching and we are being seen. Some of my favorite times are when I'm on the bus, headed off to one place or headed home from someplace. Jenie's piece really made me think of all that, made me think of all the time and all the seasons I've spent in my city, and how many stories I've seen by looking out the bus window. I also think that Jenie's project is by far the most connected to the community out of all the proposals, and focuses on the communities that use public transit most, people of color, low income working people, madison locals. It would also give back the most to our community, as Jenie is super involved with local consciousness raising through public art, and this would only give her more of a platform to keep doing so. She did a lot of hands on research by asking the madison community what they wanted out of a mural, which I'm not sure the other artists focused on as much. I would really love for Jenie's piece to be the one on the transit building wall... I want to be reminded of this feeling of connectedness and community when I look at our city's public art, so that I can remember that I am a part of something beautiful, and to do all I can for my community every day that I can. Beautiful art inspires beautiful change. Thanks!

"This proposal is by so far the best from an art historical and aesthetic perspective that I only want to comment on it. It is universal and has a beautiful seasonal temporality that echoes and improves upon a mural along the railway on the SW commuter path near the Hilton Garden Inn: it appeals to potentially everyone, without being offensive to people of color. it considers accessibility and disability as a core part of its aesthetic; isn't this the Madison we want to be?"

I don't wish to insult the other proposals so I am not commenting on them, as I do not have much positive to say about them. I will say that the other proposals might come across as an insult to people of color here. "

Yes please this one!

This is the most innovative and intriguing proposal, that really take the community into account. Please select Jenie Gao's proposal for a mural!!

I fully endorse jenie gao's proposal as I find it to be the most artistically pleasing and will provide the most community impact.

Jenie shows a genuine interest in community needs, desires, and involvement in this piece. It is impressive that she took time to interview so many bus riders about their experiences on public transit. And there is real potential for community members to help create this piece as well. The design of the mural will enhance the view of the Capitol while driving up East Wash and can be enjoyed while on for as well as while driving. Jenie has intentionally designed her piece to speak to a diverse audience and at the same time the symbolism rings true for all people who live in this area- the change of seasons,

punctuated by seasonal colors and symbols like milkweed and geese are familiar to all of us. The size and scope of this mural are sure to result in an exciting impact!

Lovely, uses the natural environment well, won't require any trees to be taken down, has real depth & community connection, feels much more connected.

Supporting a poc artist who cares deeply about the roots of their community and wants to combat racism and help inform people about the beauty of indigenous cultures is the only correct move here. This proposal outshines all others indefinitely.

By far the most original, creative, and aesthetically pleasing piece. This piece is cohesive, makes use of the space, and employs time in a fascinating way. I love the idea of the winter mural being most visible in the winter when leaves drop, which involves even the surrounding trees into the piece. There is extensive evidence that this artist has actually engaged with the community and is dedicated to making sure local stories and artists are emphasized. This piece feels personal to Madison, and it is very evident in the thought that went into this design and application. As someone who rides the bus to work, the idea of the time on the bus being your own is something I can totally relate to as I clear my thoughts before heading into work. I am incredibly impressed with this artists and wholeheartedly support this design.

This project demonstrated the most clear understanding of and connection to the community. It offered the greatest visual impact, and the greatest impact on the residents of Madison. The design is clear, inclusive, aesthetically strong, and logistically sound. Gao's focus on BIPOC bus riders for her interviews contributes to the work's insightful design - it is the kind of public art work Madison needs most. Gao's plans for accessibility in terms of public painting days for neighbors and miniature mural elements for people with visual impairments create additional meaningful buy-in. The mural is thoughtfully designed for year-round viewing, and conservation plans are reasonable.

This proposal is great. I like how it reflects different seasons and captures the commute experience.

Loved it! It was poetic, representative of riders and the community, vibrant, beautiful, connected, thoughtful. Loved the involvement of OFS and the community paint day!! Love that she has strong roots here. Love her values and commitment to anti-gentrification as well as her ethics practices in general. Love the research she put into it and the individual connections she made with those who are often underrepresented. The depth of the images and colors are powerful yet soft, fluid and magical. Loved the continuity of the piece. Strong vote for Jenie! ♥

Jenie Gao's proposal is the most thought-out and the research that went into the installation (45 minute interviews with many riders) clearly differentiates this proposal from the others. The design is bold and striking, filling the space very well. The size and scale of the design matches the space where it would be installed. It focuses on the rider and their experience, while also incorporating some of the flora and fauna that characterize Madison's four seasons. The proposal shows the passage of time with the seasons, yet is a timeless design that will never become dated or controversial because it doesn't focus on specific famous people or specific businesses. Instead, it focuses on all of us - the rider looking out the window of a bus, driving through Madison. No matter who you are or where you are going, you will connect with this installation. With the other proposals, it may be hit or miss whether one feels represented by the installation.

Gao's proposal seems like the best use of space and the most inviting. It makes me want to ride the bus!

i love this mural, the colors are SO vibrant and i love the artist's vision for the piece. i take the bus everywhere i go and i love how she interviewed bus riders for this mural :-)

Incredible ! This has been carefully well thought out and makes the most sense for the community of Madison as well as giving back.

"Jenie Gao is the only artist who considered the actual people of Madison who use Metro Transit. Her work is accessible, representative, unique to Madison, environmentally conscious, and most well researched for all these factors and longevity.

Most of all, it is beautiful and something I can feel proud of as a bus rider, Madison resident, and local artist."

The thoroughness in Jenie Gao's practice to be community driven in every part of this endeavour is outstanding. She has managed to make of this art project a powerful community engagement journey that would be such a precious gift to Madison, Wisconsin. This proposal has the quality of initiatives that transform culture and seed for belonging in everyday people's lives. It is also evident, that Jenie has once again provided the highest technical standards and beautiful art designs.

"I think this proposal is so striking. I love the community involvement and story and the visual imagery is striking and beautiful. I would love to see this on my morning commute and at the same time I don't think it will be a distraction. Because the size and colors make it enjoyable from a distance and I'm sure up close too.

