

## Heiser-Ertel, Lauren

---

**Subject:** FW: Block 115 (East End, Essen Haus properties) - First Settlement neighbor comments  
**Attachments:** Block 115 East End Comments FSN.May062019.docx

**From:** Juli Wagner <[REDACTED]>

**Sent:** Monday, May 06, 2019 4:11 PM

**To:** Bailey, Heather <[HBailey@cityofmadison.com](mailto:HBailey@cityofmadison.com)>

**Subject:** Block 115 (East End, Essen Haus properties) - First Settlement neighbor comments

Hi Heather,

I'm with the First Settlement neighbor group. I wanted to submit the electronic copy of our comments for the East End project up for LC presentation this evening.

I believe other neighbors will be bring some hard copies as well.

Regards,

Juli Wagner  
Germania Condo owner  
First Settlement District

**FIRST SETTLEMENT HISTORIC DISTRICT**  
**First Settlement Neighbor Comments**

Constituents representing the First Settlement Neighbors submit the following comments concerning the McGrath proposal with respect to our local historic district.

NOTE: the May 6 Planning Division Staff Report is appended here for reference.

**Designation of the First Settlement Historic District (FSLHD):**

The FSLHD was designated in 2002 to preserve the array of modest frame and brick structures built by the industrious German, Irish, and Norwegian immigrants that lived and worked in our neighborhood going back to Madison's earliest days. Our LHD exemplifies the mix of working-class homes in close proximity to places of commerce and industry where many of these residents worked as clerks and merchants, as trades-people, and for the railroads.

Comments below are divided into three areas with supporting details.

**(1) Properties Proposed for 2019/20 Infill Development in the First Settlement Local Historic District (FSLHD):**

**Parking lot** at 134 S. Blair St., and **driving aisle** comprised of 140 and part of 148 S. Blair St.

**Land Divisions and Combinations 41.18 (4)**

The proposal combines lots within the First Settlement LHD to create a combined lot within the district that is ~42,000 square feet. This lot size is more than 10 times the ~3500 sq. ft average lot size of the adjacent lots (5,800sf; 1,930sf; 1,930sf; 1,715sf) on E. Wilson St. It is inconsistent with the general lot size pattern of the historic district whose lots tend to be only several thousand square feet in size.

This proposed lot is also approximately three (3) times the size of the large modern lots including the adjacent Germania Townhome Condominiums (~16,300 sq-ft), the nearby 115 S. Franklin Condominiums (~13,070 sq-ft), and the Settlement Place Apartments (~13,100 sq-ft). Note this comparison doesn't include the additional 11,000 sq. ft from the four (4) lots on E. Wilson St. that are also a part of this project.

*Land division* would be more appropriate for achieving consistency with the general lot size pattern of the historic district.

**New Principle Structure Standards 41.26(4)(a) Structure Height, Scale, Proportion and Rhythm**

Achieving compatibility with these criteria seems to be a significant challenge for the proposal.

**FIRST SETTLEMENT HISTORIC DISTRICT**  
**First Settlement Neighbor Comments**

The proposed structure will be much larger than any building within the FS LHD. It remains to be seen if the facade design with variations in materials, heights, step backs, window patterns, etc. might help achieve compatibility.

✓ **Details**

Height: This proposal has a maximum height of 6 stories when counting both the grade-level and upper-level parking. These parking stories are behind a single commercial story along S. Blair St. and E. Wilson St. The site is surrounded by pre-1930 commercial buildings E. Wilson St. and S. Blair St. that are 2 - 3 stories. The Cardinal Hotel is the only pre-1930 building similar in height at 5 stories.

Scale and Proportion: The current renderings do not appear in scale or proportion with the adjacent structures. The bulk of the proposed structure appears much greater. Extending the view to include the modern MG&E offices and the Cardinal Hotel lessens the sense of imbalance, but the design should also ensure that the block faces feel in scale and proportion to their adjacent structures.

Rhythm of masses and spaces of structures: The proposed structure doesn't correspond to rhythm of the structures within two hundred (200) feet. However, one could imagine a design that gives the illusion of multiple adjacent structures in a pattern of a fully developed historical commercial block face.

**New Principle Structure Standards 41.26(4)(b) - (f)**

The proposal currently doesn't provide information about the siding materials, the facade design, or the windows and doors. These elements are essential for determining the visual compatibility the new structure with its historic setting and context. It is important that any new structure is integrated into its location and not superimposed onto it. Thus, careful attention should be paid by the architects to the pre-1930 structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property as they develop their design.

**(2) Properties Proposed for Redevelopment in the East Wilson St. National Register Historic District:**

**Come Back In** at 506 E. Wilson St., **Essen Haus** at 510 - 518 E. Wilson St.

**506 E. Wilson St.**

The restoration of this contributing building is seen as a significant positive. We understand that this will be done as part of this project but on a separate track for approval and permitting, but

**FIRST SETTLEMENT HISTORIC DISTRICT  
First Settlement Neighbor Comments**

we expect this process will be completed concurrently with the proposed construction.

**510, 514, 516(?) E. Wilson St.**

The demolition of these buildings should make historical building materials available to be salvaged.

**518 E. Wilson St.**

The demolition of this contributing building raises concerns. Preserving its facade and integrating it into the project would be a significant positive.

**Hotel Ruby Marie**

The challenge here is for the new construction to achieve visual compatibility with this building that is in the Third Lake Ridge LHD (as well as the buildings across S Blair that are also in the TLR LHD). However, there is an expectation of higher density near this corner.

