

AGENDA # 5.

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: September 21, 2005
TITLE: 202 North Charter Street – PUD(GDP-SIP), Apartment Building with Retail – 8 th Ald. Dist.	REFERRED:
	REREFERRED:
	REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED:
	POF:
DATED: September 21, 2005	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Todd Barnett, Robert March, Bruce Woods, Michael Barrett, Ald. Noel Radomski, Jack Williams and Lisa Geer.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of September 21, 2005, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) for an apartment building with first floor level retail. Appearing on behalf of the project was Michael Gordon, Bryce Armstrong, Craig Hungerford, Eric Lawson and Jill Buechner. The plans as presented provide for the development of a 6-story apartment building featuring first floor retail on the site as a replacement for a previously proposed 16-story building on the same site, which did not receive favorable consideration at the Plan Commission/Common Council level. The project as previously proposed provides for a lot to lot line development, including the addition of street trees in the right-of-way, in coordination with the Park Street trees division. The first floor provides for retail commercial space, a service area and bike parking. The base of the building is burnished block with upper floors featuring a hard coat stucco system interspersed with horizontal metal siding. Following the presentation of the plans, the Commission expressed concerns on the following:

- Increase indoor bike parking to a 1-stall per bedroom level.
- Disappointed with the lack of an outdoor gathering space and rooftop garden area. The project as proposed now is a significant down grade of amenities such as a green roof and bike parking. There is a need for more bike parking.

Fruhling noted to the Commission that the project, in staff's opinion as a downscaled, was not in conflict with neighborhood planning issues.

ACTION:

On a motion by March, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of the project. The motion passed on a vote of (7-0-1) with Wagner abstaining. The motion required for final approval the provision of more indoor bike parking and larger sized balconies along with rooftop amenities such as a garden, and open greenspace.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6, 6, 6, 7, 7 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 202 North Charter Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	6	6	6	-	7	7	6
	6	6	5	-	-	6	6	6
	6	6	-	-	-	-	6	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7
	-	5	5	5	-	6	7	7
	6	5	6	6	-	6	6	6
	6	8	8	-	-	7	9	8

General Comments:

- There is still no plan, and this is a significant downgrade from the original. Lack of green roof amenities is disappointing.
- Getting approval for trees in the terrace is landscape saver. Elimination of the roof garden and gathering space is disappointing.
- More bike parking needed. Rooftop would be nice. Preferred taller structure.
- Please look into pulling living room to northeast corner; reintroduce rooftop garden.
- Improve rooftop elements, increase bike stalls, and expand balconies.
- Like larger building better. Roof garden will be missed.