Really great proposal, I hope this is the one chosen. "

"

Thank you for making the Madison Metro Public Art proposal session public and accessible for remote viewing. I'm now living in Canada, but I've spent over half my life in Madison, starting with years 0-18, and most recently to earn a doctorate at UW-Madison. During my grad school time, I lived on the near East side and walked by the Metro building frequently; I was an avid bike commuter and occasional bus rider. I very much appreciated the reliability and respite granted by the bus system when I was too tired, or it was too cold, to bike.

I'm writing in support of Jenie Gao's proposed mural for its deep evocation of Madison as a place, for its focus on the present experiences of diverse Madisonians, for its capacity to build community, and for its striking visual effect. First, place. I miss Madison regularly, but when I saw the cicadas on Jenie's 'summer' panel, my eyes welled with tears. Wisconsin summer, for me, was equal parts buoyancy and annoyance, and the combination of prairie flowers and cicadas couldn't be more apt. Jenie's knowledge of Madison as a place is authentic, and it shows.

Second, I love that the mural lifts up present experiences of Madison bus riders, especially states of waiting and of solitude amongst community. Once again, the coexistence of comfort (of going home) with discomfort (of waiting, or waiting in the cold) is recognized; this mural sees the tensions of both living in Wisconsin and in the present socioeconomic context, and it lets the tension give it forward motion. As a white woman raised in Madison, I know that aversion to tension is part of the dominant culture, and I see that it both erodes relationships and hamstring work towards equity. Turning towards tension is a habit that I see Madisonians trying to build — if by fits and starts — and I'd love to see a prominent mural that embodies that energy.

And the mural's production will engage and employ Madison youth, and it's beautiful!

Thank you for the opportunity to give public comment! Looking forward to strolling down a mural-enhanced East Wash when I return to town."

"This proposal was clear and thoughtful in concept. "'It's Our Time'" stuck with me and is an open idea allowing multiple interpretations. I am impressed with the interviews that were made with the bus riding community and was pulled into the stories that were shared during the presentation. The visual impact of this proposal is by far the most significant and will inspire curiosity and creativity. I appreciate that the mural will be painted directly on the wall and then the budget (which was not shown during the presentation) would also cover the sculptural aspect of the steel cutouts. I don't remember how those will be attached but because of the thoroughness of the proposal I am convinced that those issues will be addressed with rigor. To be able to enjoy the mural from a vehicle, across the street and as a pedestrian will be possible with this proposal. I am also intrigued and inspired by Jenie Gao's desire to utilize youth and community volunteers to help with the creation of the project.

This proposal far exceeded the others in concept, visual impact and community involvement."

Jenie Gao's proposal is the best fit for the space and the Madison community. She interviewed people who use the system and then applied the results of that research to the design /imagery in the mural. Her design is the most visually appealing of the artist proposals and her extensive experience as a muralist, with many examples in Madison, assures me that she has the skill and ability to successfully complete the work. I've been a resident of Madison since 1981. I'm a visual artist, a paratransit rider and someone who would be very pleased to see Jenie Gao's mural on the Metro Transit Maintenance Facility as I traveled down East Washington Avenue.

I fully back this project by Jenie Gao. This project has the most visibility and visual impact. The project also has the most public input through her interviews with bus users. It's well thought out in the employment of operation fresh start. The mural will be a valuable addition to that East Washington Corridor.

"I was incredibly impressed and moved by Jenie Gao's proposal "'The Time is Ours,'" and would be excited to see this mural on Washington Ave. I think that the narrative — focusing on the experience and motivations of bus riders — is a compelling investigation of the urgent need for public

transportation and one that feels meaningfully responsive to lived community experiences. I would love for these interviews to be catalogued, as another way of documenting this project.

I appreciate that it makes extensive and well planned use of the the space, while still being considerate of tree cover, shade, and seasonal changes. I appreciate that Jenie intends to source local materials, hire labor from local companies, and compensate/engage with local community members to complete the project. Although I understand some of the siding will be updated, I was impressed that Jenie had investigated and determined which pieces and where — and, of course, that they will not interfere with this proposed mural. I think that the scale will not be distracting to drivers, and that pedestrians will also benefit from spending time with the work up close.

When I first came to Madison in 2012, I drove down Washington Ave. I saw the Capitol Building in the distance, but I also saw the Metro Transit building. The building didn't make much of an impression on me, but I recall feeling that E Washington was a neglected space. As I grew to know the neighborhood and the city writ large, I became far more aware of the community, concerns and stories of Washington Ave. If I had seen something like this mural when I first moved to Madison, I would have been excited. I also believe I would have felt a sense of what I have come to learn over the years I've lived in Madison, and seen myself reflected within that narrative. I would be proud to see ""The Time is Ours"" in Madison, and I would love to meaningfully introduce Madison to newcomers in this way."

Honestly, I don't think there is any contest between the other candidates and Jenie. That opinion was also shared by a significant handful of public responders after the presentations. So, I will echo (without a lot of detail) what they all said about Jenie's "breathtaking," "sense of timelessness," inclusivity, use of community oral histories, artistic prowess, colorful, engaging, seasonal, eye-catching, meditative...mural graphics. Jenie's passion for this locale, these neighbors, this transit line, the work of artists of color and their communities should be included in the argument for her inclusion in this amazing project. I sent notes before the presentations about Jenie's work ethic, research acumen, technical ability, community outreach, and those were all evident in her presentation and will be a major component when (!) she is chosen for the project. And here's a final, small, but perhaps most impactful thought. Jenie is REALLY astute at using social media and the web at inviting, engaging, sharing, promoting (in her former projects and life pursuits) and asking for help. This is at once savvy and welcoming. Her own promotion of the project as it unfolds (including all of us helping with the painting!) will put the Madison Arts Commission and the Public Art Project in the "news" consistently and robustly. Choose Jenie- she's a whirlwind of energy and ability, and that building (and community) will SHINE!

I really love the connection with the community in Jenie Gao's proposal, both the specific people and the collective experience any rider would share. It would be like a mirror for those looking out the bus window, an experience I have had many times.

I think Jenie Gao's artwork best represents not only the site itself, but more importantly the use of the site by the bus riders themselves. It represents Madison from a resident point of view, that will be easily



readable and viewable to both pedestrians, bikers and car traffic. I love the bold colors and community engagement in the execution of the project as well.

The proposal from Jenie Gao was the only one that actually reflected the values of bus riders. This proposal honors place, shows the diversity of the 'public', and is able to hold both positive and negative aspects of public transit all together at the same time. I like that this artist took the time to interview bus riders! and it was even better that they centered black/indigenous/people of color. The theme itself is inspiring, and in my opinion, sets an attitude for collective gratitude towards public transit that is representative of the voices of actual transit riders. I hope that this mural could inspire more people to use public transit by really showing one of the benefits of riding the bus. In terms of square-footage of building coverage, this proposal delivers the highest 'bang for the buck' as well - it covers a greater amount of the building than the other options, by far. The metal adds a nice dimension to the painted work and doesn't seem like it will be distracting to drivers since it's matte. I was impressed by the fact that this proposal had such thorough research on how to keep the investment money on sub-contractors and materials local as much as possible. Also fun that they included community paint-days - I love that area residents can actually be part of the project!

"Finally! A local artist who has done the work and continues to do the work. This is obviously the most community-centered approach, which shows in the artist's process and plan. The images are beautiful, evocative, and original, standing out in comparison to the others by being unique and not trying to shoehorn in boring history that is either insulting, irrelevant, or ill-researched.

Aesthetically, this project feels so unique and interesting, reflecting an artist who really knows and cares about our community. It feels timeless and just so much like this place we all call home. I can imagine riding the bus up and down the corridor (or walking, or biking, or even driving) and appreciating the flow and movement. The natural elements are really insightful and creatively portrayed. I actually really love this piece."

I watched all of the proposals as they were presented; online via browser-after giving up on the Zoom session that your site kept telling me "I needed to update Zoom". Which I did, frustratingly, to no avail. Each presentation was very interesting, but Jenie Gao's was OUTSTANDING! She was very professional, to the point, no fluff. I love how creative, bold, colorful & artistic her design is. The fact that she interviewed riders and metro workers too. The way ridership is being represented both in silhouette and in the portraits. Because of the scale that it can be easily seen, safely, from across the street by drivers & riders of the buses. I especially enjoyed how she beautifully incorporated nature, creatures, and the seasons, which no one else did. I sure hope I get to experience her creation in the real world, it will be stunning.

Hello. My name is Ankita Bharadwaj and I would like to tell you that I am in support of Jenie Gao. I believe not only is her art magnificent, her values that she aligns herself with are truly amazing. Those values of inclusiveness, honesty, integrity and her hard working nature are reflected in her art. I believe we need more artists like her who speak to the world through their art while bringing all of us together.

I was so excited to see that Jenie Gao was one of the finalists. I find her artwork and large scale murals exciting, vibrant, compelling, gorgeous, and very thoughtfully executed. Her work develops out of a

deep respect and knowledge of the communities who will live with the public works that she creates. And I was not disappointed by her submission! Her careful research and creative eye for incorporating that research into a public art project, one that grows out of her interaction with community members in a way that makes them both the subject of the work, but also the producers of it, are impressive. And the artwork is stunning. She has tremendous sense of place and people and how they interact when creating something truly for the public. I love the focus on the riders, on the communities that need and make use of the bus system. She has been and continues to be very active in the community and this shows in her work. This project is far and away the most thoughtful in terms of place, communities, materials, and use of space of all four proposals.

Phenomenal concept, plan and project. A clearly outstanding proposal, the only that makes a deep connection to the folks who the art is for- bus riders! I felt a deep connection to the project even in its proposal stage, this is clearly the best choice for this project.

I love the scale of this proposal, the only one to utilize the entire height (and more) of the building. The abstract silhouettes of people and seasons with seasonal nature imagery seems likely to age well and have a "timeless" appeal while suggesting the passage of time along the long horizontal space. I think it would be the most visible while riding a bus on E. Wash, and appreciate the artist's concern for the shade and green space already in place along the building. I also like the community involvement possibilities involved in the creation of the work.

This was the best option!!!! The beautiful colors will be equally decorative and pleasing to those walking as to those driving by. I was impressed by how the artist did interviews for community feedback and inspiration to evoke and develop her idea. She incorporates images that are relatable to many people (people of different races, ages, abilities) and also relatable to the place where we live (the seasons). I also love the fact that the artist is a resident in the same area of Madison. I love the idea of the community contributing through painting the mural and also the depth created by the metal cut outs. I love the idea of highlighting the actual Metro bus riders' quotes and thoughts about riding the bus and how this project highlights the ways that the public transportation has positively impacted their lives.

This project is very well considered and rooted in the community. I was very impressed by how thoughtful and thorough it is, and I feel confident that she will deliver on making excellent work. This piece will make both the building and the institution look better. This is the best concept and proposal of the group and it is not even close.

This is a fantastic well-thought out proposal, clearly showing a lot of work and engagement with the community. The installation has excellent scale and enhances the transit corridor where it will be mostly enjoyed from a moving vehicle, while also providing neat details for those who observe the installation while walking. This proposed installation also seems to have the lowest risk of having maintenance or aging issues down the line.

"I absolutely love this proposal. Jenie seems to understand our community and its vibrancy, values, and aesthetic. Her vision is gorgeous, original, and much more representative of transit riders, of me, and of my community than the other concepts. Jenie also seems to understand scale, space, rhythm, timing. I would LOVE to look at this piece out the window of the 6!!

To me, this very clear, heads-and-shoulders above option.

Please please please pick this one!!!"

Jenie's proposal was the only one that wowed me. Her vision to connect the community through building and maintaining the art is exactly the thing we need in our community to connect people. She's also connected to our city through living her and the subject matter and the art reflect that. She truly thought of everything- from where the pieces will go, the subject matter- the viewers on the bus and what it means for them. It would be foolish if Madison choose anything else. I want to see this project come to life in Madison! Please support her proposal

I believe that Jenie Gao's proposal best fits the overall intent of the mural, which is to represent the relationship of public transportation and its community users. I think her proposal is deeply connected to our diverse community and she has done the adequate research to assure this. I love her colorful and youthful style that can connect across generations. I like the idea of integrating community organizations in the making, so it can stay local.

"From all the proposals, this one looks like the artist did the homework, it is focused on the community, and the present moment of our community.

The use of the total area of the building also make it very attractive and fits into the space in a more coherent way, I can't stop imagining this murals communicating with the murals around the corner of the MYARTS.

I'm 100% supporting this piece.

"

Jenie Gao appears to have put forth the most effort out of the finalists in terms of "grassroots" research in Madison which involved riding a variety of heavily utilized bus routes, as well as interviewing current Metro employees and individuals around the city whom regularly rely upon public transportation. Thus if this amount of funding is going to be invested in a major public art project that is meant to accurately reflect the myriad population groups who operate, maintain and depend upon the local bus system, Gao's proposal is the obvious choice.

I think Jenie Gao's mural idea is beautiful. I live across the street from the proposed mural on Curtis Court and I would love to see this every day. My favorite part is the way that it moves through the space. I also really love the bright colors.

"I am continuously in awe of the hard work Jenie does in making her art showcase her values and inclusivity in every aspect. Inclusivity in this project covers those who are represented in the artwork (the actual bus riders), those who help create and install the art (Operation Fresh Start, community paint days), and even those who view the art (considerations for the visually impaired to enjoy the work). This shows a real commitment to the values she expresses throughout her proposal and in her work at large. I know she has demonstrated this inclusivity in past projects and know that she will be able to deliver on this one too. The design incorporates interviews with Metro staff and the bus riders and adds local elements to add the sense of space, like milkweed, Canada geese, and snow. As a daily bus rider myself, the proposal shows she understands the experience of riding.

She has experience with outdoor artwork and is knowledgeable about the materials that will be most durable and also accessible to all audiences. It will be a vibrant addition to a currently dull facade, with additional relief visible to pedestrians. She also shows a deep understanding of the physical environment, noting that locating the mural on the eastern part of the building means trees do not have to be removed which retains a pleasant environment for pedestrians on hot summer days. She also noted that the western side will need replacement sooner.

I would also like the city to support a woman artist of color, particularly given historical and recent issues of lack of support for women and BIPOC artists in the city (not necessarily by the city itself). Actions speak louder than words, and by choosing Jenie Gao, I believe the city can also express solidarity with the values she embodies with her work."

I believe Jenie Gao's proposal is the most thought through, impactful, and representative of the Madison community. Looking through the proposals, this is truly the best option.

"This is the only design that effectively utilizes the entire side of the building as a canvas, making for a strong visual impact — easily noticed and enjoyed from a vehicle as well as by pedestrians, and undoubtedly the strongest visual impact of all four proposals.

The raised aluminum shapes create variation in the texture and image, and are big enough to create a significant graphic design using the wall of the building — they nicely convey the connection between riders, seasonal experience, Metro system, and Wisconsin environment.

I like the artist's plan for engaging local organizations as well."

I am very moved by Jenie Gao's idea. I believe she captures the feeling of Madison in her proposal. I am very impressed by her investigation into creating art that represents the actual people/metro riders. Jenie Gao has a well thought out plan and is capable of implementing a unique art installation for our city. The maintenance seems to be minimal. Community connection and involvement is high. The artwork is beautiful, colorful, and relatable. It would be a shame not to select Jenie Gao for this. Madison needs exactly what Jenie Gao has bring to the table. BIPOC especially First Nations People need far more representation in Madison, Jenie Gao is the perfect artist to bring it!

This is my favorite of the finalists and a beautiful design. I like the large scale mural that can easily be seen and interpreted across the street. It is more accessible than if you had to get closer to view it. I appreciate the artist's consideration of how the cycle of the trees affects the viewing and the use of local materials and the collaboration with Operation Fresh Start. The artwork is well thought out with low maintenance and the removable metal pieces which will add some dimensionality to the painted mural. This mural will have a beautiful impact on the E Wash corridor.

From the very start Jenie's proposal piqued my interest and engaged me. The bright colors really liven up the space. I also love that her proposal names it as public art for public good. That's what Madison should be striving for always! I like the seasonal flow of Jenie's images that take in the nature of our community, and ties it into the people and our experiences while riding the bus. This project uses up so much space of the available wall and it is large enough to take in while riding by. The other thing about

this project is how thoughtful it is about the images, the inclusivity of the images, and even the placement/flow as to be harmonious with the environment and seasons. Yet it leaves space for the viewer to take in the images and be inspired with one's own thoughts and interpretation. This is by far my favorite and the project with the greatest possible impact for the Metro transit building.

WOW! This is the first piece that really USES this space fully. The piece is instantly eye catching, with the vibrancy of the colors and shapes. I love how Jenie Gao is specifically centering bus riders in this piece. Her ties to Madison really show in this proposal. I adore the concept of portraying the passage of time and the seasons. And I am really moved how she considered every detail in this proposal - even so far as choosing to include the winter portion in the area with the most tree cover (so it will be most visible in winter). I love how Jenie includes a plan in her proposal to use local materials and workers. So we know that the money going into this art piece will be invested directly back into our community. I love that she plans to hire Operation Fresh Start students. I love that she plans to host community paint days (I will BE THERE for sure). Considering the impact of climate change all over the world right now, I appreciate that Jenie planned her artwork in such a way that wouldn't require the removal of mature trees. I love the size and vibrancy of this piece, because it means that people can enjoy it both on foot or when passing on bikes/buses/cars. There are no flaws with this proposal. Jenie clearly thought deeply about this proposal and truly listened to every person she interviewed. This piece, to me, represents what public art can and should be. She is engaging the community, particularly those who are often underrepresented. And, honestly - if I was choosing between the four based on aesthetics alone - this would STILL be the winner. The piece is GORGEOUS. The others are...boring at best. It would be a mistake to choose anyone other than Jenie.

