



Project Name/Address: 906-910 Williamson
Application Type: Demolition of existing building and new development in historic district
Legistar File ID # [37499](#)
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: July 16, 2015

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Randy Bruce
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificates of Appropriateness for demolition and new development in a historic district.

Previous Actions:

The demolition portion of the request was granted a Certificate of Appropriateness contingent on the approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the new development at the June 2, 2015 meeting. The Certificate of Appropriateness for the new development is before the Commission at this time.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located on Williamson Street in the Third Lake Ridge historic district

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

33.19(11)(f) Guideline Criteria for New Development in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Commercial Use.

1. Any new structures shall be evaluated according to both of the criteria listed in Sec. 33.01(11)(d); that is, compatibility of gross volume and height.
2. The rhythm of solids and voids in the street facade(s) of any new structure shall be compatible with the buildings within its visually related area.
3. The materials used in the street facade(s) of any new structure shall be compatible with those used in the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
4. The design of the roof of any new structure shall be compatible with those of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
5. The rhythm of building masses and spaces created by the construction of a new structure shall be compatible with the existing rhythm of masses and spaces for those sites within its visually related area.

33.19 (11)(d) Guideline Criteria for New Development in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Manufacturing Use.

1. The gross volume of any new structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
2. The height of any new structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.

Analysis and Conclusion

This request requires two Certificates of Appropriateness from the Landmarks Commission. The first Certificate of Appropriateness relates to the demolition of the existing building and was approved on July 2, 2015. The second relates to the construction of the new development. The Visually Related Area map is attached to this report.

A historic district is made up of historic resources that are not individually significant, but rely on each other to create a historic character and context. When individual historic resources are demolished, the integrity of the overall district is negatively impacted. Any proposed new development in a historic district must be sensitive to the historic character and context. Features of the proposed development should be compatible with the visually related area so that the historic character of the historic district is not negatively affected.

Three design options have been proposed for review. The previous staff reports evaluated the design of Option 1. Option 2 is a slightly modified version of Option 1. The analysis below relates to the design of Option 3.

New Construction

A discussion of the standards for new construction 33.19(11)(f) follows:

1. Any new structures shall be evaluated according to both of the criteria listed in Sec. 33.01(11)(d) which follow:
 1. The gross volume of the proposed development is mathematically larger than the gross volume of the majority of the other buildings in the visually related area; however, the massing of that volume has been visually reduced by changes in material and step backs which make the building's gross volume visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
 2. The actual height of the proposed development is taller than the actual height of the buildings in the immediate context and may be taller than the buildings in the visually related area; however, the building height varies related to the massing, step backs and material changes which makes the height visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
2. The rhythm of solids and voids in the Williamson Street facade of the new development is compatible with the buildings within its visually related area. The applicant provided revised designs that aligned the windows as previously requested.
3. The exterior materials of the proposed development will include cast stone base, brick, and vertical metal panels. The proposed street façade materials may be compatible with materials used in the buildings and environment within its visually related area. The applicant provided revised designs showing simplified materials as previously requested.
4. The flat roof shown in Option 3 is compatible with other buildings in the visually related area. The applicant provided revised designs showing the removal of the curved roof element as previously requested.
5. The rhythm of building masses and spaces created by the new development is generally compatible with the existing rhythm of masses and spaces for those sites within its visually related area. The majority of the buildings in the visually related area have a smaller scale and establish a pattern of "building-space-building-space" that a larger building does not allow.

Recommendation

Staff believes the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the new development are not met for Options 1 and 2; however, staff believes the standards for Option 3 may be met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission.