

AGENDA # 2

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: October 17, 2007
TITLE: 8 Straubel Court – Public Project and Alteration to an Existing P.R.D. for a Handball Court. 17 th Ald. Dist. (06508)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: October 17, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Bonnie Cosgrove, Richard Slayton, Bruce Woods, Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, John Harrington and Jay Ferm.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 17, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of an alteration to an existing P.R.D. (Planned Residential Development) for a handball court located at 8 Straubel Court. Appearing on behalf of the project were Jim Glueck and Herb Paaren, representing Community Care. Prior to the presentation staff noted an excerpt from an earlier report relevant to the approval for an addition to the East Madison Community Center regarding the construction of a performance space and gym, in combination with the subject handball court currently under consideration. The approval of the overall project at the meeting of May 30, 2007 required that “the handball courts are to be moved 20-feet away from the addition, lowered to meet existing grade or grade established as anticipated with the future master plan for Truax Apartments and shall return for further consideration by the Urban Design Commission. Also explore opportunity for spectators to view down into handball courts.” Glueck then provided a review of the detailed plans relevant to the conditions established for the handball court, which was followed by comments by the Commissioners as follows:

- Project at great location and rotation of courts is good.
- Concern with landscaping surrounding diminishes visibility of the game, look at minimizing. As a substitute, look at treating with ivy lining on the outside of the concrete wall or cast the concrete wall in primary colors instead of providing landscaping and screening.
- Like the Wrigley Field look instead of casting in primary court colors, orientation and location good.
- The landscaping as proposed does not inspire much. Yew and other low-growing plantings will burn out due to northwest winds.
- Encourage doing something more interesting with structure, including additional landscaping murals and other alternatives.

Following the discussion, a motion by Barnett which failed to obtain a second, which recommended referral in order to deal with exposed faces on the exterior of the handball court structure; relevant to surface treatment options architecturally and landscape treatments at the base of the structure to come back for further consideration. The motion failed from lack of a second. Host-Jablonski noted that a more specific motion providing clear direction was necessary following the failed motion to refer, with P. Wagner agreeing.

ACTION:

On a motion by Slayton, seconded by Host-Jablonski, **FINAL APPROVAL** was granted of the details for the handball court, with the motion providing for the elimination of shrubs with the addition of three or more trees (river birch) off of the northeast corner of the handball court structure, along with the inclusion on the exterior two walls of either Euonymus vine, in combination with any Parthenocissus, Boston ivy or Virginia creeper for color and texture planted at no less than 10-feet on center. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (8-0).

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 5, 6, 6 and 6.5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 8 Straubel Court

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	7	-	5	-	-	-	-	5
	7	-	7	-	-	-	7	-
	7	-	5	-	-	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6.5
	6.5	6	5	-	-	-	-	6
	6	4	4	-	-	-	-	5
	7	-	3	-	-	-	-	5

General Comments:

- Revise landscaping per our comments.
- Landscaping, well kept, is important to soften this very large and otherwise stark structure. New alignment is a big improvement.
- The orientation is good. Vines, etc. will help soften this large structure.
- Develop concrete reveal pattern or cover with vines or more appropriate landscape skin.
- Handball court placement is nicely sited. Landscaping is not inspiring – make a stronger statement.