I'm really excited about this submission, the colors, creativity, aesthetics, and community connection involved in the project are exactly what I want to see in public art planning. I would love to go past this every day, just looking at the design lifts my spirits and makes me feel proud of my community and the talent of the many artists we have here. The use of space was excellent and seems to have been designed with the intention to provide a positive experience for those going past on the road as well as pedestrians. Please choose this submission!

This is a great proposal and clearly shows an understanding and connection to the local community due to the interviews with bus riders. It's by far the most appealing proposal aesthetically, and it uses the space well.

This is the only proposal that integrates with the architecture in question, it is the only one that centers and is concerned with the users of the metro's lines. The research behind it's approach is an example of what public art CAN do for a community, by highlighting accessible, impactful, engaging visuals that capture the details of Madison that monuments typically overlook, and working with local artists, while mentoring them. Clearly the strongest proposal, but the competition her was very weak.

I think this is an outstanding proposed work with much research, artistic thought and love and respect for the area. I truly hope that Jenie Gap is the winner!

Jenie showed such mindfulness towards the community during her presentation. Her thoughts of modularity to improve access for city works projects, predictive maintenance in the form of vandalism prevention and UV protection reapplication, the tactile elements for the visually impaired population,

and the community interviews being integrated into the proposal are brilliant examples of the way that Jenie continues to dedicate her profession towards bringing people together around art.

I have worked with Jenie in the past, she is passionate and driven to represent fully the specific community involved in any project. I think that she took the time to understand both the space and people who are most connected to Metro transit. Her design makes the best use of that space and connects to the Madison community and bus ridership specifically in a way that does more than draw on superficial imagery. The design is interesting to a person walking by but is also visible to someone driving or taking public transit. I know from experience that she will follow best practices in production and that employing local community members will be a priority in the process. Her work goes beyond the design to touch the community in more profound ways than simply viewing a finished piece of art.

"Jenie's proposal is the one I put my full support behind. Jenie has put so much thought and effort into this design, and it shows in how carefully she has researched and considered Madison's community. Jenie has a connection to Madison: she is part of our community despite being in Vancouver for her Master's, her business took root and grew here, and she remains connected and involved in Madison's goings on. Jenie is well known as an expert in artistic ethics and that is obvious through her plan for execution of this project.

Her proposal centers the real community of Madison in a way that is both deep and lasting. She took the time to interview people who rely on public transportation and really listen to them. Her resulting design is not just surface level, not just portraits of the diverse members of Madison's community, but really gets to the heart of what we all have in common when we ride the bus. And this mural should center those of us who use public transit! Erasing people who use public transit from a mural on the public transit building would be insulting.

Jenie is the only finalist of color out of the four. Wisconsin may seem like a very white state on the surface, but this is the home of so many communities of color that are just as deeply rooted as the settler state (and in the case of Indigenous communities, much, much more so). Jenie's proposal centers the BIPOC community of Madison on whose labor and existence much of the wealth of the city is built. It honors us in a way that none of the other proposals do, it doesn't erase us, it doesn't evoke the racist history of transit but it also doesn't whitewash it and pretend it doesn't exist.

Aesthetically, Jenie's design is just the prettiest option. The flow of time is masterfully portrayed, the colors are well selected, and the space is used well. Jenie's proposal is specifically designed so as to not remove any of the mature trees on the street, which is really, really important to me as a constituent. She also doesn't use any plastic, which is not something the other artists can say. It's really well planned. She also planned to keep the budget within the community—sourcing local materials and labor is so, so important, especially for a project with such a large budget. If Madison picked Vito's or Deborah's murals, that money would leave Madison. Jenie involves the community at every step of her project.

"

Honestly, her project is the only sensible project that actually looks good with Metro Design and incorporates the community by having artist assistants from Operation Fresh Start, I love that she's involving the community in the artwork and also that she literally did the groundwork already by interviewing a lot of people to get their sense of the bus system. Jenie Gao is the clear choice here, no contest.

This is an amazing proposal that truly captures a connection to the community by being based on interviews with bus riders and their stories. It also takes into account the specifics of the site (preserving tree cover, scale for people using E Wash with different modes of transportation) and has convincing plan of working with Operation Fresh Start for creating and installing the art. I strongly support this proposal.

I think this is the best by far. It's the most visually striking, and uses the experience of bus riders as a jumping off point in a very thoughtful way.

"Jenie Gao has proven throughout her career in community and public art projects in Madison that she listens to the most vulnerable and marginalized in our communities. Focusing on the important role public transit plays in their lives and representing them visually and symbolically is ESSENTIAL for this project. So many of the murals and publicly visible artwork in our city are not for residents - they are beautification, which is more for tourists. For this project, I want to see the riders reflected in the work.

Her proposal is thorough, well-researched, and the visuals are stunning. The materials chosen are thoughtful concerning maintenance and

I didn't own a car until I was 27 years old. I took buses and trains in every city I lived in, and the time I spent on public transit was something I relished. I would knit, read, chat with strangers, and loved the bouncy time I had to myself. Even if I had to wait a long time for my bus, I loved the community encounters I was open to. The theme of the riders ""owning"" this time really resonates for me. I cannot express how much joy it brings me.

Hiring local artists, fabricators and other laborers is so important to our local economy - and including community in the creation of several of the painted panels is an effective way to connect the community to a big visual change in the neighborhood's landscape.

Additionally, the fact that Jenie has thought about ways beyond the actual public art piece to engage with the community goes far above the other proposals. Creating a zine to extend the work more, continuing conversations with the folks she interviewed already, these things are all ways of giving power to the community. Power is something art should give, and Jenie Gao's proposal can do that."

Definitely the most interesting and attractive proposal.

"Jenie Gao's project completely captivated me. As in all her projects, Jenie is thoughtful, and deeply intentional. Her use of research and direct interviews with regular users of the bus system reflect her commitment to projects with meaning and relevance. They also demonstrate her insistence in community involvement and special attention to the "real people" who often are overlooked in such large scale projects. The work is aesthetically captivating and reflects movement - physical as well as that of seasonal changes and of history. The brilliantly painted surface along with the suspended metal sculptures are a fascinating way to create interest and a surprising added dimensionality. I truly appreciate the thoughtfulness of incorporating community members and youth in the production of the work.