**(3) Four Homes on Blair St.**

110, 114, 118 and 120 S. Blair St.

Withdrawing these homes from the proposed demolition is seen as a significant positive. However, they are included in the land purchase and the developer's plan for them is unspecified, which raises concerns and prompts asking what the intention is for the homes.

Adding their restoration to this project would be seen as a significant positive. We would understand if such work would be on separate track for approval and permitting, like 506 E. Wilson St., but that process should be done concurrently with the proposed project.

**Submitted by:**

**Representatives of First Settlement Neighbors May 6, 2019**

**FIRST SETTLEMENT HISTORIC DISTRICT  
First Settlement Neighbor Comments**

**PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT - May 6, 2019**

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

**Project Name & Address: 134-140 S Blair & 506-518 E Wilson St – Mixed Use Development in the First Settlement Hist. Dist.**

**Application Type(s): Informational Presentation**

**Background**

McGrath Property Group is submitting a conceptual proposal to redevelop several properties for a mixed-use development. Some of the properties are located within the First Settlement Historic District and others are located within the East Wilson National Register Historic District. The two parcels in the First Settlement Historic District (134 & 140 S Blair) currently function with one serving as a drive aisle (the smaller) and the other as a large surface parking lot. The four properties in the East Wilson NR District (510-518 E Wilson) contain commercial buildings, one of which is contributing to the NR district.

The project the developer is presenting would create a single building that spans all of the parcels, with underground parking to serve multiple tenant and residential spaces. As currently proposed, this project would require a Certified Survey Map to combine the parcels. As two of those parcels are located within a local historic district, that process would require a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Landmarks Commission.

For the portion of the building located within the First Settlement Historic District, it will require a Certificate of Appropriateness per the standards for new construction in the district. For the portion of the building located outside of the local district, but within the National Register district, the Landmarks Commission is able to provide comments for consideration by the Urban Design Commission and the Plan Commission. The demolition of the buildings along E Wilson are also an opportunity for the Landmarks Commission to provide comments to the Plan Commission.

This informational presentation allows the Landmarks Commission to provide their feedback on how the proposed development could align with the applicable standards that the commission will use to review the project. Below are those standards:

**41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.**

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

**Land Divisions and Combinations.**

The commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for land divisions, combinations, and subdivision plats of landmark sites and properties in historic districts, unless it finds that the proposed lot sizes adversely impact the historic character or significance of a landmark, are incompatible with adjacent lot sizes, or fail to maintain the general lot size pattern of the historic district.

**FIRST SETTLEMENT HISTORIC DISTRICT**  
**First Settlement Neighbor Comments**

**41.26 FIRST SETTLEMENT HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

**Standards for the Review of New Principal Structures:**

**(a) Structure Height, Scale, Proportion and Rhythm.**

New principal structures shall be similar in height to the structures directly adjacent to each side. If the structures directly adjacent to each side are different in height, the new structure shall be of a height compatible with the structures within two hundred (200) feet of the proposed structure.

New principal structures shall be compatible with the scale, proportion, and rhythm of masses and spaces of structures within two hundred (200) feet of the proposed structure.

**(b) Siding Materials.** Narrow gauge clapboards made of wood, composite wood material, or concrete, and/or brick and stone may be permitted. Stucco and split-faced concrete block may be permitted only as trim, rather than the primary siding material. Stucco panels and pebble dash are prohibited. If the first two floors of a proposed structure are masonry, the Landmarks Commission may permit the use of artificial siding (i.e. vinyl or aluminum) on the upper floor or floors. In such circumstances, the artificial siding must conform to the following requirements:

1. The material shall be of the highest grade offered by the manufacturer.
2. The material shall have a minimum gauge of .042.
3. The color and sheen of the siding shall be consistent with those used in the era

in which adjacent structures were constructed.

4. The siding shall not have a false wood grain.
5. The width of each apparent clapboard shall not exceed four (4) inches.
6. The use of visible j-channel trim and other prefabricated elements that differ in appearance from those used on historic structures in the neighborhood is prohibited.

**(c) Roof Materials.**

Roofing materials shall be asphalt shingles; fiberglass or other composition shingles similar in appearance to multi-layered architectural shingles or 3- in-1 tab; or Dutch lap, French method or interlock shingles. Sawn wood shingles may also be approved. Thick wood shakes are prohibited. Vents shall be located as inconspicuously as possible and shall be similar in color to the color of the roof. Rolled roofing, tar-and-gravel, rubberized membranes and other similar roofing materials are prohibited except that such materials may be used on flat or slightly sloped roofs that are not visible from the ground.

**(d) Roof Shape.** If a principal structure does not have a flat roof, the pitch of the new roof shall be no less than 4-in-12.

**(e) Façade Design.** Street facades shall be modulated with setbacks incorporated into the design at the first floor level. The entrance shall either be inset or projecting from the plane of the main facade. Porches on main entrances are encouraged. Street facades shall reflect the rhythm and directional expression of pre-1930 structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property.

**FIRST SETTLEMENT HISTORIC DISTRICT**  
**First Settlement Neighbor Comments**

**(f) Windows and Doors.** The proportion of width to height of doors and windows and the proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the front and side facade designs shall be similar to pre-1930 structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property. Windows trimmed with bead molds similar in design to other pre-1930 window trim in the district and windows and doors shall be inset at least one (1) inch from the exterior trim. The main entrance to the structure shall be on the front facade. Garage doors shall be located on the side or rear facades whenever feasible. If it is not feasible to locate the garage door on the sides or rear facades, one-car garage doors will be permitted on the front facade.