

## AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	<b>PRESENTED:</b> April 19, 2006
TITLE: 1135 Erin Street – PUD(GDP-SIP) for 40- Unit Cohousing Project. 13 <sup>th</sup> Ald. Dist. (03106)	<b>REFERRED:</b> <b>REREFERRED:</b> <b>REPORTED BACK:</b>
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	<b>ADOPTED:</b> <span style="float: right;"><b>POF:</b></span>
DATED: April 19, 2006	<b>ID NUMBER:</b>

---

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Ald. Noel Radomski, Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Lisa Geer, Robert March, Michael Barrett, Bruce Woods and Cathleen Feland.

### **SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of April 19, 2006, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) for 40-unit cohousing project located at 1135 Erin Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Roger Smith, Beth Ann Workmaster, Leslie Fields, Erica Lewis, Judith Strasser, Susan M. Pope and Lenny Kanter. The plans as presented featured the following:

- A breakdown of existing residential units to be maintained and preserved as part of the project, as well as the proposed development of two multi-unit residential facilities, the Orchard House and Erin House featuring 16 and 14-units respectively, in addition to development of a 2-unit building on the site by Habitat for Humanity. Existing houses on the site to be maintained as part of the Arboretum cohousing project consist of 6-units, as well as an existing 3-unit building.
- A detailed review of the perspective renderings and elevational details for both the Orchard House and Erin House were provided, in addition to an overview of the shared open space amenities on the collective sites.
- The redevelopment of the collective sites also entails the relocation of five existing homes.
- In response to the Commission's previous comments on the project, an entry to lower level parking on the Orchard House residential structure has been reduced in width to diminish its prominence.

Following the presentation, the Commission expressed concerns on the following:

- Further consideration of the project requires the firming up of prairie and natural plant areas within the shared rear community open space area.
- Consider providing handicapped access from the street to the shared rear community open space area.
- Provide clarification on the community garden areas for residents.
- On the Erin Street building, pull balconies toward the street.
- On the Orchard House, not sure if flat roof element works. Consider moving living area toward the street with porch to the backside, as well as use of building materials to the street side façade.
- The design elements reference the character of the neighborhood appropriately.

**ACTION:**

On a motion by March, seconded by Woods, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (7-2) with Radomski and Host-Jablonski abstaining.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 7, 8, 8, 8, 8.5, 8.5, 9 and 9.5.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1135 Erin Street**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	8	8	8	8	-	9	9	8.5
	9	9	9	9	-	6	9	8
	9	8	7	-	-	8	10	9
	9	10	10	-	-	9	10	9.5
	9	7.5	9	9	10 (Yeah-none!)	9	10	8.5
	8	9	8	9	-	9	9	8
	7	7	6	-	-	6	8	7
	8	7	8	-	-	8	8	8

General Comments:

- This captures the spirit of Madison in design – Bravo! One detracting feature: Far in excess of parking compared to the rest of the neighborhood. This one aspect goes against the spirit of cohousing.
- Great start to a wonderful plan to revitalize the neighborhood.
- An inspired use of an interesting and difficult site.
- Extend south Orchard house to south to “rest” over garage. Flat roof is not integrated with overall design.
- Nice community project! Thoughtful well resolved design, improvement to neighborhood.
- See if it is feasible to create an accessible path off Orchard Street with no steps, outside of the buildings.