I feel that Jenie's project stands out and ahead of the other projects presented and strongly support its selection.

"

I really like this proposal. It is an appropriate scale for the site, and will invigorate the streetscape for all who pass by regardless of travel mode. It is energetic, enticing, and reflects the experiences of being a transit user - and of being a Madison-area resident. The only proposal of the four that I would want to see created and installed in this location as proposed.

only one I like that you can really get a good look at while on bus! All the others seem like you'd need to be close up to enjoy it.

Jenie's proposal and mock ups blew me away. The deep thought and research she went into her proposal was also touching. I love that it's a reflection of Madison in the four seasons without being too literal or dating the project-- I think it will be beautiful and meaningful years down the line. I love that she thought to include the community in the painting of the wall. And I love that she thought of how the mural will look and change during the seasons, with the winter panel being most visible when the leaves on the trees have fallen. I love that her concept was developed through the eyes of the bus rider, and lens of empowerment and reflection. The size and vibrancy is so striking. It will be an incredible piece of art that Madison will be so lucky to have. Beautiful, larger than life murals are extremely enticing for tourists. I think this part of East Wash will blow up with these murals here. Imagine how many graduates will get their pictures taken in front of these images that subtly but beautifully represent their home town. I don't know if I'll still be in Madison to see this project completed, but I will definitely come back from wherever I am to watch its unveiling.

Jennie Gao is one of my favorite local artists and as someone who lives in the neighborhood that the mural will be in, her proposal makes me the most excited by far. Her proposal not only best uses the space and best fits in with the culture and aesthetics of the neighborhood - but it also both reflects and celebrates our community beautifully. We have more than enough imagery of icons, I want to see the people and landscapes I live beside every day.

The connection to the Metro riders and community is apparent both in the art imagery and the commitment to use OFS for installation. The scale of the art work is appropriate for both pedestrians and those in vehicles to enjoy and enhances the rather dull aesthetics of the current wall. The vibe of the art work is on par with the various wall murals throughout town.



Jenie's proposal is phenomenal! The connection to the community and the deeply meaningful design she's created are a clear winner here. I love that she's bringing forward the people most important to Metro—the folks who actually USE the buses! Bravo, Genie!

This is the only piece that spoke to me and that I can relate to. Watching Gao's proposal made me nostalgic and reflect on all the times I have ridden Metro buses in Madison. Not only does Gao fill the entire space in a visually harmonious way, but the concept is beautiful, deep, and represents diversity in a genuine and non-exploitative manner. Madison's bus rider community is a source of inspiration for this work and I love how much time Gao spent interviewing people - it's obvious through the quotes that were shared in the presentation that Gao connected with interviewees and this guided the work. Anyone who lives in Madison, bus rider or not, can relate to this piece because the seasons are such an integral part of the culture. Additionally, I like that no trees have to be cut down to make this piece happen, the trees add another element to the piece and more so respect Mother Nature as an important element in public transit.

I am so impressed by Jenie Gao's proposal. The artwork incorporating Madison seasons is beautiful and the images of people looking out the window represent the people of Madison. I love that interviews with bus riders helped to shape this proposal.

I am absolutely blown away by the depth of community engagement in this proposal. Jenie's plan takes into consideration not just the residents of the community around the building, but also the thousands of people who will be passing by in buses and cars. The fact that Jenie is seeking to also engage area organizations like Operation Fresh Start truly grounds this work in community in a deep and meaningful way. I can't think of a better use of this space. I believe this work will be a shining example of public art in this region.

I love the concept and brightness. It feels like a good use of the large space, that will have details for those on foot and be noticeable for those on buses. I also love the community oriented nature of this proposal. This one has my strong support!

This project was very well designed and thought out, and I appreciate that Jenie has a deep and personal connection to Madison. Her work is featured throughout the city of Madison and Milwaukee, and I feel that each project she takes on works well with the spaces that she works in and is well researched. I also appreciated her proposal about focusing on community and bringing in younger apprentices to help develop the work and support the younger art communities. Overall this project was the strongest, and it was refreshing to see an artist of color selected for this opportunity who highlights the importance of BIPOC communities in Madison and who uses Madison public transportation the most.

From all the proposed projects, Jenie Gao's is the strongest. It has a narrative inspired by BIPOC Madison voices, it is aesthetically pleasing through its use of bright colors, different use of materials and images that anyone, regardless of race, gender, ability, etc., can connect with. Jenie lived in Madison for many years and her public work in Madison is always authentic and carefully takes into consideration stories of underrepresented communities. Jenie is very thoughtful in how she executes her projects like including youth in the art experience through apprenticeships or internships. I would like to see more BIPOC artists get public funding for projects that will have a great visual impact in our community and this is a great opportunity to support one of them.

This proposal is so thoughtful. From saving trees, to including community voices and paintbrushes, to basing the concept on bus riders' actual experiences. I love how much space the art will use on the building and how visible it will be from far away. I love how local community members will be invited into the painting project. I love the use of color.

Vivid, seasonal, diverse

I support the project proposed by Jenie Gao.

Jenie Gao's proposed concept is exciting in color, story vision and dimension along with the 3-D aluminum panels. The artist seems to have thought through all the possible long-term situations regarding non-fade materials, movability and scale for viewing at a distance as well as along the sidewalk. Ms. Gao has proven experience in creating and executing large public artworks and will bring local artistic assistants into the project.

"AMAZING!!! This is the one that needs to be picked, why?

It is Diverse and Inclusive from its very core.

It utilizes the whole space.

The artist has already gone through great strides to develop a piece that is connected to the community and wants to make the community part of the installation.

Its grand and colorful while following the design cues of its surroundings

SUPPORT YOUR LOCAL ARTIST, why are we even thinking about hiring a non-local artist to do a job that is supposed to be about community."

