



Project Address: 1500 Rutledge Street
Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration in historic district
Legistar File ID # [31295](#)
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Summary

Applicant/Property Owner: Jim Murphy

Requested Action/Proposal Summary: The applicant requests that the Landmarks Commission grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior alteration to the residence located at 1500 Rutledge Street in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District. The request removes the existing rear screened porch and constructs a new screened porch

Applicable Regulations & Standards: Section 33.19 of the Madison General Ordinances (see below)

Review Required By: Landmarks Commission

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the Marquette Bungalows (local) Historic District and the Marquette Bungalows National Register Historic District.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

33.19(13)(d) Criteria for the Review of Additions, Exterior Alterations and Repairs. All additions, exterior alterations and repairs must be compatible with the historic character of the house and the Marquette Bungalows Historic District.

2. Roof Materials. Reroofing shall be done with asphalt shingles, fiberglass shingles or other rectangular composition shingle similar in appearance to 3-in-1 tab asphalt shingles. Sawn wood shingles may also be approved. Modern style shingles, such as thick wood shakes, dutch lap, french method and interlock shingles are incompatible with the historic character of the district and are prohibited. Vents shall be located as inconspicuously as possible and shall be similar in color to the color of the roof. Rolled roofing, tar and gravel and other similar roofing materials are prohibited except that such materials may be used on flat or slightly sloped roofs which are not visible from the ground.
7. Porches. Porches and stairway railings shall match the original railings in appearance wherever possible. Wrought iron railings with vertical balusters at least one-half inch in width, wood railings with vertical square balusters spaced no more than three (3) inches apart, and solid wall railings covered in siding to match the house will be approved. Other designs may be permitted if they blend with the character of the house and the district. Porches may be enclosed with windows or screens provided that new windows be casements or double-hung units similar in proportion to other windows on the house. Steps may be constructed of wood, concrete or brick. If wood is used, steps shall have risers and be enclosed on the sides by lattice or a wing wall. Rear yard decks shall have a railing as described above, shall have the underside screened by lattice or evergreen shrubs, and all parts of the deck, except the flooring and steps, shall be painted or opaque-stained in a color to blend with the colors on the house.

9. Additions and Other Alterations. New additions on the front of the house are prohibited. Additions on the sides or rear shall be permitted if they are compatible with the house in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Materials and architectural details used in additions and alterations shall duplicate in texture, appearance, and design, the materials and details used in the original construction of the house or of other houses in the district. The Landmarks Commission may approve an exception to this policy where the existing building materials and architectural details differ from the original. Additions and exterior alterations that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Additions or exterior alterations that destroy significant architectural features are prohibited. Side additions shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade.

Analysis and Conclusion

A brief discussion of the relevant sections of 33.19(13)(d) follows:

2. The proposed screened porch will have composition (3 in 1 asphalt tab) shingles to match the red color of the shingles used on the house.
7. The proposed screened porch will have a traditional top and bottom porch railing with spaced balusters that blend with the character of the house and the district.
9. The proposed screened porch is compatible with the house in architectural design, scale, and color. The proposed addition differs from the main house in proportion of solids to voids and widths to heights due to the function of the room which seems to meet the intent of the Ordinance. The proposed materials and architectural details used in the proposed screened porch duplicate in texture, appearance and design the materials of the main house and of other houses in the district. The proposed screened porch does not destroy significant architectural features.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior alteration (removal of existing screen porch and construction of a new screened porch) are met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions of approval:

1. The underside of the porch shall be screened by lattice or evergreen shrubs
2. All parts of the deck, except the flooring and steps, shall be painted or opaque-stained in a color to blend with the colors on the house.