No

I love this one so much! It is bold, visible from a distance, the overall work would look amazing even if you are moving past it quickly. It is relevant to our city, represents and celebrates the diversity of our community as well as the richness of the seasons.

Jenie Gao's proposal presents sensitive and approachable work that will enhance the community

Most excited about this incredible mural. I would absolutely love driving along the E Wash corridor with this delightful visual along the Metro Campus. It's beautiful and calming. This artist also seemed the most engaged with the community through the creative process resulting in art that is most in tune with our gorgeous diversity.

"Jenie's proposal is the one I put my full support behind. Jenie has put so much thought and effort into this design, and it shows in how carefully she has researched and considered Madison's community. Jenie has a connection to Madison: she is part of our community despite being in Vancouver for her Master's, her business took root and grew here, and she remains connected and involved in Madison's goings on. Jenie is well known as an expert in artistic ethics and that is obvious through her plan for execution of this project. Her proposal centers the real community of Madison in a way that is both deep and lasting. She took the time to interview people who rely on public transportation and really listen to them. Her resulting design is not just surface level, not just portraits of the diverse members of Madison's community, but really gets to the heart of what we all have in common when we ride the bus.

And this mural should center those of us who use public transit! Erasing people who use public transit from a mural on the public transit building would be insulting. Jenie is the only finalist of color out of the four. Wisconsin may seem like a very white state on the surface, but this is the home of so many communities of color that are just as deeply rooted as the settler state (and in the case of Indigenous communities, much, much more so). Jenie's proposal centers the BIPOC community of Madison on whose labor and existence much of the wealth of the city is built. It honors us in a way that none of the other proposals do, it doesn't erase us, it doesn't evoke the racist history of transit but it also doesn't whitewash it and pretend it doesn't exist.

Aesthetically, Jenie's design is just the prettiest option. The flow of time is masterfully portrayed, the colors are well selected, and the space is used well. Jenie's proposal is specifically designed so as to not remove any of the mature trees on the street, which is really, really important to me as a constituent. She also doesn't use any plastic, which is not something the other artists can say. It's really well planned. She also planned to keep the budget within the community— sourcing local materials and labor is so, so important, especially for a project with such a large budget. If Madison picked Vito's or Deborah's murals, that money would leave Madison. Jenie involves the community at every step of her project.

"

I really love how the artist includes the whole community in her project. Being mindful of the green space as well as using materials that are environmentally friendly. I am a supervisor at Metro and I can truly say, coming to work in a building with such a beautiful design would start my day off just right. I could easily visualize this on East Washington as I commute. Great job!!

Of all the wonderful submissions this one is in my opinion the most beautiful use of the potential space, captures real stories and is accessible from sidewalk and street. Supporting a person of color feels particularly important for this project. I vote for Jenie!

i thought this was the best presentation and the work really uses the space to its advantage!

"Dear Madison Arts Commissioners,

I'm writing to express my full support for Jenie Gao's proposal for the Percent Arts Program's Metro Transit Mural project. My name is Lael Sheber. I've lived in Madison for over 20 yrs. Jenie's proposal really moved me.

I don't think any of the other finalists measure up to Jenie in artistic design, ethical considerations, community involvement, or economic impact. Artistically, Vito's doesn't use the space well and relies on an app that will soon be out of date. Deborah's is busy and detailed with a subtle color palette that doesn't stand out much, which will be distracting to drivers. Actual Size Art's design relies on Where's Waldo-style chicken spotting, which is liable to cause an accident on an already dangerous street.

Ethically, I'm worried about all of the finalists except for Jenie. Deborah and Actual Size Art's designs rely on evoking and celebrating a racist, segregated history of transit. I think that whitewashing Madison's

past does a disservice to its citizens, many of whom were and are personally harmed by said racism and all of whom should know better than to romanticize racism and erasure. I take offense to the idea that Madison's transportation history started in the 1880s, like Deborah's proposal implies. Indigenous people were here and transporting each other across Madison's rivers, lakes, and land long before settlers ever stepped foot on Ho-Chunk territory. Additionally, Actual Size Art's design is a slap in the face to bus riders who are forced to wait at bus stops with no protection from the elements, as they use bus shelters to protect a vintage bus. Why protect a keepsake from a racist past but not the people who ride the buses today? Deborah, Vito, and Actual Size Art's designs all rely heavily on plastic for installation, and require the removal of fully grown trees that provide valuable shade and cooling to a section of East Washington that is mainly concrete. Jenie's does not.

In terms of community involvement, Jenie's design is best researched and gets to the heart of what people who ride the bus all have in common in a way that doesn't rely on surface level community portraits or the whitewashing of an imagined past. Vito's design doesn't seem to have had any community input at all. Jenie's has not only involved the community through the planning process, but will throughout its execution as well, which I think is really important. Because Jenie's business and many of her community ties remain Madison-local, the money from this project will also stay in Madison's local economy if Jenie is selected, which can't be said for Deborah or Vito. It's also worth noting that Jenie is the only person of color in the finalists, and the only one who centered the BIPOC community of Madison in her proposal. This is an oversight on the part of the other finalists that only serves to further alienate an already marginalized group of people.

I urge you to choose Jenie Gao's proposal for the mural. Not only does she deserve it, given her history of community engagement and organization and her deep commitment to artistic ethics, but we, Madison as a community, deserve it too. I want to drive past that mural every day and I hope that you do too.

I strongly support Jenie Gao's proposal. I love how she used community interviews as inspiration and grounding for her work. She centers the voices of BIPOC bus users, which will allow her to elevate their perspectives, and create art that reflects their lived experiences. She is deeply committed to creating art that will help connect people to their communities, and her proposal will do just that. Jenie's creativity, incredible talent, and deep thoughtfulness about community and art is truly unmatched.

THIS is the proposal I would like to see selected. It is very well thought out, and is a dynamic, informed, colorful, fully architectural application. I like the large metal motifs over the graphic painted wall for additional interest and meaning. It was hands down the best solution, Jenie presented the most enthusiasm, professionalism, and has done excellent research and development to execute a successful and engaged public project.

This is obviously the best option. Best use of the space, vibrant, inclusive, celebratory. #Winner

To say I "admire" the amount of creativity, originality and intentionality that is reflected in Jenie Gao's presentation is quite an understatement. The design that combines the 2-dimensional with the panels is a dynamic visual. The flow and movement of the abstract design escorts the eye through stories of the silhouettes, cicadas and trees. Jenie has thought through how this project can create jobs for local companies via the construction of the panels and can help tell the story of the communities who rely heavily on public transportation. Jenie has thoroughly thought through the maintenance of this piece

and has carefully chosen materials that will keep its colors vibrant and protect it from vandalism. I also appreciate the way Jenie has thought through the construction and painting of the mural portion of the project. Individuals who wish to assist with the creation process can assist by painting simple swathes of color instead of intricate, complicated patterns. Lastly, I am so impressed with how Jenie is honoring the stories that were collected. Not only are these stories depicted in the panels, but the artist plans to also share these stories in a companion zine. I love how Jenie has centered community, collectivism, and care in this project.

Ideal concept and remarkable community engagement and connection with this proposal. This proposal is the most original, thoughtful and meaningful one - this project includes community members throughout the stages and we see reflections of ourselves, our seasons, and our experiences in the final work.

The most community focused of all the projects and the best use of the space. Engaging for those traveling by foot or by car.

Jenie Gao's proposal hits a number of right notes: it is deeply community-based and would be community-sourced, providing local young artists with a working opportunity in the arts as well as sourcing materials locally. It frames those who use the bus as its starting point and centers the riders' perspective. The continuous nature of the artwork on the panels provides distinct themes based on natural elements in the four seasons while still being "read" as a coherent whole. It can be taken in by those seeing it in motion, either on a bus or other vehicle, as well as those walking past on foot. It is site-specific and is mindful of preserving and complementing the existing tree canopy. It even takes into account how the sections will be affected by leaf cover or its absence in winter. The materials used are minimal impact and generally environmentally friendly. Jenie Gao's proposal represents the direction we should be heading on a number of fronts, and I am happy to support this proposal for the Madison Metro public art project.

Aesthetically, for the fast paced lives we live in Madison, this is the best design. its vigorous curves and patterns are very satisfying, even at a distance. They will stand the test of time, which is very important. Jenie Gao has presented an admirable plan both of the design itself, and of its labor and materials, incorporating creative considerations that truly fit the site and also financial considerations.

This proposal makes the biggest visual impact to the site and connects to the lived experiences of people in Madison. Aesthetically it is also the best proposal; I really appreciate how the art seems to flow and move but also causes one to pause at the images of people. This proposal is by far the best option!

I support this project.

Jenie's proposal is phenomenal. Her plan of work is by far the most community-focused, most beautifully and thoughtfully designed, and most visually striking of these proposals, and an obvious choice for the Metro Public Art project. Jenie's commitment to representing the experiences of bus drivers and riders through her art alongside her proven record in public art installations in the Bayview Community, Trinity Church, and other local murals and public works make her by far the most qualified and appropriate selection for this installation. Jenie's proposal and body of work represents the values we want to grow in this city—uplifting and highlighting experiences of BIPOC community members, integrating environmental themes and natural history of the area by incorporating other migratory

species in the design, and keeping the city investment in local labor, local materials, and local education. As a resident of the Tenney Lapham neighborhood and a seasonal bus commuter, I could not be more thrilled to see this proposal come to life.

"I appreciated Jenie's design the most out of all the applicant's. Out of all the artists, Jenie was the only one to make an effort to talk directly to people who actually utilize the Madison bus. As someone who had been dependent on public transportation for a decade, I related to the majority of the comments, especially the positive alone time it gives you as well as the frustrations of having to plan an entire day around the bus schedule when trying to do errands. I was surprised to see that none of the other artists thought about talking directly to those who wait outside for the bus in regards to what they'd like to see on the wall.

In my opinion, Jenie had the strongest, most unified vision for the wall in question. It is a design that can be read well from far away and up close. Those who are driving by will also be able to enjoy the mural. I don't think this is as possible for the other examples who decided to go for a more "gallery view" type of layout. While I did think it was cool to see an example of a sculpture work, I think it's poor taste to make a bus shelter for a mini bus when there's plenty of other bus stops that could use actual shelter for its riders.

Jenie also took the time to represent Madison in a multitude of ways, including personified and natural representation. I found some of the other representations of Madison in the other proposals to be either whitewashed or to heavily focused on businesses that are located very near to the project site. As someone who lives in Madison and goes by this location often, I would prefer to see an innovative design that feels both exciting and timeless. To me, this is found in Jenie's design. Jenie not only considered the Madison residents she would be representing, but also honored the area of the site by including the natural folia around the site so that nothing would have to be cut down during install. I did not see this kind of thinking from the other applicants.

I think Jenie best represented the city of Madison in her proposal and I think her design would be a great fit for the neighborhood. I hope to see this project come to life soon!"

Beyond a beautiful proposal that integrates the existing landscape, Jenie is so thoughtful about the community she serves. She gives voice to groups that are often marginalized and works to make sure that art is something accessible to all.

I am absolutely blown away by the beauty and multi-level intentionality of Jenie Gao's proposal! The way that she has centered the voices of riders in our community is the core of my support for her proposal, but I appreciate the way she has preserved trees, incorporated native species and local non-reflective materials into the design, collaborated with Operation Fresh Start for construction plans, and included the community at large in the painting of the simpler elements of the mural. She has planned sustainably for drainage and upkeep, and the bold scale of the design is the only one that can be truly appreciated by transit riders down East Wash as well as folks walking closer to the building. Jenie's proposal is THE RIGHT ONE FOR THIS SPACE!!!! PLEASE, let us support her amazing vision which showcases the vibrant City and community we have right now.

I really think this is the most thoroughly researched proposal that starts from a relatable point of departure and expands into a cohesive approach that appropriately addresses scale, community,

imagination, and possibility. I think Madison residents will see themselves in this work in a manner that upholds the best of public art—reinforcing the notion of community as belonging to all.